



Employment and Women's Studies: The Impact of Women's Studies Training on Women's Employment in Europe

Final Report
Gabriele Griffin

November 2003

Results from a research project (HPSE-CT2001-00082)
funded under Framework 5 of the European Union.

Contents

List of tables	5
List of project partners	7
Abstract	8
1. Executive summary	9
1.1 Introduction	9
1.2 Objective	9
1.3 Methodology	9
1.4 Conclusions	11
1.4.1 The institutionalization of Women's Studies	11
1.4.2 Employability of Women's Studies Graduates	11
1.4.3 Adaptability and entrepreneurship of Women's Studies Graduates	12
1.4.4. Women's Studies Graduates and Education- and Employment-related Migration	13
1.4.5 Equal Opportunities, Women's Studies Training, and Women's Employment	14
1.5 Policy implications	15
1.5.1 The institutionalization of Women's Studies	15
1.5.2 Employability of Women's Studies Graduates	17
1.5.3 Adaptability and entrepreneurship of Women's Studies Graduates	19
1.5.4. Women's Studies Graduates and Education- and Employment-related Migration	19
1.5.5 Equal opportunities, Women's Studies Training, and Women's Employment	19
2. Background and objectives of the project	22
2.1 Rationale	22
2.2 Objectives	22
3. Scientific description of the project results and methodology	23
3.1 Introduction	23
3.2 Method/ology	23
3.3 The Institutionalization of Women's Studies in Europe	26
3.3.1 Market-oriented versus non-market-oriented education	29
3.3.2 Accessing Women's Studies	30
3.3.3 Reasons for taking Women's Studies	32
3.4 Women's Studies Training and Employment I: Pre- and in-training expectations and experiences	33
3.4.1 Employer demands and student expectations	34
3.4.2 Transferable knowledge and skills acquisition in Women's Studies	35
3.4.3 Analysing women's employment histories	36
3.4.4 The employment histories of Women's Studies students <i>prior to</i>	37

their Women's Studies training	
3.4.5 Employment of Women's Studies students <i>during</i> their Women's Studies training	38
3.4.6 Postgraduates as employees	39
3.4.7 In –course work placements	39
3.4.8 Educational attainment and labour market participation	41
3.4.9 Cross-generational differences in employment between Women's Studies students and their parents	42
3.5 Women's Studies Training and Employment II: Post-training expectations and experiences	43
3.5.1 Impact of Women's Studies training on type of employment sought	43
3.5.2 Looking for work	44
3.5.3 Rejecting the male career model	45
3.5.4 Women's Studies students' discourses on finding employment	46
3.5.5 Professionalism	46
3.5.5.1 The pervasive importance of gender expertise	47
3.5.5.2 Professionalisation	48
3.5.5.3 Academe/feminist research	48
3.5.5.4 Equal opportunities	49
3.5.5.5 Working in women's NGOs	50
3.5.5.6 Professionalisation as upward employment mobility	51
3.5.6 First destinations: professional employment	52
3.6 The Impact of Women's Studies training on how work is carried out	56
3.6.1 Standing up for oneself or others when discriminated against	57
3.6.2 Refusing to put up with sexism at work	57
3.6.3 Feeling more confident in making applications for promotion or other jobs	58
3.6.4 Carrying out one's work in a non-sexist manner	58
3.6.5 Becoming more tolerant towards diversity	58
3.6.6 Introducing gender issues at work	59
3.6.7 Offering greater support to female colleagues	59
3.6.8 Women as change agents in the work place	60
3.6.9 Women's Studies training and social change	60
3.7 Women's Studies, equal opportunities and women's employment	62
3.7.1 Processes of institutionalisation of equal opportunities	62
3.7.2 Gender expertise requirements in equal opportunities employment	63
3.7.3 Effectiveness of equal opportunities legislation	64
3.7.4 The impact of Women's Studies training on equal opportunities understanding	65
3.8 Women's Studies, women's educational migration and employment	66
3.8.1 Educational Mobility of Women's Studies students in nine European countries	67
3.8.2 'Receiving' and 'Sending': divisions by country	67

3.8.3 Educational mobility and languages	70
3.8.4 Outward vs inward educational mobility	70
3.8.5 Gender equality in student mobility	72
3.8.6 Courses and Credits	73
3.8.6.1 Choice of courses	73
3.8.6.2 Credits	74
3.8.7 Educational migration and funding sources	75
3.8.8 Reasons for studying abroad	76
3.8.9 Reasons for not studying abroad	77
3.8.10 The experience if studying abroad	79
3.8.11 The impact of studying abroad on educational migrants	80
3.8.12 Working abroad	82
4. Conclusions and recommendations for policy and further research	84
4.1 Introduction	84
4.2 The institutionalization of Women's Studies	85
4.2.1 Conclusions	85
4.2.2 Policy implications	85
4.2.3 Further research suggestions	86
4.3 Employability of Women's Studies graduates	87
4.3.1 Conclusions	87
4.3.2 Policy implications	88
4.3.3 Further research suggestions	90
4.4 Adaptability and entrepreneurship of Women's Studies graduates	90
4.4.1 Conclusions	90
4.4.2 Policy implications	91
4.4.3 Further research suggestions	92
4.5 Equal opportunities and Women's Studies training	92
4.5.1 Conclusions	92
4.5.2 Policy implications	93
4.5.3 Further research suggestions	95
4.6 Women's Studies graduates and education- and employment-related migration	95
4.6.1 Conclusions	95
4.6.2 Policy implications	97
4.6.3 Further research suggestions	97
5. Dissemination and exploitation of results	98
5.1 Dissemination strategy adopted during the lifetime of the project	98
5.2 Follow-up of results foreseen by each partner after the completion of the project	98
6. Acknowledgements and references	100
6.1 Acknowledgements	100
6.2 References	102
7. Annexes	106
7.1 Publications	106
7.2 Conference presentations	107
7.3 Other forms of output	109
7.4 Table of agreed deliverables	110

List of tables

Table 1. Percentage of questionnaire respondents undertaking particular kinds of Women's Studies training

Table 2. Factors impacting on the institutionalisation of Women's Studies

Table 3. Degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies in the EWSI-partner countries in Europe

Table 4. Source of information about Women's Studies according to questionnaire respondents in percentages

Table 5. Male and female employment rates (25 to 59 years), by education, 2000

Table 6. Factors influencing the choice of Women's Studies in percentages

Table 7. Percentage of questionnaire respondents seeking to gain a qualification or improve job opportunities through undertaking Women's Studies training

Table 8. Percentage of reported expected and actual impact of Women's Studies training on women's employment by questionnaire respondents

Table 9. Percentage of respondents reporting growth in *critical thinking*, *gender awareness*, and *self-confidence* following their Women's Studies course

Table 10. Percentage of questionnaire respondents in employment prior to undertaking Women's Studies training

Table 11. Average age of questionnaire respondents in 2002

Table 12. Percentage of questionnaire respondents who were current Women's Studies students in paid employment during their studies (figures for 2002).

Table 13. Percentage of questionnaire respondents required to undertake work placements during their Women's Studies training

Table 14. Male and female education levels, 2002

Table 15. Past Women's Studies students' employment performance relative to their parents

Table 16. Percentage of respondents reporting impact of Women's Studies training on type of employment sought

Table 17. Past Women's Studies students' responses to how soon they looked for a job after completion of their training

Table 18. Project researchers' education and employment, 2003

- Table 19. First employment after Women's Studies training (secondary analysis).
- Table 20. Women's Studies students' activities other than employment following their training
- Table 21. Percentage of respondents reporting impact of Women's Studies training on how they carry out their work
- Table 22. Reported experience of transformation of female friendship networks through Women's Studies training in percentages
- Table 23. Degree of institutionalisation of equal opportunities in nine European countries
- Table 24. Reported impact of Women's Studies training on equal opportunities understanding/involvement (in percentages)
- Table 25. Proportion of questionnaire respondents who studied abroad
- Table 26. Patterns of educational migration of Women's Studies students
- Table 27. General student mobility through the ERASMUS program in Europe
- Table 28. Outgoing ERASMUS students by gender
- Table 29. Foreign enrolment by gender
- Table 30. Type of course taken abroad
- Table 31. Women's Studies' students' funding sources for educational mobility in percentages
- Table 32. Reasons for studying abroad

FINAL REPORT (24 MONTHS)¹
RESTRICTED

Contract no: HPSE-CT2001-00082

Project no: SERD-2000-00048

Title: *Employment and Women's Studies: The Impact of Women's Studies Training on Women's Employment in Europe*

Project coordinator and Partner 1: Professor Gabriele Griffin, University of Hull, Gender Studies, Cottingham Road, Hull, HU6 7RX. UK; Telephone: 0044 1482 466146; Fax: 0044 1482 466106 ; Email: G.Griffin@hull.ac.uk

Project Administrator: Fiona Mansfield, University of Hull, Gender Studies, Cottingham Road, Hull, HU6 7RX. UK; Telephone: 0044 1482 465996; Fax: 0044 1482 466106; Email: F.S.Mansfield@hull.ac.uk

Partner 2: Professor Jalna Hanmer, University of Sunderland, School of Humanities and Social Sciences, Priestman Building, Green Terrace, Sunderland, SR1 3PZ, UK; Telephone: 0044 191 515 3698; Fax 0044 191 515 2229; Email: Jh@jhanmer.fsnet.co.uk; Email: jalna.hanmer@sunderland.ac.uk

Partner 3: Professor Harriet Silius, Abo Akademi Univeristy, Institute of Women's Studies, FIN-20500 Abo, Finland; Telephone: + 358 2 215 4328; Fax + 358 2 215 4668; Email: Harriet.Silius@abo.fi

Partner 4: Professor Rosi Braidotti, Utrecht University, Netherlands Research School of Women's Studies, Trans 10, 3512 JKUTRECHT, The Netherlands. Telephone: + 31 30 2536001 (secretary); Telephone + 31 30 2536507 (direct) Fax: + 3130 253 6134 ; Email: Rosi.braidotti@let.uu.nl

Dr Berteke Waaldijk, University of Utrecht, Instituut voor Media en Representatie, Kromme Nieuwegracht 29, NL – 3512 HD Utrecht, Netherlands. Telephone: + 3130 2536151 (office); Fax: + 3130 2536167; Email: berteke.waaldijk@let.uu.nl

Partner 5: Professor Donatella Barazzetti, Interdepartmental Centre of Women's Studies, "Milly Villy", Department of Sociology and Political Science, University of Calabria 87036, Arcavacata di Rende (CS), Italy. Telephone: + 39 984 492573; Fax: + 39 984 492598; Email: barazzetti@unical.it

Partner 6: Professor Carmen Leccardi, University of Milan-Bicocca, Dept of Sociology and Social Research, Via Bicocca Degu Arcimboldi, 8, 20126 Milano, Italy. Telephone: + 39 02 64487537; Fax: + 39 02 64487561; Email: Carmen.leccardi@unimib.it

Partner 7: Dr Nicky Le Feuvre, University of Toulouse- Le Mirail, Maison de la Recherche, 5 allée Antonio Machado, F-31058 Toulouse Cedex 1, France. Telephone: + 33 0561 504394; Fax: + 33 0561 503708 ; Email: lefeuvre@univ-tlse2.fr

Partner 8: Dr Eva D Bahovec, University of Ljubljana, Department of Philosophy, Faculty of Arts, Askreva 2, 1000 Ljubljana, Slovenia. Telephone: + 386 61 14215190; Email: Eva.Bahovec@guest.arnes.si.

Partner 9: Dr Andrea Peto, ELTE Institute of Sociology Ethnic and Minority Studies, 1117 Budapest Pazmany Peter setany 1/1 email: petoand@hotmail.com; petoand@axelero.hu

Partner 10: Professor Ute Gerhard, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University of Frankfurt, Cornelia Goethe Centre for Women's Studies, Robert-Mayer Str.5, Fach 107, 60054, Frankfurt, Germany Email: Gerhard@soz.uni-frankfurt.de.

Partner 11: Dr Isabel Carrera Suarez, University of Oviedo, Departamento de Filologia, Anglogermanica y Francesa, Campus de Humanidades, 33071 Oviedo, Spain. Telephone/fax: + 34 985 104545; Email: icarrera@correo.uniovi.es

Reference period: from 1 October 2001 to 30 September 2003

Starting date: 1 October 2001 **Duration:** 24 months **Date of issue of this report:** 1 November 2003

Project financed within the Key Action Improving the Socio-economic Knowledge Base

¹ I would like to acknowledge the hospitality and support of Monash University, Melbourne, Australia, and specifically of Dr Maryanne Dever, Director of the Centre for Women's Studies and Gender Research at Monash University, who offered me a Distinguished Visiting Scholarship during July and August 2003 to enable me to work on this report.

Abstract

The Amsterdam Treaty (1997) identified a gap in the employment rates between women and men in Europe, resulting in the greater economic and social exclusion of women. This project on 'Women's Employment, Equal Opportunities and Women's Studies in Europe' (acronym: EWSI; website www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi) addresses the issue of women's employment by focussing on a particular group of women, those with Women's Studies training in Finland, France, Germany, Hungary, Italy, Slovenia, Spain, the Netherlands, and the UK. Conducted between October 2001 and October 2003, and funded by DGXII (Research) of the European Commission as part of Framework 5, this is the first cross-European project producing systematic comparative research into the issue of what happens to women with Women's Studies training in the employment market.

The project found that Women's Studies as a discipline is not fully established in any European country, that most women take it as a module within a traditional discipline and come across Women's Studies by chance once they are at university. Those who take Women's Studies are more likely than students from other arts and humanities disciplines to want to remain in education. The latter is a key factor in determining labour market participation. The EU should therefore use the Bologna process to ensure that Women's Studies as a discipline is fully established in all European countries.

Women with Women's Studies training acquire skills and knowledges such as gender expertise, critical thinking, self-confidence, tolerance towards diversity, and the ability to argue effectively that are useful in a large range of occupations. Women's Studies graduates enter a wide variety of occupations and do so to a significant extent at professional level. They tend to outperform their mothers, entering both a wider range of occupations than their mothers and at higher (professional/managerial) levels. Such students report that the greatest impact of their Women's Studies training is on how they conduct themselves at work. This typically includes standing up for oneself and others when discriminated against; refusing to put up with sexism at work; feeling more confident in making applications for promotion and changes in jobs; carrying out one's work in a self-consciously non-sexist manner; becoming more tolerant towards diversity; introducing gender issues into their workplace; and being more supportive of female colleagues. Such students thus function as change agents in the workplace. More research is needed to understand precisely how they operate in the workplace.

Educational migration benefits Women's Studies students personally and professionally. Language deficits, insufficient finance, and family commitments act as a barrier to educational mobility, as do problems with having courses taken abroad recognized in the home university. The EU needs to promote the consistent applications of ECTS more effectively, and to encourage more women students to participate in educational mobility programs.

Women's Studies postgraduates want to work, and indeed often do work, in three areas: feminist research/academe; women's NGOs, equal opportunities. Equal opportunities, however, remain largely ineffective as a measure to combat gender discrimination, and gender expertise tends not to be required as part of an equal opportunities officer's job profile. Both the EU and national governments need to do more to introduce effective sanctions for non-compliance with equal opportunities legislation, and gender expertise should be part of the job description of equal opportunities personnel. Women's Studies might also disseminate equal opportunities knowledge more widely.

1. Executive summary

1.1 Introduction

The Amsterdam Treaty (1997) identified a gap in the employment rates between women and men in Europe, resulting in the greater economic and social exclusion of women. This project on 'Women's Employment, Equal Opportunities and Women's Studies in Europe' (EWSI; website www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi) addresses the issue of women's employment by focussing on a particular group of women, those with Women's Studies training. Conducted between October 2001 and October 2003, and funded by DGXII (Research) of the European Commission as part of Framework 5, this is the first cross-European project producing systematic comparative research into the issue of what happens to women with Women's Studies training in the employment market.

1.2 Objective

The fundamental **objective** of this project was to find out how Women's Studies training affects women's opportunities and interventions in the labour market. The fundamental **research question** of this project was: how does Women's Studies training affect women's opportunities and interventions in the labour market? In pursuing this question the project's **three** working **hypotheses** were that

- the degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies training is significantly related the impact of the training on women's achievements in the labour market;
- the degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies training in individual countries is related to the equal opportunities policies in that country;
- both the degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies training and the presence/implementation of equal opportunities policies impact on women's professionalisation.

These hypotheses were supported by both the analyses of both the primary and the secondary data produced and utilized during the research process.

1.3 Methodology

This report is based on empirical research carried out in nine European countries² during 2002. It combined non-random quantitative data elicited through questionnaires from an average of 50 past and 50 current Women's Studies students in each participating country³ with qualitative data derived from 30 semi-structured

² These are Finland, Germany, Hungary, Italy, France, Spain, Slovenia, the Netherlands and the UK.

³ The actual numbers of questionnaire respondents per country were as given in the following table:

interviews (20 past and 10 current Women’s Studies students per participating country). The latter were carried out in order to establish the meanings of some of the answers provided in the questionnaires, and to lend depth to the data gleaned from the questionnaires. The project’s findings are thus based on over 900 questionnaire returns and 270 interviews. The questionnaire data were non-random, partly because universities in most European countries do not keep exit data about their students – apparently for data protection reasons – and partly because most students access Women’s Studies as modules within traditional disciplines, especially at undergraduate level, which renders these students invisible within the system.

The research process thus highlighted the following data collection-related issues:

- Students enrolled in modular degrees or taking modules that are located in traditional disciplines but are interdisciplinary or might be said to reference another discipline are invisible in university tracking systems. In other words, it is difficult to track a student taking a Women’s Studies module that is located in a traditional discipline. This meant that we had to produce non-random data through techniques such as snow-balling etc.
- The UK apart, universities in Europe do not keep exit data of their students thus making it difficult to track their transition from training to employment via the discipline they trained in. This also contributed to the production of non-random data in our questionnaire.
- Employment categories as conventionally used (eg EUROSTAT, OECD) are based on male employment trajectories and both insufficiently gender sensitive and not at all culturally sensitive. This makes the appropriate description of women’s employment very difficult.
- Cultural sensitivities regarding questions on topics such as salary, sexual identity, ethnic origin impact on respondents who may not answer such questions.

The research process of the project was divided into four phases: the country-specific collection of background data on ‘Women’s Employment, Women’s Studies and Equal Opportunities 1945-2001’; the conduct of the empirical quantitative and qualitative research which generated country reports on both sets of data; comparative analyses of these data sets according to pre-specified dimensions which resulted in eight comparative reports; the production of the final report on the basis of the work carried out in the first three phases.⁴

Table A: Actual number of questionnaire respondents by partner country.

	Past students	Present students
Finland	N = 56	N = 35
France	N = 51	N = 71
Germany	N = 56	N = 69
Hungary	N = 51	N = 50
Italy	N = 50	N = 50
Netherlands	N = 80	N = 51
Slovenia	N = 50	N = 50
Spain	N = 43	N = 83
UK	N = 104	N = 83

⁴ All the reports mentioned here were published on the project website (www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi). The background data reports were also published in book form and can be ordered (while stocks last) free of charge by emailing g.griffin@hull.ac.uk.

The rest of this executive summary is divided into ‘Conclusions’ and ‘Policy recommendations’, each grouped under the following five headings:

- The institutionalization of Women’s Studies
- The employability of Women’s Studies graduates
- The adaptability and entrepreneurship of Women’s Studies graduates
- Women’s Studies graduates and education- and employment-related migration
- Equal opportunities, Women’s Studies training, and women’s employment

1.4 Conclusions

1.4.1 The institutionalization of Women’s Studies

1.4.1.1. Women’s Studies as a discipline is vital to changing the ‘durable dispositions’ (Bourdieu 1998) which govern gender roles in contemporary Europe and which serve to curtail women’s ability to participate to the full in the employment market. However, the institutionalization of Women’s Studies is unevenly developed across the European countries and its full institutionalization should be promoted through the Bologna process and by ministries of education in the EC member countries.

1.4.1.2 At present Women’s Studies as a discipline is predominantly taught in higher education, as part of traditional disciplines at undergraduate level, and also as a discipline in its own right at postgraduate level. To maximize its potential impact it is important that all European countries are encouraged to establish Women’s Studies as an autonomous discipline at undergraduate as well as at postgraduate level.

1.4.1.3 Women’s Studies as a discipline lacks recognition and visibility in many European countries including Hungary, Slovenia, Italy, and France (Barazzetti and Leone 2003). Students therefore tend to discover the subject by chance while at university.

1.4.1.4 At present Women’s Studies does not form part of teacher training education despite the fact that teachers are vital for facilitating learning and change, including around gender roles, in primary and secondary education. Gender issues are rarely included in any school curricula. Since, however, 50% and more of the total of the European population do not enter tertiary education, it is vital that the changes in gender roles needed in twenty-first century Europe be inculcated at education levels that the vast majority of European Union citizens have access to, that is primary and secondary education levels.

1.4.1.5 Women’s Studies is a vital source for the dissemination of equal opportunities knowledge.

1.4.2 Employability of Women’s Studies Graduates

1.4.2.1 Women’s Studies as a discipline attracts women who are keen to participate in the labour market.

1.4.2.2 Women's Studies students acquire a significant number of important key knowledges and skills during their training including knowledge of gender and diversity issues, equal opportunities, critical thinking, self-confidence, and the ability to argue effectively. However, students sometimes think that their subject, Women's Studies, is viewed with hostility in the employment market, and they therefore sometimes deny the fact that they took this subject.

1.4.2.3 Employers appear to have little understanding of the knowledges and skills Women's Studies students acquire.

1.4.2.4 Our data suggest that careers advisors, in the countries where they exist, do not practise equal opportunities in relation to their clients, instead encouraging girls simply to move into traditionally feminized occupations, and have no or very limited understanding of the skills and knowledges Women's Studies students acquire. They also have little knowledge of the kinds of careers that require gender expertise.

1.4.2.5 Few Women's Studies courses require in-course work placements but students who have had such placements report a more realistic view of the job market and also in some instances acquired opportunities to be employed in the place where they had undertaken their work placements.

1.4.2.6 In most European countries participating in this project, Women's Studies training encourages the professionalization of its students, not least through its high retention rates into postgraduate level which as EU data show is a key factor in labour market participation.

1.4.3 Adaptability and Entrepreneurship of Women's Studies graduates

1.4.3.1 Since Women's Studies still lacks full recognition both inside academe and outside, its students are characterized by their independent-mindedness, their willingness to try new and unfamiliar terrain and thus take risks, and their focus on wanting to make a difference and achieve change. This makes them ideal participants in the current labour market with its need for flexibility, adaptability, and the willingness to strike out on your own.

1.4.3.2 Women's Studies training provide women with key knowledge and skills for the labour market. These include:

- Gender awareness
- Knowledge of equal opportunities
- Self-confidence
- Critical thinking ability
- The ability to establish and sustain complex arguments
- Abilities to work in a communicative, open style
- Competence in dealing with diversity.

1.4.3.3 Women's Studies students are more willing to go into less established, innovatory work environments where work cultures are less entrenched.

1.4.3.4 Women's Studies training impacts most significantly on *how* women carry out their work, making them potential change agents in the workplace.

1.4.3.5 Women's Studies students reported a willingness to 'invent' their own jobs, that is to think creatively about making employment for themselves.

1.4.3.6 Women's Studies facilitates upward professional mobility in its students.

1.4.3.7 Women's Studies students benefit greatly from the female friendship and mentoring networks at local, national, and international levels that they acquire during their Women's Studies training. These networks act as facilitators in finding post-training employment.

1.4.4 Women's Studies graduates and education- and employment-related migration

1.4.4.1 There was an increasing tendency among students from all partner countries except Spain and Italy to study abroad as both exchange programs have grown and knowledge of Women's Studies has become more widespread.

1.4.4.2 Countries which have well established Women's Studies programs such as the UK, the Netherlands, Finland and Germany are more likely to receive foreign students than countries where the subject is less well established.

1.4.4.3 Students also tend to be attracted to countries in which English is spoken.

1.4.4.4 In all the project partner countries except the UK and the Netherlands there was more inward than outward mobility of students.

1.4.4.5 Overall, women still tend to be under-represented in terms of educational mobility.

1.4.4.6 Those who study abroad tend to do so predominantly for a semester or a year.

1.4.4.7 Few students take entire degrees abroad.

1.4.4.8 Problems persist with having courses taken abroad accredited in the home university, especially where these are in subjects that have no equivalent in the home country. Students often do not know if the courses they take will be accredited on their return.

1.4.4.9 Although increasing numbers of students study abroad as part of an EU mobility scheme, a significant proportion are self-funded.

1.4.4.10 The most important barriers to studying abroad are lack of or insufficient funding, lack of language skills (which is particularly acute in the UK), and family and/or care commitments.

1.4.4.11 Women are less likely to study abroad once they have family.

1.4.4.12 Women who undertook training abroad were particularly impressed by the pedagogic and methodological schism between Anglo-American and Continental European systems of teaching (smaller class sizes and more focus on interactive teaching in the Anglo-American system), the differences in resourcing (better resources regarding IT etc in north-west European countries), and the experience of less restrictive and less traditionally gendered environments in the north-west European countries.

1.4.4.13 Students reported the development of greater tolerance towards others, a greater readiness to be mobile educationally and employment-wise, an enhanced understanding of other cultures, better language skills, and a positive impact on their employment as benefits derived from studying abroad.

1.4.4.14 Students from eastern and southern countries reported bringing back different ideas about gender roles to their home countries (see section 3.7.11 of this report).

1.4.4.15 Students reported that study abroad was valued by employers.

1.4.4.16 Students who want to stay in academe found the experience of studying abroad especially useful in subsequent employment terms.

1.4.5 Equal opportunities, Women's Studies training and women's employment

1.4.5.1 Equal opportunities legislation is at different levels of institutionalization across the diverse European countries.

1.4.5.2 Equal opportunities infrastructure in many European countries is dependent on the party-political context, with offices etc being closed if governments move from left-wing to right-wing dominance.

1.4.5.3 Equal opportunities legislation is rarely supported by the political will to implement it effectively and offers little sanction in case of violation.

1.4.5.4 Equal opportunities legislation in most European countries is not well understood, nor widely known by many people including those who have an awareness of gender issues (Suárez and Suárez 2003).

1.4.5.5 Although all project interviewees reported experiences of discrimination in the work place, none of them had resorted to legal measures to try and redress those issues.

1.4.5.6 In many European countries including France and Finland, for example, gender expertise is not a job requirement for people working in equal opportunities jobs.

1.4.5.7 Women's Studies training changes women's understanding of equal opportunities issues and increases women's perception of their involvement in equal opportunities issues.

1.4.5.8 Some Women's Studies students would like to see more equal opportunities training on their courses.

1.4.5.9 Women's Studies students are interested in working in equal opportunities employment contexts.

1.4.5.10 Women's Studies students' sense of being able to work in the equal opportunities sector is related to the degree of institutionalization of equal opportunities in their countries.

1.4.5.11 Women's Studies training enables women to enact equal opportunities policies in their work place including:

- Refusal to put up with sexist behaviour at work
- Introduction of gender issues into the work place
- Working in a non-sexist manner
- Fighting discrimination at work
- Feeling more confident in making applications for promotion
- Being more sensitive to issues of diversity
- Being more supportive of female colleagues

1.4.5.12 Women's Studies training facilitate students' understanding of the gendered power asymmetries they routinely encounter in their working lives, enabling them to make sense of those experiences.

1.5 Policy implications

1.5.1 The institutionalization of Women's Studies

1.5.1.1 The EU should use the Bologna process to encourage the establishment of Women's Studies as a fully recognized independent discipline at under- and at postgraduate level in all European Union countries.

1.5.1.2 All national governments should facilitate the establishment of Women's Studies as a fully recognized discipline at under- and at postgraduate level by including it as a discipline for all assessment and funding purposes, and supporting it with endowed chairs and studentships.

1.5.1.3 National governments and ministries of education should ensure that Women's Studies forms part of all teacher education curricula.

1.5.1.4 National governments and ministries of education should ensure that Women's Studies is part of the primary and secondary education curricula so that changes in gender roles can be addressed at the educational levels to which all European Union citizens have access.

1.5.1.5 Ministries of education and equal opportunities bodies in the European Union countries should explore the ways in which Women's Studies bases in tertiary education might be built upon and supported to disseminate equal opportunities knowledge more widely in society.

1.5.1.6 National governments and ministries of education should ensure that Women's Studies Centres are supported to act as dissemination centres for gender research and equal opportunities along the lines of the Swedish National Gender Secretariat.

1.5.1.7 The full institutionalisation of Women's Studies as a discipline, available both within traditional subjects and as a stand-alone degree, should be part of the implementation of the Bologna Agreement.

1.5.1.8 The project shows that students on modular degrees or on modules in traditional degrees that are interdisciplinary in character are difficult to track. We therefore recommend that the EU and national governments agree common processes for keeping such data so that student aggregation around interdisciplinary areas can be tracked and analysed more effectively.

1.5.1.9 During the project we found that with the exception of the UK, universities in no other country kept exit data for students which made it difficult to track students by discipline. The EU and national governments need to agree common processes for keeping data so that the transition from training to employment can be tracked and analysed more effectively.

1.5.1.10 Women's Studies students outperform their mothers in terms of reaching higher professional and/or managerial positions than their mothers had done.

1.5.1.11 Women's Studies students, especially in Italy, Finland and Germany, reject the conventional male career model which emphasizes climbing a career ladder and making increasingly large sums of money, instead defining their ideal job in terms of job satisfaction, making a difference, feeling valued, and working in a non-sexist environment.

1.5.1.12 Women's employment is inadequately captured by current conventional employment categories as used by EUROSTAT, the OECD, and other such bodies. Their categorizations replicate a male employment structure, and lump women's employment by default together in the 'Service' sector. Such undifferentiated structures fail to provide a true account of women's employment and also do not capture the cultural significance of any employment category. This includes ISCO-88 which offers more refined employment indicators.

1.5.1.13 Women's Studies (postgraduate) students are influenced by their training in the type of employment they seek and want to work in particular in three employment sectors: feminist research/academe, equal opportunities, and women's NGOs.

1.5.1.14 Women's Studies students produce four different discourses regarding how they enter the labour market, highlighting varying degrees of sense of agency in the process which are sometimes significantly at odds with the actual amount of pro-activity the students demonstrate. This highlights women's continuing acculturation

into feminine gender roles that construct them as passive and objects rather than the subjects they are and act as.

1.5.1.15 The gender expertise generated through Women's Studies training is of critical importance in a great variety of jobs including human resources, health and social services, the police, middle management, etc., and Women's Studies graduates enter a wide variety of professions in which they are able to make a difference due to their gender expertise.

1.5.1.16 The women's movement and Women's Studies have led to new employment sectors in the form of feminist research/academe, equal opportunities jobs, and women's NGOs. This demonstrates the professionalisation of gender expertise.

1.5.1.17 Women continue to carry the double burden of paid employment and domestic labour which impacts on their ability to participate fully in the labour market.

1.5.1.18 Women's Studies in a number of countries attracts older women who then either return to the labour market or enter it for the first time.

1.5.2 Employability of Women's Studies Graduates

1.5.2.1 Women's Studies courses need to support students in marketing their knowledges and skills more effectively.

1.5.2.2 Education ministries and equal opportunities bodies should facilitate Women's Studies staff to help them market the knowledges and skills Women's Studies students acquire to prospective employers.

1.5.2.3 National governments should develop initiatives to enhance employers' knowledge of the kinds of knowledges and skills students acquire during their training, including Women's Studies training.

1.5.2.4 Women's Studies staff should seek to develop awareness raising programs for employers regarding the kinds of knowledges and skills Women's Studies students acquire during their training.

1.5.2.5 Careers advice services for students should be available in all European Union countries, and the Bologna process might be used as a tool by the European Union to support the establishment of such services where they do not exist.

1.5.2.6 Careers advisors should be trained both in equal opportunities and in knowledge of the kinds of careers that require gender expertise. Such training might be delivered via Women's Studies programs, and national ministries of education as well as departments of trade and industry which should set up initiatives to enable this.

1.5.2.7 Careers advice services should produce annual gender audits.

1.5.2.8 Women's Studies courses should consider the inclusion of work placements as part of their curriculum.

1.5.2.9 National governments and ministries of education should ensure the establishment of postgraduate courses and research centres in Women's Studies in all higher education institutions.

1.5.2.10 The EU and national statistics offices should develop gender sensitive employment statistical indicators for women's employment. This includes the development of gender sensitive statistical indicators for unpaid care work.

1.5.2.11 Several European certification norms already exist, notably in relation to health and safety (eg AFNOR, ISO-2000). A similar scheme should be adopted in relation to women's employment. National and local governments, public and private-sector companies, leisure and cultural institutions, third sector service providers, political parties, etc. should be required to meet a series of norms in relation to the promotion of women's rights in employment. So-called "family-friendly" personnel management practices could be one of the first areas to be recognised with a "best practice" gender equality certification scheme. In addition, this scheme could also provide a framework for training equal opportunity staff. Training programmes (in collaboration with Women's Studies experts in higher education institutions) could be harmonised across the EU, with the explicit aim of transferring "best practices" in relation to training women (or men) in equal opportunity-related jobs from countries where there has already been a degree of "equal opportunities institutionalisation", to those where there are few employment opportunities in this area, or where people can be recruited to equality officer jobs without any previous training in gender analysis.

1.5.2.12 Women's Studies staff and careers advisors need to support their students more, and more systematically, in recognizing their own agency in entering the employment market.

1.5.2.13 Measures need to be developed both nationally and at EU level to facilitate cultural change in men so that they become producers and not merely consumers of domestic labour. These should include compulsory teaching on gender issues at primary and secondary school level, the development of positive role models for men doing domestic labour in the media, and incentives via employers and tax breaks to encourage men to take on proper care responsibilities for dependents.

1.5.2.14 National governments and education ministries should support the setting up of Women's Studies courses for women aged 40+ to help the latter enter or re-enter education and the labour market.

1.5.2.15 At EU level and nationally, policies to reduce working hours for all employees should be given more weight than policies encouraging part-time employment for women.

1.5.3 Adaptability and Entrepreneurship of Women's Studies graduates

1.5.3.1 National/regional ministries of education and departments of trade and industry should develop strategies for promoting greater knowledge of the skills acquired through Women's Studies training.

1.5.3.2 The EU and national/regional governments should develop and support female mentoring systems for Women's Studies graduates to sustain the latter in unconventional employment arenas, and to spread knowledge about the opportunities around divergent career paths.

1.5.4 Women's Studies graduates and education- and employment-related migration

1.5.4.1 The EU should revise student and staff mobility programmes to include opportunities for short-term exchanges (one week to one month) to enable women and men with care/domestic responsibilities to participate in such schemes.

1.5.4.2 The EU should review the financial incentives aimed at achieving harmonization and a more competent workforce through greater mobility for educational purposes, as finances are often too limited to enable students to take educational mobility schemes up.

1.5.4.3 The EU should use the Bologna process to enforce language teaching in countries such as the UK where lack of knowledge of languages impedes educational mobility.

1.5.4.4 The EU should revise mobility schemes to enable participation even where there is no exchange of equal numbers of students.

1.5.4.5 The EU should use educational mobility schemes to further international networking and mentoring for women by encouraging support schemes which transcend the duration of the actual mobility scheme.

1.5.4.6 The EU needs to establish measures and sanctions that ensure the accreditation of courses taken abroad in the student's home country, including courses in subjects not taught in the home country.

1.5.4.7 The EU, national governments and education institutions should use educational mobility users to act as advocates of such schemes and to promote them.

1.5.4.8 The EU ought to encourage the establishment of a greater diversity of mobility schemes including summer schools.

1.5.5 Equal opportunities, Women's Studies and women's employment

1.5.5.1 The EU should promote measures to speed up the implementation of equal opportunities legislation in all its member countries.

1.5.5.2 The EU and national governments should ensure that equal opportunities infrastructures are set up and maintained independently of changes in local/national government, and independent of the political will of political parties.

1.5.5.3 The EU and national governments ought to develop effective and implementable sanctions in case of equal opportunities legislation.

1.5.5.4 Both the EU and national governments should develop campaigns to facilitate a greater degree of dissemination and understanding of equal opportunities legislation.

1.5.5.5 As part of schools' training for citizenship, curricula ought to be developed to incorporate knowledge of rights under equal opportunities legislation and an understanding of how one might use that legislation to seek redress in case of violation.

1.5.5.6 The EU and national governments should ensure that gender expertise is a standard requirement of all equal opportunities posts.

1.5.5.7 Women's Studies courses should be encouraged to give more curriculum space to equal opportunities.

1.5.5.8 Equal opportunities bodies should be encouraged by national governments to collaborate with Women's Studies programs to facilitate training in equal opportunities.

1.5.5.9 National governments and departments of trade and industry should ensure that careers advisors are trained to promote jobs in equal opportunities to Women's Studies students.

1.5.5.10 Domestic and care labour training should become part of the primary and secondary schools training for all boys and girls in all European countries.

1.5.5.11 Employers in all European countries should be required to carry out gender audits and to include action plans for improving gender imbalances in their work place.

1.5.5.12 Careers advisors should receive gender awareness training. Their activities should be regularly monitored and audited, including a gender audit, and incentives created to facilitate the promotion of men into traditionally female jobs and women's opportunities to work outside the service sector.

1.5.5.13 International mentoring schemes for women with Gender Studies expertise need to be developed and promoted throughout the European Union through bodies such as the 'Women and Science' Unit.

1.5.5.14 The EU and national governments ought to agree on incentives to be offered to employers (tax breaks; benefits) designed to transform gender segregation in the labour market through making gender awareness part of their job specifications, and to promote greater gender balance in employment.

1.5.5.15 All European countries should introduce targeted programmes to increase women's participation and advancement in academe.

1.5.5.16 European policy should support targeted positive action at national level to enhance women's participation and advancement in academe.

1.5.5.17 National mentoring schemes for Gender Studies experts need to be put in place through ministries of education and departments of trade and industry.

1.5.5.18 National governments should consider using tax incentives and other fiscal measures to encourage employers to improve gender imbalances in areas such as promotion, the pay gap, and parental leave taken by men rather than women.

1.5.5.19 Gender audits and relevant action plans should be established as a central aspect of all public funding policies.

1.5.5.20 Countries such as Germany and France should introduce standardised job descriptions for commissioners of women's affairs/equal opportunities officers.

1.5.5.21 Ministries of education should ensure that all teacher-training courses include a compulsory equal opportunities element.

1.5.5.22 National campaigns are required to promote equal opportunities legislation and women's rights within the work place.

1.5.5.23 National campaigns are required to promote awareness of issues such as violence against women, and the need for men's participation in domestic and care labour.

1. Background and objectives of the project

1.1 Rationale

The Amsterdam Treaty (1997) identified a gap in the employment rates between women and men in Europe, resulting in the greater economic and social exclusion of women. The Commission's Communication entitled *Social Action Programme 1998-2000* (Com (98) 259, 29/4/98) points out that the Employment Guidelines adopted by the Member States are based 'on the four pillars of employability, entrepreneurship, adaptability and equal opportunities.' (4) Within this context Member States have agreed to 'actively support employability' (*Council resolution on the 1999 Employment Guidelines*, 4) and to increase 'possibilities for training, work experience, traineeships or other measures to promote employability' (5). The *Council Resolution on the 1999 Employment Guidelines* recognized that 'women still have particular problems in gaining access to the employment market, in career advancement, in earnings and in reconciling professional and family life.' (7)

This project addressed the problematic of women's employment by focusing on a specific group of women about whose experiences in and of the labour market little is known at present. The women in question are those who have undertaken Women's Studies training, predominantly as part of or in the form of university degrees but also through NGOs. During the last twenty years at least around 100,000 women in Europe (SIGMA Report 1996) have undergone such training and it is known anecdotally that their training has had significant impacts on their employability, adaptability, entrepreneurship, and the promotion of equal opportunities at regional and at European level. This project for the first time collected systematic data on, and investigated, the impact of Women's Studies training on women's employment in Europe.

1.2 Objectives

The fundamental **research question** of this project was: how does Women's Studies training affect women's opportunities and interventions in the labour market? In pursuing this question the project's **three working hypotheses** were that

- the degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies training is significantly related to the impact of the training on women's achievements in the labour market;
- the degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies training in individual countries is related to the equal opportunities policies in that country;
- both the degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies training and the presence/implementation of equal opportunities policies impact on women's professionalisation.

These hypotheses were supported by both the analyses of both the primary and the secondary data produced and utilized during the research process.

Within this context the **key objective** of the project was, for the first time, to collect systematically quantitative and qualitative scientific data on women who have

undergone Women’s Studies training in order to understand the impact of that training on their employment and in order to provide policy recommendations regarding the training and employment of women.

No re-orientation of the rationale or objectives occurred during the lifetime of the project.

2. Scientific description of the project results and methodology

3.1 Introduction

This project, conducted between October 2001 and October 2003, and funded by DGXII (Research) of the European Commission as part of Framework 5, is the first cross-European project conducting systematic comparative research into the issue of what happens to women with Women’s Studies training in the employment market. Its project partners were universities which offer Women’s Studies training and the senior academics responsible for the research were all women with extended histories of conducting Women’s Studies training, in many instances reaching back to the 1970s and early 1980s. Since that time, at least 100,000 women have received such training but little is known about what happens to them in the employment market. The project addressed this knowledge gap.

3.2 Method/ology

This report is based on empirical research carried out in nine European countries⁵ during 2002. It combined non-random quantitative data elicited through questionnaires from an average of 50 past and 50 current Women’s Studies students in each participating country⁶ with qualitative data derived from 30 semi-structured interviews (20 past and 10 current Women’s Studies students per participating country). The latter were carried out in order to establish the meanings of some of the answers provided in the questionnaires, and to lend depth to the data gleaned from the questionnaires. The project’s findings are thus based on over 900 questionnaire returns and 270 interviews.

⁵ These are Finland, Germany, Hungary, Italy, France, Spain, Slovenia, the Netherlands and the UK.

⁶ The actual numbers of questionnaire respondents per country were as given in the following table:

Table A: Actual number of questionnaire respondents by partner country.

	Past students	Present students
Finland	N = 56	N = 35
France	N = 51	N = 71
Germany	N = 56	N = 69
Hungary	N = 51	N = 50
Italy	N = 50	N = 50
Netherlands	N = 80	N = 51
Slovenia	N = 50	N = 50
Spain	N = 43	N = 83
UK	N = 104	N = 83

Prior to constructing the questionnaires, and based on the hypotheses that informed the project, each participating country had produced a *Background Data Report* on women's employment, the institutionalization of equal opportunities and of Women's Studies in the respective country.⁷ These reports informed the construction of the standardized questionnaires which were initially written in English and then translated into the partner countries' respective languages. The questionnaires elicited data on:

1. Personal and demographic data, including the impact of doing Women's Studies on family life;
2. Previous employment and educational histories;
3. Motives for pursuing Women's Studies and expectations of the training;
4. Experiences and evaluation of Women's Studies training;
5. Subsequent employment histories, both immediate and longer term;
6. Trainees' evaluation of the contribution of Women's Studies training to their subsequent employment;
7. Migration educational experience (ERASMUS, SOCRATES/private foundations) and its impact.

The questionnaire returns were analysed using SPSS and summary reports produced for each participating country.⁸

The questionnaire data collected were non-random. This was for two reasons: 1) apart from the UK, higher education institutions across European countries do not keep exit or first destination data of their students, apparently for data protection reasons. This means that (in particular past) students had to be accessed using snowballing techniques. 2) Especially at undergraduate level, students tend to access Women's Studies courses predominantly (see Table 1) as modules within other, traditional degrees. These students who cannot take Women's Studies degrees as such are thus doubly invisible within the education and training system.

Subsequent to the questionnaires, semi-structured interviews were conducted in each participating country, utilizing a jointly agreed interview schedule. Interviewees were on the whole selected from among questionnaire respondents who had indicated their willingness to be interviewed, and partners attempted to cover a wide variety of experiences among the interviewees. Where questionnaire respondents proved difficult to track for interview purposes, in particular in Hungary, Slovenia and in Spain,⁹ some interviews were conducted with additional women who had had

⁷ These *Background Data Reports* are available on the project's website www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi. Hard copies published under the title *Women's Employment, Women's Studies and Equal Opportunities in Europe 1945-2001* (ed. Gabriele Griffin, University of Hull, 2002) were widely distributed (see the '18-Month Periodic Progress Report' of the project on the project website for further information) and copies may still be obtained, free of charge, by emailing g.griffin@hull.ac.uk.

⁸ Copies of these summary reports on the quantitative data are available on the project website www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

⁹ In the case of Spain, follow-up issues were a function of the time of year when the research was conducted (summer vacation time when many respondents went away); in Hungary and Slovenia these difficulties were associated with the relatively low numbers of women who have done Women's Studies since the subject constitutes a recent development and is not taught, even as modules, in many institutions. There were also, in general, significant differences in respondents' willingness to be interviewed (see the Qualitative Data Reports on the project website www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi for further details).

Women's Studies training¹⁰. Some of these then also filled in the questionnaires. Interviews lasted between one and three hours, and each partner conducted 30 interviews, 20 with past students and 10 with current Women's Studies students. All partners produced qualitative data reports based on the interview data they collected.¹¹

Finally, eight comparative data reports were written, based on the data and reports already collected and done, and mentioned above.¹² These comparative reports focused in cross-European perspective on eight key issues that underpinned the project, namely:

- The organisational forms/degrees of institutionalisation of equal opportunities in Europe;
- The institutionalisation and focus of Women's Studies training across Europe;
- Employment opportunities for women in Europe;
- The relationship between Women's Studies training and women's employment expectations;
- Women's expectations concerning the labour market and employment outcomes following Women's Studies training;
- The professionalisation of Women's Studies graduates (including the academic profession) in Europe;
- The relationship between education migration, and Women's Studies students' employment;
- The impact of Women's Studies training on women's lifestyles/everyday life practices.

Each comparative report also contained policy recommendations relevant to the issue it centred on.

This final project report thus draws on the *Background Data Reports* of the project, the summary reports of the quantitative questionnaire-based data, the SPSS files constructed from those questionnaire data, the qualitative data reports derived from the interviews conducted, the comparative reports, and other relevant sources.

The scientific description of the project results is divided into the following six sub-sections governing the rest of this section:

3.3 The Institutionalization of Women's Studies in Europe

3.4 Women's Studies Training and Employment I: Pre- and in-training expectations and experiences

3.5 Women's Studies Training and Employment II: Post-training expectations and experiences

3.6 Impact of Women's Studies training on how work is carried out

3.7 Women's Studies, equal opportunities and women's employment

3.8 Women's Studies, women's educational migration and employment.

¹⁰ The term 'Women's Studies training' is here used to indicate that education in Women's Studies happened predominantly but not exclusively in universities; in countries such as Hungary, Slovenia and Italy such training is also carried out in NGOs.

¹¹ These qualitative data reports can be requested from project partners as detailed on the project website www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

¹² The comparative reports are also available on the project's website.

3.3 The Institutionalization of Women's Studies in Europe

Women's Studies as a discipline takes as its premise that gender is a defining category, affecting and effecting both experience and knowledge (Bowles and Klein 1983; Humm 1989). In analysing the meanings and impact of gender on both experience and knowledge Women's Studies, predominantly located in the Social Sciences and Humanities (Silius 2002a), is interdisciplinary, challenging not only conventional, traditional academic structures and disciplines but also deeply ingrained socio-cultural assumptions about femininity and masculinity. Its transformative agenda is vital to the EU if it is to promote not only new kinds of knowledges but also the increasing participation of women in the labour market. So is its interdisciplinary nature. Both have created challenges for its insertion into higher education, augmented by the fact that Women's Studies is not conventionally included in primary and secondary school curricula, therefore unfamiliar to students entering higher education straight from school¹³. Since Women's Studies is concerned with tackling deeply rooted acculturated notions of femininity and masculinity¹⁴ which are key contributors to gender inequality and differential access to the labour market, the project partners suggest that gender issues be introduced at all levels of education from primary school onwards and that they should also constitute a compulsory component of all teacher training.

Our data show that Women's Studies as a discipline is unevenly developed across the nine participating European countries (Griffin 2002c). In many European countries its development dates back to the 1970s (SIGMA Report 1995; Silius 2002a) when the first courses, often as modules in traditional Social Sciences and Humanities disciplines, were introduced. As Table 1 shows, the discipline has seen its most rapid development in Europe from the mid-1980s onwards. In 2003 all European countries have centres where feminist research is conducted and in the vast majority it is possible to do postgraduate degrees in the subject. In all European countries it is possible to take Women's Studies modules as part of other degree courses, ranging from the possibility of majoring in the discipline to doing joint degrees or taking Women's Studies as a minor. Among the partner countries in this project, it is possible only in the UK to gain a named undergraduate degree (BA; BSc)¹⁵ as well as named postgraduate degrees (MA; MSc; PhD) in Women's Studies.

The vast majority of the project's questionnaire respondents (see Table 1 below) had taken Women's Studies as one or more modules within another, traditional undergraduate degree; the second highest category of respondents were postgraduate students undertaking Masters degrees. We think this broadly reflects the distribution of Women's Studies students across under- and postgraduate degree levels in the participating countries, but the issues regarding student tracking mentioned above impact on the project data.

¹³ The findings from this project show that the vast majority of Women's Studies students encounter Women's Studies as a discipline for the first time when they are already at university, thus emphasizing both the 'hidden-ness' of the discipline and its virtual non-existence at primary and secondary school level (see Table 4 in this report).

¹⁴ For the need to tackle these issues see Bourdieu (1998).

¹⁵ This is also possible in Sweden and in one institution in Germany.

Table 1. Percentage of questionnaire respondents undertaking particular kinds of Women's Studies training

		Course dates***	PhD in Women's Studies	MA (in Women's Studies)	BA in Women's Studies	Modules in other undergraduate disciplines	Other
Finland	PS*	1980; 65% from 1995	-	21	-	77	2
	CS**	1993; 66% from 1998	-	17+	44	38	-
France	PS	1987; increasing from 1993	2	43; 6+	-	45	4
	CS	1994; 73% from 2000	-	13; 7+	3	75	1
Germany	PS	1981; 62% from 1991	4	2; 23+	4	53	13
	CS	1988; 51% from 2001	-	2; 5+	37	38	19
Hungary	PS	1990; 53% from 1999	-	2+	4	63	31
	CS	1995; 64% from 2001	-	-	-	77	22
Italy	PS	1974; 40% from 1999	5	16; 7+	7	23	42
	CS	1984; 72% from 2001	8	19; 2+	-	49	21
Netherlands	PS	1976; 58% from 1991	-	4; 4+	21	61	11
	CS	1979; 57% from 1999	7	11	24	65	4
Slovenia	PS	1992-2002	-	6; 8+	6	62	16
	CS	Mostly from 2002	6	18+	-	74	2
Spain	PS	1995; 64% from 1998	40	5; 10+	-	12	33
	CS	1998; 79% from 2002	8	2+	-	48	41
UK	PS	1975; 67% from 1991	1	50	16	18	6
	CS	1990, 63% from 2000-2	17	12; 5+	24	36	13

*PS = past students; **CS = present students
*** Course dates = earliest time from which students studied
+ = as modules within other disciplines
Source: Quantitative Data Reports, EWSI project 2003.

Specific national circumstances apart, across Europe the following four factors are key in either furthering or hindering the institutionalization of Women's Studies¹⁶:

¹⁶ For further details see Harriet Silius' Summary Report of the Project Background Data (2002a) on the project website www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Table 2. Factors impacting on the institutionalisation of Women's Studies¹⁷

Factors <i>furthering</i> Women's Studies institutionalisation	Factors <i>hindering</i> Women's Studies institutionalisation
High degree of university autonomy in developing curricula	Little autonomy of university to develop curricula
Modularity	Rigid disciplinary structures
Support from or neutrality of women's movement towards institutionalisation	Anti-institutional attitudes of the women's movement
State support for the subject	Absence of state support for the subject
<i>Source: Silius (2002a).</i>	

According to Silius (2002a), the *process* of the institutionalisation of Women's Studies in Europe, which began in the 1970s¹⁸, followed six phases (though these are not always strictly successive):

1. *activist* phase (individual optional modules appear within traditional degrees)
2. *establishment* phase (generic and thematic modules are introduced; interdisciplinary co-teaching units are established)
3. *integration* (Women's Studies modules become part of the core compulsory provision of traditional disciplines)
4. *professionalisation* (Women's Studies degree programmes are introduced and Women's Studies staff including professors are appointed)
5. *disciplinisation* (department-like centres for teaching, research and documentation are established)
6. *autonomy* (Women's Studies functions like any other discipline with the same accreditation, funding, and degree awarding rights)

This project indicates that the *degree* of institutionalisation of Women's Studies may be measured in terms of¹⁹

- the number of (endowed) named chairs/professors and lectureships in the field;
- the existence of autonomous or faculty-based Women's Studies centres or departments;
- the academic standing of the staff involved;
- the existence and range of degree-awarding under- and postgraduate programmes;
- the number of disciplines involved in Women's Studies;
- the amount and kind of funding (temporary or structural) available;
- the research capacity of the discipline;
- recognition of the discipline by the various key decision-making bodies relevant to higher education in a given country such as education ministries, higher education funding authorities, etc.

In terms of these indicators, Women's Studies has not achieved full disciplinary status in any European country, and the degree of its institutionalisation is variable:

¹⁷ For a detailed discussion of these factors see the Comparative Data Report 2 (Barazzetti and Leone 2003) on the project website.

¹⁸ The exception here among the project partner countries is Hungary where Women's Studies began to be institutionalized in the 1990s. Other countries that saw the beginnings of Women's Studies in the 1970s but in 2003 still have low levels of institutionalization are France, Italy and Slovenia.

¹⁹ See also Braidotti, Delhez, and Ramrath (1998); Barazzetti and Leone (2003).

Table 3. Degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies in the EWSI-partner countries in Europe

Finland	HIGH
Germany	HIGH
Netherlands	HIGH
UK	HIGH
Spain	MEDIUM
France	LOW
Italy	LOW
Slovenia	LOW
Hungary	LOW
<i>Source: Silius (2002a).</i>	

As Silius' (2002a), and Barazzetti and Leone's (2003) reports show, the meaning of these degrees of institutionalisation vary from country to country even where they seemingly fall within the same category. Only UK universities among the partner countries, for instance, can award named undergraduate as well as postgraduate degrees in Women's Studies. But unlike Finland, Germany, and the Netherlands, the UK has not benefited from state feminism in the form of endowed chairs or endowed PhD studentships in Women's Studies. The institutionalisation of Women's Studies in both France and Italy is low not least because the women's movement was strongly anti-institutional. In France this same anti-institutionalism is augmented by little university autonomy in the creation of new curricula which have to be agreed by the Ministry of Education every four years (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002), and by the specific history of the concept of *egalité* which proclaims a universal, gender-neutral subject, thus precluding the possibility of the recognition of gender difference and, for instance, positive action. A similar scenario regarding the concept of equality exists in Finland (Tuori and Silius 2002) but this has not prevented the relatively high degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies there, fostered by a greater degree of flexibility in study patterns and by modularity. The project thus shows that contextual factors play a key role in the institutionalisation of Women's Studies.

3.3.1 Market-oriented versus non-market-oriented education

In this project we distinguished between traditional, strongly discipline-based, non-market oriented, mass higher education systems (Spain, France, Italy, Germany) and selective, modular, market-oriented education systems (the UK, the Netherlands, Finland), with the east European partner countries (Hungary, Slovenia) representing a different case (Barazzetti and Leone 2003) determined by their socialist pasts and current transitional status from a centralized to a market-led economy. The non-market oriented, mass higher education systems tended to view education as a desirable end in its own right, not necessarily linked directly to employment. In consequence in these countries, in particular in France, there was less assumption of a direct relationship between university education and employment, than there was in the market-oriented systems in which there was both a stronger expectation of such a direct connection *and*, especially in the UK, a direct connection between the ability to attract students to courses and the establishment of such market-led courses, of which Women's Studies during the 1980s was one (Griffin 2002b). This approach makes disciplines vulnerable to market-led demand, particularly evident in the UK where significant numbers of degree courses in all manner of disciplines including languages

and European Studies have been closed down because they do not attract sufficient numbers of students.²⁰ The erosion of cultural capital (Bourdieu 1979) which this constitutes is an issue hardly tackled either in the UK or elsewhere. The project partners recommend that Women's Studies be recognized as a discipline in all European countries by the relevant education and funding bodies, and that education ministries and governments support the creation and maintenance of subject-related infrastructures including chairs and lectureships in Women's Studies and endowed PhD studentships as part of their implementation of equal opportunities policies.

3.3.2 Accessing Women's Studies

Since Women's Studies is at present not taught in schools, undergraduates who formed the bulk of our questionnaire respondents (see Table 1) usually came across Women's Studies by chance once they had entered university. This is evidenced in their sources of information for choosing Women's Studies which as Table 4 below shows were mostly universities themselves:

Table 4. Source of information about Women's Studies according to questionnaire respondents in percentages

Partner	University		School		Friends		Women's Organisations	
	PS*	CS**	PS	CS	PS	CS	PS	CS
Hungary	98***	100	-	-	-	-	-	-
Finland	89	86	-	3	9	9	2	3
Germany	88	87	2	4	5	6	5	3
France	80	90	-	-	12	4	4	6
Netherlands	71	82	13	2	8	10	4	2
Slovenia	70	94	14	-	12	4	4	-
Spain	65	75	-	-	12	14	23	8
UK	65	68	5	13	21	12	3	-
Italy	64	72	2	2	18	14	14	8

*PS = past students; **CS = current students.
 *** Figures do not always add up to 100% as a small percentage in some countries cited 'other sources'.
 Source: Quantitative data reports EWSI Project 2003.

As one French student described it: 'The first time I ever heard anything about Women's Studies was in my first year of Sociology. There was this core course on social inequality. . . as soon as I heard [lecturers] talking about masculine domination, that triggered something inside me, it was really strong, and that just sort of got me interested, so when it came to choosing the final year degree options, I took the Women's Studies option, because of that class' (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003, p. 33). Another French interviewee described the process as follows: 'in the first year, there was this one lecture on gender relations, I went twice, the second time I even took a friend. . . In the second year, we had this group project to do. . . so we chose to

²⁰ This development can be tracked through *The Times Higher Education Supplement*, a weekly paper reporting on matters of the academy in the UK and beyond. Its content over the past twenty-five years documents the decline of many university subjects in the UK, including European languages departments, as a consequence of low of student demand.

work on the social construction of femininity. . . As soon as I was given the opportunity to develop those kinds of questions, I did. In the third year, I didn't hesitate at all.' (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003, p. 33)

This progression from coming across the subject by chance to making a deliberate commitment to it was not unusual amongst interviewees, and led to a high level of desire to pursue the discipline at postgraduate level. This is an important issue for, as Le Feuvre and Andriocci (2003) argue, 'women's employment rates . . . vary quite considerably according to the level of education' (p. 22). They cite Eurostat information (see Table 5 below) which shows that 'societal specificities in women's labour market participation rates are reduced once one compares women with a degree' (p. 23):

The cross-national differences between women with the highest and those with the lowest employment rates are only 7.8% for women with a higher education qualification, whereas the differences are over 30% when one considers women with only primary school education levels.

However, the influence of higher education on women's employment rates also depends on the national 'gender culture' context of the society. Thus, the differences in employment rates between the least and the best qualified Finnish women is only [around] 20%, whereas a 44% difference exists between the least and the best qualified women in Italy. (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003, p. 23)²¹

Table 5. Male and female employment rates (25 to 59 years), by education, 2000

	Finland	France	Germany	Italy	NL	Spain	UK	EU-15
<i>Primary</i>								
Men	72.2	75.3	73.0	76.9	82.7	80.4	74.8	77.7
Women	64.9	53.7	51.7	32.8	49.5	35.1	60.0	47.1
<i>Secondary</i>								
Men	82.0	87.3	84.1	84.4	92.4	86.7	88.6	86.2
Women	74.3	71.0	69.7	61.7	74.2	57.8	77.3	69.4
<i>Higher</i>								
Men	87.3	85.9	87.9	83.5	90.0	81.1	89.2	86.9
Women	84.3	81.8	82.0	77.0	84.9	73.6	84.8	81.8
Source: Eurostat (2002) <i>La vie des femmes et des hommes en Europe. Un portrait statistique, Données 1980 – 2000</i> : 181.								

Le Feuvre and Andriocci (2003) conclude that it is 'very important that women should have access to the highest levels of the education system, since their levels of qualification impact directly on their employment patterns.' (p. 23) Since Women's Studies as a discipline, as indicated above, encourages women to enter and remain in higher education in a context where women across Europe are on average still less likely than men to obtain higher education qualifications (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003, pp. 23-5), it is vital that the institutionalization of Women's Studies as a discipline is fully supported at European as well as at national levels.

²¹ These findings are confirmed by OECD (2002) data on educational attainment and labour market participation.

3.3.3 Reasons for taking Women's Studies

Interest in the subject and personal interest were cited extensively as reasons for taking Women's Studies. These, as Table 6 indicates, were far more important, certainly at undergraduate level, than a direct connection between taking Women's Studies and subsequent employment:

Table 6. Factors influencing the choice of Women's Studies in percentages

Partner	Personal interest		Awareness of gender inequalities		Academic interest		Social issues		Gaining a qualification	
	PS*	CS**	PS	CS	PS	CS	PS	CS	PS	CS
UK	86	91	65	74	63	74	53	71	54	57***
Finland	98	97	73	60	80	66	22	27	4	0
Netherlands	92	100	89	80	78	86	74	65	11	8
Italy	94	87	60	87	40	44	26	39	7	20
France	77	86	67	60	80	80	45	33	39	16
Slovenia	82	67	58	49	62	74	15	19	20	15
Hungary	69	65	36	22	56	34	22	23	13	2
Germany	93	97	91	96	93	79	49	65	22	24
Spain	90	64	80	67	71	70	67	36	23	50

*PS = past students; **CS = current students;
 ***Figures do not add up to 100% since respondents could tick all options applicable to them.
 Source: Summary data reports EWSI Project 2003.

These findings are not specific to this study. A project conducted by Maryanne Dever and Elizabeth Day (2001) from the Centre for Women's Studies and Gender Research at Monash University, Melbourne, involving four Women's Studies centres each in Australia, the United Kingdom, and the United States of America also found that 'career and vocational issues do not appear to feature prominently in students' initial reasons for selecting the major. . . Women's Studies students indicated overwhelmingly (between 70% and 90%) that their primary reason for enrolling in the field was "interest in the subject", a trend largely replicated in the control groups from other humanities and social science majors.' (Dever and Day, p. 56) Indeed, 'fewer than 5% of students in the various Women's Studies programs surveyed listed "career prospects" as the principal motivating factor in their enrolment decision.' (Dever and Day, p. 56) This project's data confirmed these findings (see Table 7), with the low percentages of respondents taking the subject who sought to gain a qualification in it being explained by the lack of opportunity in most European countries of doing so²². However, it should be noted that there were significant variations between countries regarding these expectations. These can be explained by a number of factors which vary from country to country and include general levels of women's employment in the countries concerned, age and employment experiences of the respondents, and the visibility of Women's Studies and degree of institutionalization of equal opportunities in a given country.

²² As indicated above, Women's Studies is still predominantly taught in modules within other, traditional disciplines such as Sociology, Literature, etc.

Table 7. Percentage of questionnaire respondents seeking to gain a qualification or improve job opportunities through undertaking Women’s Studies training

Country	Gaining qualification		Improving job opportunities	
	Past students	Current students	Past students	Current students
UK	54	57	39	57
France	39	16	13	0
Spain	23	50	29	9
Germany	22	24	6	0
Slovenia	20	15	15	0
Hungary	13	2	2	2
Netherlands	11	8	7	0
Italy	7	20	12	0
Finland	4	0	24	12

Source: Quantitative data reports EWSI Project 2003.

However, as shall be indicated below, the situation was very different where postgraduate students were concerned.

3.4 Women’s Studies training and employment I: Pre- and in-training expectations and experiences

One important consequence of Women’s Studies students’ focus on personal interest and interest in the subject was that students, especially past students who commented on this from the perspective of more extended experiences of the labour market, systematically under-estimated the impact which Women’s Studies would have on their employment (Table 8). Where expectations were lower than actual impact, this was in part a function of limited employment experience, especially regarding current students.

Table 8. Percentage of reported expected and actual impact of Women’s Studies training on women’s employment by questionnaire respondents

Partner country	Past students		Current students	
	Expected impact	Actual impact	Expected impact	Actual impact
UK	31	57	52	30
Spain	21	38	48	28
Netherlands	16	52	38	51
Slovenia	16	26	22	42
Italy	12	40	24	30
France	8	29	14	11
Finland	7	27	43	38
Germany	6	54	39	14
Hungary	6	33	12	33

Source: Quantitative data reports, EWSI project 2003.

3.4.1 Employer demands and student expectations

This underestimation may be a function of the misrecognition, especially amongst undergraduates, of the meaning that doing Women's Studies has for employers. Since undergraduates' primary interests in the discipline are personal and discipline-centered, they tend to over-invest in the content. One Italian interviewee, for instance, said: 'I remember that in 1987, when I attended a course to become an equality counsellor, those who dealt with gender issues were regarded as troublemakers within their company or their organisations.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 32) A Dutch interviewee said: '[Women's Studies] can be hampering, but that is more related to the image of Women's Studies, that people think of you as a radical feminist or so. . . . If people read in your *curriculum vitae* that you graduated in Women's Studies, they will not all approve.' (van der Sanden 2003, p. 18) Even if students did not view their studies as an entry ticket into the labour market, they were, in Dever and Day's study (2001) as much as in the present project, able to articulate both directly and indirectly some of the employment-related benefits they derived from their Women's Studies training: 'First of all, [Women's Studies] has given me a different knowledge of myself, both at an individual and at a gender level. Indeed, you can get practical knowledge and specific skills, but I don't know to what extent they are recognized in the labour market. You therefore keep this knowledge to yourself.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 25)

The notion of Women's Studies as an identity project on the one hand, and as a source of transferable skills on the other, was countered by a sense that what was learnt was not necessarily valued in the labour market. Students feared encountering, and do encounter, employer hostility to having studied Women's Studies. This can lead to various forms of self-censorship, especially as students are aware of the subject not being valued as highly as other disciplines either inside or outside the academy.²³ 'When I did my doctorate, although I was very keen on [Women's Studies], I made a universal and neutral choice. . . . I got a neutral qualification as a philosopher. . . . In doing this, I was playing safe, in order to be recognized by the scientific community and be viewed less suspiciously as regards my feminist interests.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 26) Some students thus modified both their academic choices and how they presented their academic history to prospective employers in order to improve their employability. The Finnish qualitative data report summarized: 'Most of the students said that they do not bring [their Women's Studies knowledge] up in a job interview, for example, as it would not be considered as anything positive. . . .' (Tuori 2003, p. 32) As one Italian interviewee described it: '[Women's Studies] has not been a job opportunity. On the contrary, it denied me the possibility to work. Probably, some people do not offer me any job opportunities because I have such a strong characterisation at the gender level, as it were, that they can say: that person is one of those who work on these issues, a troublemaker, let's just forget about her.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 27) One German interviewee asserted: 'for me it's clear that [Women's Studies] programmes are educating experts who are sorely needed but the question is whether institutions and relevant departments or government really want to pay [for that expertise]' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 35)

²³ See Sue Jackson (2001) for an account of the hostility Women's Studies endures in Britain, a country with a relatively high degree of institutionalisation of the subject. See also Dever, Cuthbert and Dacre (1999) for an international perspective.

3.4.2 Transferable knowledge and skills acquisition in Women's Studies

This denying behaviour on the students' part, founded on their perceptions of how prospective employers might view the content of their courses, is understandable. However, it is also the case that, as Dever and Day (2001) found, 'the majority of employers recruiting graduates with generalist degrees are far more interested in graduates' transferable personal and professional skills (i.e. confidence, communication skills, team working, creativity, verbal reasoning) than in the specific knowledge gained from their studies.' (Dever and Day, p. 60)²⁴ These skills are among the many that Women's Studies fosters. One UK student, for example, said: 'in terms of my own ability to work productively I've learnt a lot. . . I suppose I'm learning transferable skills, the kind of skills, you know, like working in a team when you're team-working. . . working independently, motivating yourself. . . and working to deadlines which is obviously a huge thing for a PhD student.' (Griffin 2003, p. 44) Among the many skills and dispositions students stated they had acquired, we found a significant degree of reported gains in, for instance, critical thinking, gender awareness and self-confidence as a function of Women's Studies training among the respondents (Table 9):

Table 9. Percentage of respondents reporting growth in *critical thinking*, *gender awareness*, and *self-confidence* following their Women's Studies course

Country	Critical Thinking		Gender Awareness		Self-Confidence	
	PS*	CS**	PS	CS	PS	CS
France	98	97	94	97	50	44
UK	96	99	93	94	81	68
Finland	95	100	98	97	74	69
Netherlands	95	96	96	98	73	63
Slovenia	91	91	81	82	69	59
Spain	90	84	88	84	53	49
Italy	87	94	91	94	63	67
Germany	87	92	91	94	72	56
Hungary	82	87	81	89	53	48

***PS = Past students; **CS = Current students**
Source: Quantitative data reports, EWSI Project 2003.

The particularly marked growth in critical thinking and gender awareness, but also in self-confidence - on the whole more marked among students in countries where Women's Studies is well established (the UK, Netherlands, Germany, Finland) than where Women's Studies lacks visibility and is less well established (France, Hungary, Spain), and more marked among past than among current students, possibly because past students have more experience of the impact of that growth in their post-training context - constitutes important tools in both accessing the labour market and in determining everyday working practices among the former Women's Studies students. One German interviewee said: 'what I've learnt will really be needed by

²⁴ It is important to treat employers' views of what they want in employees with some caution; as Deborah Cameron's (2000) *Good to Talk? Living and Working in a Communication Culture* graphically demonstrates, not only is there a gap between universities' and other employers' understanding of what the terms they use to describe the skills they try to inculcate on the one hand and look for on the other mean, but there is also a significant gap between what employers say they want and what they interpret that to mean on the ground.

society. And that includes the confidence in finding a job somewhere.’ (Schmidbauer et al 2003, p. 36)

The growth in critical thinking was perceived to be uniformly high among all respondents, partly fostered by Women’s Studies’ critical stance in relation to traditional forms of knowledge production and its interrogative position, partly because having to defend the subject and engage persistently with critiques both within and about the discipline fosters the ability to argue effectively.

The growth in gender awareness reported is key not only for dealing with gender issues in the workplace but also for greater tolerance towards diversity in the workplace. As will be shown below, respondents reported significant impacts on how they conduct themselves at work as a consequence of the acquisition of these skills and knowledges (see Table 21).

These impacts should stand students in good stead as they enter the labour market. However, as Dever and Day (2001) indicate, and we found in our study, students’ sense of what employers want is less focused on the skills they acquire than on the content of the subject they have taken. It suggests that students need to be taught to recognize more clearly, and name, the vocational strengths gleaned from Women’s Studies (Schniedewind 1993). As Dever and Day put it: ‘the personal is also vocational’ (p. 61). And as one of our Spanish interviewees put it: ‘[Women’s Studies] impacts on everything. And of course, it is very difficult to separate professional life from personal life, because the margins are not clear. Because [at]. . . my workplace, I’m not an automat, I’m still a person, with feelings. And, of course, my personal life is also here [at work], I have friends and relationships. . . So the line is not clear. . . [Women’s Studies] impacts on everything.’ (Suárez and Suárez 2003, pp. 4-5)

3.4.3 Analysing women’s employment histories

A comment needs to be made about the analysis of the respondents’ employment data in this project. In attempting to analyse the job descriptions they gave of their employment prior, during, and after their Women’s Studies training we found that those descriptions made it very difficult to fit the respondents into the conventionally used employment categories since these are based on a male employment model centring on employment that is traditionally carried out by men and cramming women together under the category ‘Service Industries’ which is where roughly 80% of European women are located. We therefore argue that conventional employment categories are gender-insensitive and thus inadequate to mapping women’s labour market participation adequately. In the project we decided to use ISCO-88 (*International Standard Classification of Occupations*)²⁵ as its conceptual framework has two parameters, the kind of work performed and the level of skill involved.²⁶ This in theory enables a more detailed analysis of the levels at which women work. However, the potential for refinement is marred by the lack - within traditionally

²⁵ ISCO-88 distinguishes 10 major employment groups: 1. legislators, senior officials and managers; 2. professionals; 3. Technicians and associate professionals; 4 clerks; 5. Service workers and shop and market sales; 6. Skilled agricultural and fishery workers; 7. Craft and related trades workers; 8. Plant and machine operators and assemblers; 9. Elementary occupations; 10 armed forces.

²⁶ For further elaborations on this framework see Hanmer and Wigglesworth 2003.

female employment areas - of sub-classifications that classify women's jobs adequately compared to the much more accurate classification of traditionally male jobs. In addition, the potential for refinement is marred by the fact that the socio-cultural meanings of jobs, ie their relative level of prestige, are not adequately captured by these classifications. The meaning of being 'a civil servant' for instance, which in many European countries is highly desirable because of the privileges and benefits attached, is not adequately addressed within this scheme. Moreover, many of our respondents gave job descriptions that did not neatly fit into one of the (sub-)categories proposed by ISCO-88 due to the lack of refinement within relevant employment groups. We therefore relied on a combination of the questionnaire data and the interview data to determine the results of this project.

3.4.4 The employment histories of Women's Studies students *prior to their Women's Studies training*

In analysing the impact of Women's Studies training on women's employment, we need to understand the sample's relation to the employment market. Contrary to the notion that a distinction can be made between those in education and those in employment, and that these two are successive, we found that significant numbers of our respondents had had some form of employment prior to entering Women's Studies courses (see Table 10), during their studies (Dröglin et al 2003), and of course, following on from their training.

One of the characteristics of Women's Studies students is their expectation that they will work, an expectation significantly different from that of their mothers in a number of European countries such as Italy, the Netherlands, and Spain. Students thus frequently came to Women's Studies with prior work experiences (Table 10):

Table 10. Percentage of questionnaire respondents in employment prior to undertaking Women's Studies training

Country	Past students			Current students		
	Total % in employment	Ft*	Pt**	Total % in employment	Ft*	Pt**
UK	81	67	33	80	58	42
France	72	49	51	42	32	68
Spain	63	44	56	62	37	63
Finland	53	36	64	38	25	75
Germany	51	68	32	60	47	53
Hungary	46	33	67	34	71	29
Italy	45	29	71	48	39	61
Netherlands	43	33	67	56	23	77
Slovenia	26	92	8	16	100	-

*Ft = full-time; **Pt = part-time
Source: Quantitative Data Reports, EWSI project 2002.

The generally higher number of past students in employment prior to undertaking Women's Studies is partly associated with the higher rate of women returners into education among past than among present students, with past students having been more likely than current students to have left their first education earlier to go into employment, having had a career break, or a family.

If one correlates the employment histories of the respondents with their age profile (Table 11), it is evident that employment prior to undertaking Women’s Studies training is partly associated with the age of the respondents whilst revealing, simultaneously, other traits, particular national circumstances.

Table 11. Average age of questionnaire respondents in 2002

Country	Past students	Current students	Age difference between past and current students in years
UK	42	30	12
Netherlands	37	29	8
Germany	35	28	7
France	33	24	9
Spain	32	24	8
Finland	31	23	8
Italy	30	31	- 1
Slovenia	29	24	5
Hungary	26	23	3
AVERAGE-9*	32.6	26.2	6.4
*AVERAGE-9 = mean age across all nine countries Source: Quantitative Data Reports, EWSI project 2002.			

Given the high average age profile of the UK past students, for instance, being educated in a system that has relatively short education spans (7 years secondary schooling; 3 years for the normal undergraduate degree), it is clear that many of the respondents were so-called mature students who returned into education after significant breaks away from education, mostly in employment but also looking after dependents. This is borne out by the interview data (Griffin and Hanmer 2002). The average age of the Dutch respondents was also relatively high but their labour market participation prior to doing Women’s Studies comparatively low, a function of the specific history of women’s participation in the labour market in the Netherlands (van der Sanden and Waaldijk 2002) where women are less likely to be in full-time employment than in the UK or Finland, for instance (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003).

3.4.5 Employment of Women’s Studies students *during* their Women’s Studies training

In countries such as France, Germany, increasingly the UK, and others it is common for students to work while they are studying, both at undergraduate and at postgraduate level (Table 12):

Table 12. Percentage of questionnaire respondents who were current Women's Studies students in paid employment during their studies (figures for 2002).

Country	% of questionnaire respondents in paid employment	Average age of questionnaire respondents
Germany	74	28
Netherlands	67	29
UK	63	30
Finland	59	23
France	48	24
Italy	40	31
Spain	35	24
Slovenia	20	24
Hungary	15	23

Source: Summary reports on quantitative data, EWSI project 2002.

The differences in paid employment rates of current students during their studies indicated in Table 12 are partly explained by the age groups in the samples. On the whole, the younger the sample, the less likely they were to work while studying. However, it is also clear that histories of female work cultures and availability of work play a role here. For example, significantly more current Finnish students were in paid employment during their studies than their Hungarian or Italian counterparts. We thus have the relatively new figure of the *student worker*, a hybrid whose employment trajectory cannot simply be measured in terms of successive life stages.

3.4.6 Postgraduates as employees

In some countries such as Finland, the Netherlands, Hungary and Slovenia postgraduate students undertaking PhDs and/or teaching duties are considered employees rather than students. Indeed, as our research showed, PhD scholarships in Hungary and Slovenia, especially if funded through international resources such as the Soros Foundation, can provide a significantly greater income than equivalent university jobs in the local employment market. That in itself contributes to the status of funded PhD students in those countries as employees rather than as students (Drglin et al 2003, 8).

3.4.7 In-course work placements

Employment during one's studies needs to be distinguished from work placements which form part of one's studies. Since the discipline of Women's Studies is in most European countries rooted in histories of feminist activism (Silius 2002a), one might expect that work placements in organisations such as NGOs, women's organisations etc. might be a feature of Women's Studies training. However, we found (Table 13) that few Women's Studies courses require any form of work placements and what is more, that the number is declining from past to present students.

Table 13. Percentage of questionnaire respondents required to undertake work placements during their Women’s Studies training

Partner country	Past students		Current students	
	Obligatory work placement	Voluntary work placement	Obligatory work placement	Voluntary work placement
France	59	-	22	-
Germany	37	-	26	-
Netherlands	35	-	30	-
Slovenia	18	-	-	-
Italy	17	-	19	-
UK	9	-	2	-
Spain	8	-	-	-
Finland	5	-	-	-
Hungary	1	-	-	8

Source: Quantitative data reports, EWSI project 2003.

Where numbers of obligatory work placements are high as is the case in France, this is in some cases a function of the kind of course attended (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002), in other words a bias in the sample. We also think that some respondents confused the category ‘work placement’ – an in-course requirement – with working for a living while studying. Irrespective of these reservations, it is quite clear that few students were required to undertake any form of work placement during their training and, one might argue, such a requirement might be difficult to fulfil given the ‘student worker’ situation described above.

However, some interviewees who undertook a work placement said that one of the effects was to find out what their career interests were. Some of these students were also later able to obtain employment in the places where they had undertaken their work placement. Thus a Slovenian past student of Women’s Studies commented: ‘I was lucky that the counselling centre was beginning work at that time and I found my own place in the sun where I liked working and where I later got the opportunity to have a job.’ (Bahovec et al 2003, p. 40)

Some of the interviewees (the ‘mature’ or those doing postgraduate studies) talked about their participation in the academy as lecturers or teachers – work, to which they were invited by professors or assistant professors at various programmes of Women’s Studies. This was not considered practical training as such, but was related to their professional aspirations (e.g. the desire to teach) and, in some instances, led to subsequent employment in the academy. Overall, those students who did work placements found that these had a positive influence both on their ability to make realistic assessments of the labour market and in helping them consider their employment options and career interests. The project partners therefore recommend that such placements, possibly with some form of remuneration or funding attached, be considered more widely across Women’s Studies programmes in Europe.

3.4.8 Educational attainment and labour market participation

As previously indicated, women's levels of qualification impact directly on their labour market participation rates. As seen in Table 14, on average women are still less likely to obtain a higher education qualification than their male counterparts, especially in Germany, while the qualification levels of Finnish women are significantly higher than those of their male counterparts.

Table 14. Male and female education levels, 2002

	Pre-primary, primary and lower secondary Education		Higher secondary and post-secondary Education		Higher Education	
	Women	Men	Women	Men	Women	Men
Finland	24	27	41	44	36	29
France	38	33	37	44	24	23
Germany	22	13	60	58	18	29
Hungary*	40	28	48	61	12	11
Italy	56	55	33	35	10	10
Netherlands	36	29	42	44	22	27
Spain	59	58	17	18	24	25
Slovenia*	42	29	50	60	12	11
UK	21	16	51	54	29	30
EU-15**	38	33	41	44	21	23

NB: All data concerns men and women between the ages of 15 and 64
* 2000 data
**comparison of all 15 EU member states
Source: Eurostat (2001) Detailed tables "Emploi et marché du travail dans les pays d'Europe centrale" and Eurostat (2003a) *Communiqué de presse*, n° 27, 5th March 2003.

One of the major contributions Women's Studies has made is the encouragement of women into higher education, including postgraduate education where women tend to be under-represented, even in subjects in which they are over-represented at undergraduate level. In Germany, for example, half of the interviewed Women's Studies graduates remained in education after graduation. The postgraduate work of four doctoral candidates was 'financed by various scholarships. Five graduates [were] also scientific associates (with contracts for a maximum of five years) or with shorter contracts as post-doctoral assistants. One graduate [was] working free-lance as an academic. All graduates employed in higher education [were] engaged in Women's and Gender Studies. More than for any other group, this one found its studies to be a precondition for employment.' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 41) In France Women's Studies students were more likely to remain in education after graduation than their counterparts in other Social Sciences and Humanities disciplines (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003). The vast majority of students interviewed in the UK had undertaken postgraduate degrees (MA/PhD) in Women's Studies. If we accept the findings above that women with higher education across Europe are more likely than their less well qualified counterparts to be in employment (see Table 5), then Women's Studies as a discipline must be viewed as a key contributing discipline to the retention of women in higher education and in particular in postgraduate education.

3.4.9 Cross-generational differences in employment between Women's Studies students and their parents

In almost all European countries, the decision to remain in the education system or to leave school on reaching the age of 16 is largely determined by social background: 'Data show that social origin is a factor which, to a large extent, determines the chances of young people to continue schooling or to drop out of school at a young age. In all countries except Finland, the percentage of young people prematurely leaving the educational system is far higher among those whose parents have a low level of education than among those whose parents are more educated and the differences are very significant' (Eurostat, 2003b: 4). However, with the exception of Hungary, women have a much greater chance than their male counterparts of obtaining a qualification that is higher than that of their mother or father. Two immediate implications of these findings are a) that Women's Studies' encouragement of women to continue in(to) higher education improves women's labour market participation rates, and b) that the children of women who have taken Women's Studies training are themselves more likely to enter higher education, given the importance of parents' levels of education for their children's levels of education.

In our project we considered the differences in employment between questionnaire respondents and their parents (Hanmer and Wigglesworth 2002). We found that for both current and past students the occupational categories occupied by mothers and fathers demonstrate gendered horizontal and vertical job segregation. Fathers were not only more likely than mothers to occupy managerial positions, but were also in a wider range of occupations. There were exceptions to this. In Hungary, the occupational categories of the mothers of current students in relation to fathers reflected vertical job segregation, with mothers more likely to occupy a wider range of categories than fathers. In Spain fathers were not concentrated in managerial and professional categories, and both mothers and fathers of current students held almost identical proportions of managerial and professional jobs. Whilst higher education, as indicated above, is a route to professional and managerial occupations for women, only a longitudinal study of current students can show the extent to which this is realized by those students.

Amongst past students (see Table 15) we found that in Finland and the Netherlands the employment patterns of daughters was closer to that of their mothers than their fathers, indicating stability in horizontal and vertical job segregation. Daughters, however, could substantially out-perform their mothers. In Italy and France, whilst past students were closer to the occupational stratification of their mothers than their fathers, daughters out-performed their mothers in relation to the proportion of professional positions they occupied. In the UK in relation to managerial positions daughters were closer to their fathers and substantially out-performed their mothers. Fathers in the UK, however, continued to work in a wider range of occupations than mothers or daughters. In Hungary, whilst fathers were more likely to occupy managerial posts, mothers held a wider range of occupations. In Slovenia the occupational categories inhabited by mothers in relation to fathers reflected horizontal but not vertical job segregation. The same pattern occurred within the German sample, but daughters outperformed both parents in relation to the proportion in professional occupations. For Hungary and Slovenia, however, it was not clear that

daughters did better than either mothers or fathers in the labour market. This is, of course, a function of the transition of those societies from a centralist, egalitarian society with full employment and gender-equal access to the labour market to a market-led, capitalist one with varying unemployment rates and highly gendered access to the employment market. Spain provided a different range of occupations with few fathers or mothers in managerial or professional occupations. Daughters there out-performed both their parents. Overall then but not in every participating country, women with Women's Studies training tended to out-perform their mothers in terms of level of occupation reached, thus demonstrating a generational difference among women regarding access to the labour market.

Table 15. Past Women's Studies students' employment performance relative to their parents

Country	Daughters outperform* mothers	Daughters outperform fathers
Finland	Yes	No
France	Yes	No
Germany	Yes	Yes
Italy	Yes	No
Netherlands	Yes	No
Spain	Yes	Yes
UK	Yes	No
Hungary	Not clear	Not clear
Slovenia	Not clear	Not clear

*outperform = reach higher professional or managerial positions than their parents.
Source: Hanmer and Wigglesworth 2002.

However, women did not tend to occupy a wider range of occupations than their mothers had, and only in a very limited number of countries did they out-perform their fathers. This demonstrates the persistence of gender segregation in the labour market, especially - but not only - horizontally.

3.5 Women's Studies Training and Employment II: Post-training expectations and experiences

3.5.1 The Impact of Women's Studies training on the type of employment sought

Women's Studies training impacts on the kind of work women look for. Table 16 shows that almost 60% of past students from all project partner countries agreed that Women's Studies influenced the type of employment they sought – with considerable differences between the countries (from 19% in Hungary to 89 % in Germany):

Table 16. Percentage of respondents reporting impact of Women's Studies training on type of employment sought

Country	Yes		No		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Netherlands	58	77,3	17	22,7	75	100
UK	55	57,3	41	42,7	96	100
Germany	42	89,4	5	10,6	47	100
Finland	30	58,8	21	41,2	51	100
Italy	27	61,4	17	38,6	44	100
France	24	51,1	23	48,9	47	100
Slovenia	16	39	25	61	41	100
Spain	13	38,2	21	61,8	34	100
Hungary	5	19,2	21	80,8	26	100
Total	270	58,6	191	41,4	461	100

Source: Drglin et al 2003, p. 18.

Quite what this means is less clear, but it was evident from the interviews that Women's Studies students wanted to work in environments where their feminist views and women in general were respected, and where they felt they could make a difference. They thus tended to focus on people-, care- and education-centred employment, areas that are key to the future European economy with its ageing population and expansion of higher education which demands suitably qualified personnel in these areas. As one French interviewee put it: 'When I first started at University, I had no idea about what I wanted to do afterwards. Even today, I'm not absolutely sure what kind of job I want. At least I know that I want to work in something social [...] The DESS has encouraged a kind of militancy. There's something that makes you want to work in a field that isn't too neutral, something where you can be totally engaged with other people, something that has social consequences.' (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 59)

3.5.2 Looking for work

Since significant numbers of Women's Studies students undertake work both prior to and during their studies, their engagement with the labour market after their studies is often one of continuity rather than of *ab initio* entry. The questionnaire responses allowed us limited tracking of women's employment experiences²⁷ following on from their Women's Studies training (the emphasis here is on the past students), while the interview responses provided some in-depth understanding of those experiences. Our data (Table 17) show the following pattern of women looking for employment after completing their training: a third of past students looked for a job within weeks, 16% within a few months, and 10% took several years, whilst for around 40% the question was not relevant, either because they already had a job or because they decided to continue their studies, travel, or set up home.

²⁷ The limitation of the tracking was a function of the number of valid responses we received to what were both complex and detailed questions in the questionnaire.

Table 17. Past Women's Studies students' responses to how soon they looked for a job after completion of their training

Period within which job search commenced		Country									Total
		Germany	Hungary	Spain	Italy	Finland	Netherlands	France	Slovenia	UK	
Weeks	N	19	7	10	10	5	32	17	7	23	130
	% within country	45,2	31,8	32,3	28,6	11,1	45,7	37,0	25,0	30,7	33,0
Months	N	4	5	1	5	10	17	6	4	12	64
	% within country	9,5	22,7	3,2	14,3	22,2	24,3	13,0	14,3	16,0	16,2
Years	N		10		3	6	5	6	5	5	40
	% within country		45,5		8,6	13,3	7,1	13,0	17,9	6,7	10,2
Not relevant	N	19		20	17	24	16	17	12	35	160
	% within country			64,5	48,6	53,3	22,9	37,0	42,9	46,7	40,6
Total	N	45,2	22	31	35	45	70	46	28	75	394
	% within country	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

Source: Drglin et al, 2003.

3.5.3 Rejecting the male career model

Many respondents, especially during interview and particularly pronounced among German, Finnish and Italian interviewees, commented on the fact that they did not want to pursue what they thought of as a typically masculine kind of career, involving 'climbing the career ladder' and making progressively more money. As one Italian interviewee put it: 'Career is a word that, as such, sounds unpleasant to me. In fact, I would tend to say, "A career? No way, how sickening.'" However, if we consider it as a growth and a development, it certainly becomes important to me. Rather than a vertical career progression, I would be keener on something that deeply gratifies me. I'm not interested in holding a powerful position^[28]. . . I think it is important to deal with people on an equal footing' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 33). Another Italian interviewee said: 'I don't care if a woman is allowed to become a *carabiniere* and I don't think that it is much of an achievement.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 11) For these women, employment was not about doing the same jobs as men and doing them in the same way. Instead, they were concerned to make a difference.

²⁸ In an interesting and relevant text entitled *Failing the Future* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1998), American feminist Annette Kolodny has analysed the problematic of women, particularly feminist women, refusing to move into positions of power in order to act as change agents. She seeks to demonstrate how one can install feminist principles from a position of power and remonstrates with other feminists for failing to meet that challenge.

3.5.4 Women's Studies students' discourses on finding employment

In their comparative project report on 'The Professionalisation of Women's Studies Graduates in Europe' (2003) Silius and Tuori distinguished four types of discourses that Women's Studies graduates use to describe their move into post-Women's Studies training employment:

- A discourse of 'sheer luck' and 'pure chance' (arriving at a desired job seemingly without own agency)
- An idealistic discourse (focus on making a difference rather than making money or having a career; assuming high degree of self-determination)
- A realistic discourse (desire for a full-filling job moderated by negative assessment of labour market opportunities)
- A career-oriented discourse (clear goal-oriented ambitions and a sense of a high degree of agency)

These discourses through which the interviewees made sense of their employment trajectories and experiences did not necessarily reflect the actual process by which they arrived at their employment but rather highlighted their perceptions of their own agency, expectations and experiences of the labour market, and assessments of their opportunities within it. The four discourses were not necessarily mutually exclusive, nor did they necessarily reflect accurately what happened to students in the workplace (we found, for instance, that 'chance' or 'luck' had much less to do with what actually happened than interviewees imagined²⁹); rather, they indicate a range of (dis)positions, from viewing oneself as an agent shaping one's working life on the one hand, to being the object of circumstances on the other, from aspiration to experience. These discourses also reflected attitudes towards work which could include the rejection of the concept of a career where that seemed to gesture towards a male model of work involving long hours and making large amounts of money, or the embrace of the notion of a career understood by the Women's Studies graduates as a full-time, permanent, fulfilling job. The key desire of most of the interviewees in all partner countries was to find jobs where they could make a difference, which were demanding and cohered with their ideological disposition towards equality.

3.5.5 Professionalism

Silius and Tuori (2003) discuss the professionalism of Women's Studies graduates in terms of the competencies they acquire through Women's Studies. Women's Studies

²⁹ A Spanish current student, for instance, had not even considered the possibility of working in the field of equal opportunities. She was very surprised to get a job in a women's association: 'When I was doing my MA I thought 'it'll be impossible to find a job related to this', but then it happened' (Suárez and Suárez 2003, p. 27).

When asked what she did after completing her studies one German graduate working in a trade union said: 'this legal aid job in an attorney's office, this secretarial thing, it was simply a stop-gap for me. I just wanted to find any kind of job that allowed me to use my education. And it just so happened that this position was free and I applied.' When asked if she had planned to follow this career path, she responded: 'Well, it wasn't actually mapped out, but it was something I wanted, a dream I had, ... And then it just happened more like a coincidence that a job opened up. It was a coincidence that it happened like that.' Only when reminded that she had in fact taken steps that could lead to this result did she admit, 'Yes, OK. So it didn't just fall into my lap. I had to apply and take extra courses to qualify.' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, pp. 47-8).

students in all nine partner countries talked about certain competencies that they gain through their training which equip them for or enhance their work. One example is how women work in a different manner as a result of their Women's Studies training. Such professionalism might be distinguished from professionalisation, understood predominantly as the establishment of new professions. This is, however, not a clear-cut division. Professionalism, as a certain expertise, skills and knowledge, often means professionalisation for the individual student. As a collective phenomenon it can also lead to professionalisation, implying differentiation of the labour market into new professions. Professionalism is necessary across all forms of employment. It can refer, for example, to a librarian who works in a different manner as a result of her Women's Studies training. Professionalisation, on the other hand, references the emergence of specific Women's Studies jobs, such as in academia (within Women's Studies), equal opportunities, associations working with women's/feminist issues, etc. The issue of professionalisation will be discussed further below.

Many of the key skills Women's Studies students reported acquiring during their training such as critical thinking, analytic ability, and self-confidence (see Table 9) which enhance their professionalism are not specific to the discipline but may be acquired in a number of humanities and social sciences subjects. However, the multi- and interdisciplinarity of Women's Studies as well as its specific gender focus mean that students gain perspectives not available in other disciplines, directly related to the gender expertise they have. This opens them up to possibilities of change and diversity. One German graduate, for example, employed today in municipal politics, described the ability to analyse through feminist glasses as the most important result of her studies applied to her professional life. She said: 'Yes, simply to observe, also to analyse, how things work and then to reflect on the consequences to be drawn from it. Where can you expect change to start? And what will result from those changes, how will they affect the group, its goal or individual goals? So I would say that this skill in particular, to step back, to observe and to analyse helps a great deal' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 54).

3.5.5.1 The pervasive importance of gender expertise

Many interviewees across the partner countries commented on the all-pervasive importance of gender expertise which they regarded as central to every employment situation. An Italian current student, for instance, said: 'Any job needs it [gender expertise], I think. Not only for women though, but for everybody. It should start from teaching at junior high school levels upwards. Gender knowledge means questioning roles. This means that you can't work in education, from kindergartens to university, without questioning roles, taking them for granted. The same is true for any other professional context. Be it the tertiary sector or – why not – a factory. Just consider, for example, the importance of a gender perspective when interpreting migration processes in relation to employment' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 31).

3.5.5.2 Professionalisation

The professionalisation of Women's Studies graduates among the interviewees in this project, here understood as the creation and establishment of new professions, occurred in four contexts:

- The academy/feminist research
- Equal opportunities
- Women's organizations
- Upward occupational mobility

Of these the first three were also the preferred career options among the Women's Studies students we interviewed, with significant numbers of interviewees already undertaking such jobs. It should be noted that employment areas such as feminist research/academe, equal opportunities and women's NGOs have arisen largely since the 1970s and not least in response to feminist demand. They thus constitute new employment opportunities, to some extent developed in parallel with the institutionalisation of Women's Studies, and have offered one form of upward employment mobility for women.

3.5.5.3 Academe/feminist research

Entering academe emerged as the most popular career choice amongst the project's interviewees, of which a high number were or had been PhD students. It should be noted here that the researchers who were employed on this project themselves fell into this category:

Table 18. Project researchers' education and employment, 2003

Partner country	Going on to postgraduate work	Writing PhD	Post-doc researcher
Finland	X		
Italy	X		
Spain	X		
France		X	
Netherlands		X	
UK		X	
Germany			X
Hungary			X
Slovenia			X

The aspirations to enter academe or work as feminist researchers were in many countries only realizable by (re)turning to traditional disciplines since Women's Studies positions remain scarce in all European countries. According to the project's background data reports (Griffin 2002) a high degree of integration of Women's Studies within traditional disciplines (eg in Germany) tends to imply more Women's Studies positions, albeit as part of other disciplines, than a high degree of autonomy (eg Finland). Whilst this suggests the benefits of mainstreaming it also invisibilizes the discipline, subsuming it under other disciplinary umbrellas. In countries with low degrees of institutionalization of Women's Studies such as France, Hungary, and

Slovenia, specialization in the subject made students vulnerable on the academic employment market.

Importantly, many interviewees mentioned that the inter-disciplinarity which Women's Studies entails was sometimes seen as a limitation to one's academic competence rather than as an extension thereof. This highlights the traditionalist attitudes that prevail in many universities.

3.5.5.4 Equal opportunities³⁰

Differences regarding the level, history and type of institutionalisation of equal opportunities in the project partner countries are considerable and directly related to the countries' point of entry into the EU. Countries such as the UK, Finland, and Germany with high levels of equal opportunities institutionalisation, also have a long history of equal opportunities-related work. Hungary, Italy, France and Slovenia, on the other hand, belong to countries with a recent development in equal opportunities. Particularly in the Italian and Dutch cases it was clear that the professionalisation of equal opportunities depends on the political climate. In 2003 both countries have governments that are not very supportive of equal opportunities. This is what one Italian past student, who also noted the importance of regional differences (important in Germany, Italy and Spain), said: 'Yes, there are many of them (job opportunities), but there are differences. For example, I know that Tuscany is much better than Lazio. In part, it also depends on the local traditions /.../ In Florence there is a Women's Unit, while in Rome there isn't one /.../. Unfortunately, the government plays a role. Until the last government, the Ministry for Equal Opportunities worked, now it's a real mess.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 32).

In all nine project partner countries, independent of the level of institutionalisation, the number of positions in the strictly defined sector of equal opportunities was low. The level of institutionalisation is, however, important with regard to the visibility of equal opportunities, including students' perceptions of job opportunities within that sector. Additionally, the relationship between Women's Studies and equal opportunities plays a role in job opportunities for Women's Studies graduates as well as in how Women's Studies graduates perceive these opportunities. In Italy the relationship between Women's Studies and equal opportunities is close (Barazzetti et al 2002, p. 207) and there is an increasing interest in gender training for equal opportunities employees. There has also been a rise in equal opportunities measures, and the awareness of equal opportunities as a job possibility among the interviewees was strong in Italy. This was lacking in the other countries. In the Netherlands there are many equal opportunities institutions, but the relationship between Women's Studies and equal opportunities is rather distant and women are not likely to see equal opportunities as a career option. Two Finnish students had an employment history in equal opportunities, which is by no means representative considering the few positions in the field of equal opportunities. At present the relationship between Women's Studies and equal opportunities is rather distant in Finland too. In France several women were working within equal opportunities. This was due to the recent

³⁰ Since the project posited a close relationship between the institutionalization of equal opportunities, Women's Studies training, and women's employment, a more extended discussion regarding that inter-relationship is offered in section 3.6 of this report.

increase of equal opportunities positions, as well as a bias in the selection of the interviewees. In Slovenia gaining a position in any state institution (including the Commission for Equal Opportunities) is difficult and there are very few positions. This is also the case in Hungary but it is worth mentioning that following on from this project the Hungarian researcher moved to the position of head of department for gender equality in the newly established Hungarian Ministry of Equal Opportunities.

In contrast to Italy, in countries with medium or high levels of institutionalisation of equal opportunities, equal opportunities employers generally do not require or regard gender expertise as a qualification for jobs in this area. In Finland, France, Spain and the UK gender expertise is not a job requirement. Positions can also be closely linked to political power, which is exemplified by this Spanish past student's comment: 'There's no real equal opportunities. Only on paper. /.../ Equal opportunities is being used as a political strategy /.../ usually the jobs related to gender are political posts where no training is required. I think women's groups should demand that they require specific training for those jobs.' (Suárez and Suárez, 2003, p. 8).

In the UK as well as in Germany, however, training in gender issues was organised for equal opportunities employees. In Italy and Spain equal opportunities are perceived as something that must be enhanced in order to reach the level of the more institutionalised countries of the EU. It is likely that this 'reaching the EU level' will also affect Hungary and Slovenia when joining the Union. Finland, on the contrary, has a rather opposite stance by claiming to be one of the most 'equal' countries in Europe, even if the results of the EWSI background studies do not quite support this view (Griffin 2002). In sum, it is possible that the employment opportunities in the specific sector of equal opportunities will increase in countries with low levels of institutionalisation, while countries with a high level of institutionalisation may feel that the sector is already fully developed.

Whilst equal opportunities has been dealt with in a narrow sense above, restricted to government, regional bodies, municipalities and organisational bodies (e.g. universities) that are explicitly working with equal opportunities, other jobs linked to equal opportunities exist, for instance in trade unions, or as on-the-job training that plays an important role in Germany. This is where many of the German graduates were involved already while studying because of specific political interests. Indirect involvement in equal opportunities, even if the work did not explicitly have to do with it, played a role in France, for example, where the interviewees were able to introduce women's or gender issues at work. Freelancing or self-employment through consultancy work, monitoring or evaluating equal opportunities measures also constitute new fields for Women's Studies graduates.

3.5.5.5 Working in women's NGOs

Some interviewees, especially in Hungary, Finland and Slovenia had worked for or intended to work for women's NGOs. Work in such organisations means working on issues directly concerning women from a feminist perspective. It is innovative work where women can use their Women's Studies skills and knowledge. Working in women's organisations is concerned with the notion of improving and transforming women's lives. Interestingly, a major - and one of the few - women's organisations in

Hungary, NANE, which works on violence against women, offers Women's Studies training in return for work in the organisation (Juhász 2003). Significantly, countries with no history of a second-wave women's movement such as Hungary tend to have few women's NGOs. This confirms the co-terminus relationship between the emergence of Women's Studies and of such organisations.

The downside of this kind of work is low income, insecure working conditions, lack of career perspectives, and often an overload of work. NGOs seem to be most important in the two countries with the lowest degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies, in Hungary and Slovenia. In Slovenia, Women's Studies is not limited to academia. There were examples of women who first worked as volunteers in an NGO, wrote a thesis with a relevant topic and later found work in this field. However, in both countries this was a somewhat marginal work trajectory. Although the UK sample included only a few women working in women's NGOs, this is a large employment sector in Britain, and Women's Studies students enter it.

The three preferred career options of Women's Studies students, especially postgraduates, of academe/feminist research, equal opportunities or working in women's NGOs, are beset by problems recognised by the students. These problems include short-term insecure employment and few permanent job openings in academe; low incomes, insecure employment, and lack of career prospects in women's organisations; and, most surprisingly, as will be discussed in greater detail below, lack of employment opportunities in equal opportunities. Women's willingness to take on such employment bespeaks three things:

- Their willingness to take risks in employment.
- Their desire to work in environments that are sympathetic to women's concerns.
- Their focus on 'making a difference' as opposed to 'having a career' in the narrow sense of climbing a promotional ladder and making lots of money.

The first notion, that of taking risks in employment in choosing insecure, often short-term employment, is already partly indicated through students' choice of Women's Studies in the first place – a choice problematized by the low status of the discipline in academe, many people's hostility towards the discipline, its single-sex status in predominantly secular, co-educational systems, and its overt transformative agenda. All of this means that students who choose Women's Studies are likely to be independent-minded, willing to experience something new and different, more willing to take risks. These are clearly assets in the more flexible labour market Europe now faces.

3.5.5.6 Professionalisation as upward employment mobility

One definition of professionalisation is upward employment mobility, for instance through climbing the career ladder or changing jobs. The conditions that influence such mobility are country specific. First of all, the amount of mature students, which in this report means women with an extended work history prior to their Women's Studies training, varied greatly among the countries. In the UK mature students formed a significant proportion of the interviewees. Their type of training was also significantly different. In the UK and in France there were several women with specialist training (DESS in Gender and Social Policy in France and different MAs in the UK) which leads to a specific profession. Most of the other students (also many

women in these two countries), however, had a generalist education, comparable to other university education in humanities and social sciences.

Women who entered Women's Studies training more or less directly after secondary education, did not speak about 'changing career' or 'climbing the career ladder' as a result of the Women's Studies training, as they did not have a previous career. In the UK, however, there was a significant proportion of interviewees (75%) who completely changed jobs, got promotion, or entered the labour market after having been at home for many years. One British past student who was contracted to do research on women and health after her degree said: 'I wouldn't have had access to that [research work] had I not done research /.../ in a formal setting with Women's Studies. I think having a Women's Studies degree gives me a good skills mix' (Griffin 2003, p. 47). Another past student was headhunted 'because I was the only one with a degree, there were only two of us in the country' (Griffin 2003, p. 44). These examples show a direct impact of Women's Studies training which was also part of a deliberate plan when these women decided to study. The British case further gives many examples of career advancement (teacher to head of department) as well as movement from insecure to more secure jobs. Among them one can find housewives who returned to or entered the labour market. There are social workers, health workers and teachers who through postgraduate education moved into more qualified jobs such as teachers of health workers, lecturers etc. Professional mobility sometimes included complete changes of job (distribution manager to head of a college department), promotion within the same field (social work manager to senior social work manager) and acquisition of qualifications that were considered necessary to enter or sustain a career (especially in education, the health service, the voluntary sector).

3.5.6 First destinations: professional employment

These shifts are borne out by the project's quantitative data³¹ which indicate that greater numbers of students enter professional jobs after their graduation than have such jobs whilst they are studying (Drglin et al 2003, pp. 7-12); whereas a third of students was in professional jobs whilst studying, two thirds of students (see Table 19) found professional employment as their first job after completing their training:

³¹ The questions dealing with employment in the questionnaire were very complex and answered only by a proportion of the respondents. The results discussed here therefore refer only to the valid answers received, and percentages indicated are percentages of those valid answers.

Table 19. First employment after Women's Studies training (secondary analysis).

Job code		Country									Total
		Germany	Hungary	Spain	Italy	Finland	Netherlands	France	Slovenia	UK	
Legislators; senior officials; managers	N	1	-	-	-	1	8	-	1	4	15
	% within job code	6,7%	-	-	-	6,7%	53,3%	-	6,7%	26,7%	100%
	% within country	3,4%	-	-	-	2,4%	14%	-	5%	6,3%	4,9%
Profession- als	N	19	10	22	14	29	35	11	12	38	190
	% within job code	10%	5,3%	11,6%	7,4%	15,3%	18,4%	5,8%	6,3%	20,0%	100%
	% within country	65,5%	90,9%	75,9%	73,7%	70,7%	61,4%	30,6%	60,0%	60,3%	62,3%
Technicians; associate profession- als	N	3	1	3	1	2	5	17	2	10	44
	% within job code	6,8%	2,3%	6,8%	2,3%	4,5%	11,4%	38,6%	4,5%	22,7%	100%
	% within country	10,3%	9,1%	10,3%	5,3%	4,9%	8,8%	47,2%	10%	15,9%	14,4%
Clerks	N	5	-	-	1	8	9	-	4	8	35
	% within job code	14,3%	-	-	2,9%	22,9%	25,7%	-	11,4%	22,9%	100%
	% within country	17,2%	-	-	5,3%	19,5%	15,8%	-	20%	12,7%	11,5%
Service workers; shop/market sales workers	N	1	-	3	3	1	-	7	-	3	18
	% within job code	5,6%	-	16,7%	16,7%	5,6%	-	38,9%	-	16,7%	100%
	% within country	3,4%	-	10,3%	15,8%	2,4%	-	19,4%	-	4,8%	5,9%
Elementary occupations	N	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	1	-	3
	% within job code	-	-	33,3%	-	-	-	33,3%	33,3%	-	100%
	% within country	-	-	3,4%	-	-	-	2,8%	5%	-	1%
Total	N	29	11	29	19	41	57	36	20	63	305
	% within job code	9,5%	3,6%	9,5%	6,2%	13,4%	18,7%	11,8%	6,6%	20,7%	100%
	% within country	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

Source: Drglin et al (2003).

The table indicates that two thirds of valid responses about first destinations among Women's Studies students following the completion of their training were in professional occupations, a very high rate of movement into those occupations. This trend towards moving into professional occupations increased from the first to the second and third job women held once they completed their training.

This does not mean that the students all worked in Women's Studies related fields but it shows that their training led them into professional jobs. The questionnaires and interviews from all countries indicate that past Women's Studies students entered a variety of professions (for more on the Women's Studies qualifications see Le Feuvre, 2000), including trade union officialdom, project management, research, social work and social work management, librarianship, teaching at school, further, and higher education levels, counselling, archivism, the police force. Past Women's Studies students had very diverse professions/jobs, as well as diverse careers. Not only does this show that they are highly employable, but it also indicates the positive effect a Women's Studies programme can have. For instance, in the Netherlands, 'looking at the current jobs of past students interviewed, 10 women ended up in the public sector, 5 in the private sector, the other women [were] working for an association, a church-institution, as a free-lancer, looking for work, and labour disabled. There [were] two women who next to their job [had] their own business. /.../ Many women [were] (sometimes in addition to their paid labour) actively engaged in voluntary work that is related to Women's Studies/emancipation/feminism, for instance editorial work for a

feminist magazine or working in a meeting project with foreign women.’ (van der Sanden 2003, p. 20)

More than half (57,1 %) of those surveyed in all countries who answered the question about what they had done immediately after finishing Women’s Studies said they were employed. The differences between the countries were great – in Finland for example one third were employed and in the UK almost 80%. There were also significant differences among countries regarding the type of job women had – in the Netherlands, for example, 53% of past students were first employed in jobs under the code ‘Legislators, senior officials and managers’, in the UK 27%; in Germany, Finland and Slovenia around 6%, and in Netherlands, Italy, France, Hungary and Spain none. Finally, the questionnaires indicate great differences between individual countries among past students as regards part-time or full-time employment (for example in Finland the ratio of part-time to full-time work was 3 : 7, in the Netherlands 7 : 3). This difference seems to be related to the general patterns of women’s employment in the individual countries.

These data exclude significant numbers of Women’s Studies students who continued their studies after their initial Women’s Studies training. About 50% of those past students who were not employed immediately after their Women’s Studies course continued to study (for an MA, for example), 15 % were registered as unemployed, 10% did voluntary work, fewer (all answers below 10 %) took care of children or other dependent persons, stayed at home (up to not more than two years) or something similar (see Table 20):

Table 20. Women’s Studies students’ activities other than employment following their training*

		Country									Total
		Germany	Hungary	Spain	Italy	Finland	Netherlands	France	Slovenia	UK	
Education	N	6	18	7	14	23	9	2	11	8	98
	%	46,2	78,3	58,3	66,7	82,1	21,4	13,3	55,5	44,4	51
Stayed at home	N	2	1	0	0	0	1	0	1	2	7
	%	15,4	4,3	0	0	0	2,4	0	5	11,1	3,6
Voluntary work	N	0	3	2	1	1	8	1	3	1	20
	%	0	13	16,7	4,8	3,6	19	6,7	15	5,6	10,4
Registered unemployed	N	0	0	2	0	3	10	6	4	2	27
	%	0	0	16,7	0	10,7	23,8	40	20	11,1	14,7
Cared for children/Dependents	N	1	1	0	4	1	5	0	0	1	13
	%	7,7	4,3	0	19	3,6	11,9	0	0	5,6	6,8
Other	N	4	0	1	2	0	9	6	1	4	27
	%	30,8	0	8,3	9,5	0	21,4	40	5	22,2	14,1
Total	N	13	23	12	21	28	42	15	20	18	192
	%	6,8	12	6,3	10,9	14,6	21,9	7,8	10,4	9,4	100

*Multiple responses were possible. 160 past students answered, giving 192 answers.

Source: Drglin et al 2003, p. 15.

The figures in the table above are partly explained by the age of the respondents and the levels of education they had attained as well as by the national gendered specificities of the employment market. Overall, where women were not engaged in paid labour following on from their studies, they did unpaid labour. Respondents from the Netherlands in particular stood out because of the proportionately relatively high number of women engaged in voluntary work.

Most of those who registered as unemployed remained so for one year or less. However, the overall employment profile of the respondents also identifies not only the process of early career stages with frequent changes in employment, but also the new flexibility, instability and impermanence of the labour market. Thus the duration of first employment after taking part in a Women's Studies course was one year or less for almost 60 % of those surveyed, two years for 15% per cent, and longer only for increasingly smaller percentages. The second employment lasted a year or less for more than half of those surveyed. Two thirds of past students who had a third employment were employed for a year or less. The fact that even the third employment was short-term can hardly be attributed to subjective factors.³²

Self-employment of past Women's Studies students grew steadily with the number of jobs held. Among first-time employees 16 % were self-employed, with the second job this rose to 19 %, and with the third to almost a quarter. The decision to become self-employed may have been related to the general insecurity of the job market but was also related to feelings of being secure, being backed-up by the whole family, etc. In the interviews, the need for new specific jobs, sometimes created with the help of Women's Studies students themselves, was emphasised repeatedly. Some students (undergraduates and postgraduates) who were active in NGOs while studying later found employment with these organisations. In Slovenia, for example, in the last ten years, some new job opportunities have appeared. One current postgraduate student was employed for a time as a counsellor at the Association Against Violent Communication where she had worked as a volunteer while still a student (Bahovec et al 2003, p. 40).

In Hungary, where there is a problem with finding a job, 'the novelty of gender studies, its connection to feminist activism requires people who are creative and inspired, with a pioneer spirit. Exactly because of these qualities they will be able to overcome such "trifling" difficulties as no jobs available. One student said: "I don't have an insight into this [whether or not it is possible to find jobs with feminism]. Most probably there are some from the feminists, who can find work for themselves, or I should rather say, you can create work for yourself." (Juhász 2003, p. 7.)

If we compare the first, second and third employment on the basis of the analysis of the questionnaires filled in by the past students from all countries only slight changes in percentage are seen in individual groups of occupations. There is no distinctive trend. An exception is the percentage of those, who are employed under the code 'elementary occupations' - this reduces with the second employment and disappears with the third.³³

³² However, it has to be borne in mind that some of the surveyed students had only recently completed their studies at the point of interview, and it is therefore not possible to offer a long-term analysis of their labour market participation.

³³ The kind of employment past Women's Studies students from all project partner countries had changed from the first to the third job as follows: 'professionals' grew from 62% in the first employment to 63% with the second and 65% with the third. The percentage of employed past students employed under the code 'legislators, senior officials and managers' moved from 5 % with the first job to 6 % with the second, and back to 5,2 % with the third. The percentage of 'clerks' changed from the first employment where it reached over 10%, to 12 % in the second, and around 9,4 % in the third. The percentage of 'service workers and shop and market sale workers' stayed the same at 6 % with the first

A comparison of employment patterns between past and current students shows differences in the employment patterns between the two groups – past students are employed in more demanding, more responsible and independent jobs than current students. This is an expected and presumably general pattern of employment dynamics, where students are employed in less demanding and responsible jobs whilst studying and immediately after finishing education.

3.6 The impact of Women’s Studies training on how work is carried out

The impact of Women’s Studies was greatest on how students carried out their work rather than on the work they sought. As one woman put it:

Having gender training can’t change the labour market. . . A different thing is that having a feminist training you can influence things from your job. I think that’s possible. A woman will not have an important influence merely through being a woman. A feminist woman will – but once you have your job. And the more of us feminists there are. . . the more possibilities of influencing and making decisions we’ll have. . . So from the inside you may influence things if you have a feminist conscience. (Suárez and Suárez 2003, pp. 20-1)

Table 21 indicates the percentage of questionnaire respondents who reported an impact of their Women’s Studies training on how they carry out their work:

Table 21. Percentage of respondents* reporting impact of Women’s Studies training on how they carry out their work

	Past students	Current students
Netherlands	90	76
France	85	59
Germany	84	66
UK	84	60
Spain	83	41
Italy	82	62
Finland	69	80
Slovenia	63	60
Hungary	45	52

* For actual numbers of total sample please refer to Table A in footnote 2.
Source: Quantitative data reports, EWSI Project 2003.

Both for past and for current students (many of whom in countries such as Germany, France, and the UK as indicated previously work whilst studying), the percentage of women reporting an influence of their training on how they carry out their work was high. With an average percentage of 76%, just over three quarters of past students reported that impact; whilst an average of 62% (nearly two thirds) of current students did. Figures are higher for past students since overall they have more and longer work experiences than present students. They are lowest for past students in countries (Slovenia, Hungary) where Women’s Studies is not well established, and for current

and second job, and grew slightly with the third where it was 7 %. The percentage in ‘elementary occupations’ moved from 1 % to 0,6 % with the second employment, and was 0% with the third job.

students where Women's Studies is not highly visible (ie France) and where students enter degree courses straight from school rather than as mature students.

Women's Studies training had such an impact because students felt it impacted on all aspects of their lives (eg Suárez and Suárez 2003, pp. 1-2).

What then was the nature of the impact Women's Studies had on how women carried out their work? In the interviews, women with Women's Studies training reported that they tended to

- Stand up for themselves or others when discriminated against,
- Refuse to put up with sexism at work,
- Feel more confident in making applications for promotion or different jobs,
- Begin to carry out their work in a non-sexist manner (eg as teachers),
- Become more tolerant towards diversity,
- Introduce gender issues into work, and
- be more supportive of female colleagues.

This was evident from the interviews as the following quotations show.

3.6.1 Standing up for oneself or others when discriminated against

Our data show that Women's Studies training enhanced women's ability to fight discrimination in the workplace and outside. A UK interviewee, for example, said: 'I suppose I was aware of gender discrimination. . . in terms of helping me identify, articulate it and challenge it, yes, that's, that's been an evident benefit.' (Griffin 2003, p. 35) Another UK interviewee said: 'I am much more conscious of discrimination em, there are times when I just, whereas I know before I would have just thought oh well that's not fair. Now I, I think well that's not fair and actually I could do something about it. Em, and whilst I might only do things that are kind of small scale, it might just be going to the head teacher and explaining that there is a problem and saying that I'm concerned. . .' (Griffin 2003, p. 36)

3.6.2 Refusing to put up with sexism at work

Women's Studies graduates are less likely to put up with sexism in the private or the public sphere than they were prior to their training. A German interviewee, for instance, stated: 'if I notice anything sexist in my private sphere I go jump on the barricades. Or I say to friends when I hear it's going on at work, I say, you don't have to stand for that. So I'm doing this kind of enlightenment work.' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 66)

A French interviewee reported: 'I was working as a newspaper journalist and the Chief Editor was this really awful guy. . . I'll always remember the way he harassed me, right up until the day I hit back. After that, he gave up on me but he didn't give me any more assignments either.' (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003, p. 23) Another French interviewee reported: 'I did have this boss who just used to turn up in my office and spend like two hours staring at my cleavage. . . I think that doing Women's Studies helped me to understand that all that was part of a wider question of power relations.' (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003, p. 23)

3.6.3 Feeling more confident in making applications for promotion or other jobs

The self-confidence students gained as a function of undertaking Women's Studies training enabled them to feel empowered to make applications for promotion or to move into other jobs. This correlates with the high percentage of Women's Studies students who moved into professional jobs following their training. As one Finnish interviewee put it: 'Women's Studies is a new discipline and there is not enough experience to look back on, so one has to be quite aggressive oneself and engaged in one's search for a job. . . one also has to be very flexible. And maybe invent one's own employment. . . it is a question of economic strategies and preferences.' (Tuori 2003, pp. 29-30)

Another Finnish interviewee recounted the following experience: 'with Women's Studies I can show that I have something else [than formal competence] as well, that I have this consciousness, that this is useful when applying for a job. And of course I claim, and I am of the opinion myself, that I have a broad basis of knowledge which I have acquired precisely through Women's Studies training. . . I saw the advertisement [for an equal opportunities job] and. . . noticed that my chances of getting the job were good and I applied and got it.' (Tuori 2003, pp. 33-4)

3.6.4 Carrying out one's work in a non-sexist manner

Among many interviewees, but in particular teachers, it was noticeable that one effect of their Women's Studies training was to make them very conscious of sexist work practices. In consequence, they attempted to work in a less sexist manner. An Italian interviewee, a past student, reported: 'I used the structure I had observed at NOISE [an EU-funded International Summer School in Women's Studies] seminars, together with what I learnt on the Masters course [in equal opportunities] in Milan. I reshaped my working methodology in the light of these experiences. . . I created some working groups with a methodology other than the one that characterises the company style, which is the leading training trend here.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 28)

A past student from Finland, working as an economics teacher, said: 'Economics is an optional subject [at the gymnasium] and a lot of girls have opted for it, even more than in the beginning. I can imagine one reason to be my somewhat dissenting attitude to the question of what is important in economics. . . I have tried to bring forward . . . issues like poverty. . . and how important it is to bring a female perspective to bear on them. . . I think this has drawn more girls than before. And perhaps my own experiences of what kinds of lectures I didn't want to participate in. . . have helped in trying to create a kind of milieu where everybody can speak and feel comfortable.' (Tuori 2003, p. 36)

3.6.5 Becoming more tolerant towards diversity

Women's Studies' students enhanced understanding of gender discrimination led, *inter alia*, towards a greater appreciation of diversity beyond gender. A Slovenian interviewee found: 'I have become quite a lot more tolerant to different forms of womanhood not just those that were near to me back when I was studying, that I am more ready to accept something which I didn't accept before.' (Bahovec et al 2003, p. 55)

A Dutch researcher said that Women's Studies had influenced her career opportunities and how she worked as a researcher positively because 'this broader outlook, being able to put things in perspective, I just think that by doing Women's Studies you become a better researcher. . . I really think that is the case. . . you acquire better competencies, better qualities as a researcher, because of that broad perspective, the crossing of boundaries and not thinking in stereotypes, which is a good feature for researchers.' (van der Sanden 2003, p. 21)

And an Italian interviewee stated: '[Women's Studies] taught us to become more tolerant and more receptive to other people's situations. More sensitive. All this – and being with other women in particular – has influenced me enormously. This experience taught me to have a different perspective and look for dialogue on some aspects I did not see before.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 42)

Importantly, the ability to deconstruct gendered stereotypes was also seen as something that generates competence to deconstruct *other* stereotypes such as race/ethnicity or sexuality, thus leading to greater degrees of tolerance and ability to engage with diversity. This was particularly evident in the Dutch and Italian contexts.

As one Dutch past student put it:

Because of Women's Studies, but also because of my own research, it became very clear how gender is connected to ethnicity, sexuality, class, and age. Maybe this list sounds obligatory, but partly from my research and partly in daily life I found out that it is not possible to say that gender is the most important structuring principle... That knowledge gives you tools to position yourself. . . And when you know something inside out, you also can make use of it for others... (van der Sanden 2003, p. 34).

3.6.6 Introducing gender issues at work

Importantly, following on from their Women's Studies training many interviewees attempted to introduce gender issues into their work place, thus raising awareness about the issues among colleagues and empowering them. A Spanish interviewee said: 'I've seen in my work, women with a feminist conscience who aren't militant in any group but have changed the language of clinical histories. . .' (Suárez and Suárez 2003, p. 20) Another Spanish interviewee said: 'Jobs are what they are and you have to adapt to them, but doing a job having a gender perspective is not the same as not having it. You don't see things in the same way.' (Suárez and Suárez 2003, p. 27)

A UK interviewee said: 'I think [the course] affected my work life more than my social life. . . I found that I was changing things when I was doing talks or giving lectures or doing workshops, em, I totally changed the twist, the accent. . . and made the students look at it from a feminist, if I dare use that word,. . . perspective.' (Griffin 2003, p. 37)

3.6.7 Offering greater support to female colleagues

Another effect of Women's Studies training was to make women more supportive of other women. One UK interviewee, for instance, talked about how she and colleagues had set up a women's group in her adult education institution in order to help female staff: 'there were a lot of things we were asking for, like the part-timers, most of the [women] were part-timers. They were being denied access to pensions and all sorts of other things and really taken advantage of, and the union didn't care because some of

them weren't in the union, and we were saying we can support each other through this, you know.' (Griffin 2003, p. 38)

A German interviewee, one of several for whom union-sponsored on-the-job-training in Women's Studies was key said: 'as a representative of youth and personnel I already knew where discriminatory mechanisms in our organisation lay. And I concerned myself with these topics, with the promotion of women. So it was pretty clear that that would be paramount in my course of study. . . And in addition to my courses I was active in union-sponsored training which permitted me to apply what I had learnt. I brought it into the seminars I taught.' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 40)

And a Finnish interviewee stated: 'I try to behave in a way that is in solidarity with women and also in solidarity with low-salary employees. . . The situation at my own work is that within the administration we are all women except the attendant. Within the school hierarchy we are at the bottom. . . Personal relations are rather inflamed, as well, and one's own frustration is also taken out on one's colleagues, and all that I try consciously to influence and I don't take part in it myself. . . here Women's Studies has had a great impact.' (Tuori 2003, p. 21)

3.6.8 Women as change agents in the work place

As the quotations under 3.5.1-3.5.7 indicate, many of the interviewees were teachers who began to import ideas and pedagogical styles they had met in their Women's Studies training into their education jobs. This highlighted the need for teachers at all levels to receive systematic gender training as part of their teacher training.

The changes in how Women's Studies students carried out their work were effected predominantly through the course content of their Women's Studies courses and through getting degrees. These included greater self-confidence, enhanced critical thinking and gender awareness as well as, importantly, a greater understanding of and ability to take action regarding equal opportunities.

The significance of these reported impacts on how women carry out their work following Women's Studies training cannot be over-estimated. It suggests that women with such training act as change agents in their work environment, irrespective of whether or not that work environment is Women's Studies centred. It underlines the importance of Women's Studies as a source of empowerment for women, and as a useful tool in bringing about much needed changes in the work environment which contribute towards greater equality in that context. Further research is needed not only to assess the long-term impact of such training but also to understand employers' perceptions of employees with such training, and of colleagues' perceptions and experiences of working with women who have Women's Studies training.

3.6.9 Women's Studies training and social change

As Griffin and Hanmer (2003) demonstrate, Women's Studies training impacted not only on women's employment but also on their domestic and social lives. Respondents reported changes in relationships with parents, children, and friends. Of these the most fraught were relationships with male partners. Nearly two thirds of respondents reported the need to review and re-write the domestic contract following on from their training as they strove towards greater equality in the home, involving

more sharing of domestic and care labour between heterosexual partners. Griffin and Hanmer's report (2003) clearly shows the need for more training directed at men from an early age to transform them from consumers to producers of domestic and care labour.

The most important transformation in women's social lives which impacted on their employment was the establishment of female friendship and mentoring networks during the Women's Studies training at local, national and international levels (Table 22):

Table 22. Reported experience of transformation of female friendship networks through Women's Studies training in percentages

	Current Students	Past students
Spain	70 (N = 83)	62 (N = 43)
NL	67 (N = 51)	66 (N = 80)
Germany	66 (N = 69)	78 (N = 56)
Italy	65 (N = 50)	77 (N = 50)
UK	64 (N = 83)	58 (N = 104)
France	60 (N = 71)	71 (N = 51)
Finland	55 (N = 35)	52 (N = 56)
Slovenia	41 (N = 50)	51 (N = 50)
Hungary	21 (N = 50)	31 (N = 51)

Source: Quantitative Data Reports, EWSI Project 2003.

How useful such contacts are to professional women was described by a 46-year old educator from Germany, employed in adult education: 'Well, in my first job I could completely apply everything I learned. Because I developed a course for women. So I planned it and carried it out. And if there was an aspect I hadn't mastered myself, I could call on a good network stemming from my university years. I knew a lot of women so I could quickly invite guest speakers.' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 43) And an Italian interviewee stated: 'I work in training. All these courses [in Women's Studies] gave me some useful ideas and more self-confidence. Through them I met Ms Laura Balbo [former Minister for Equal Opportunities] so it also worked on a relationship-building level. I ascribe my eagerness to be involved in a field like training to women's experience and especially to the experience of the collective. This resulted in a collaboration with other fellow trainees that, in some cases, has lasted to this day. . . The last course we organized stemmed precisely from this experience. I was able to "use" the network that was created during the NOISE [Women's Studies summer school] course.' (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 29)

As the two quotations indicate friendship networks could operate horizontally (among peers) and vertically (with more established figures). In the context of the latter a number of interviewees reported the importance certain professors had assumed in their lives in providing them with networking, employment and professional development opportunities. The importance of the female friendship networks that many of our interviewees developed related to the following three functions that such networks could fulfil in the work context:

- Act as sources of information and support on employment-related issues
- Act as sources of employment
- Act as role models for how to conduct work or act in the workplace

3.7 Women's Studies, equal opportunities and women's employment

Within the project the issue of the inter-relationship between Women's Studies, women's employment and equal opportunities occupied a special place since the project partners hypothesized that the degree of institutionalization of equal opportunities in a given country would correlate with the degree of institutionalization of Women's Studies and with women's employment opportunities. As will be indicated below, whilst this turned out roughly to be the case, the socio-political and economic histories of the partner countries played a major role in determining the precise relationship between the three.

3.7. 1. Processes of institutionalisation of equal opportunities

The process of the institutionalisation of equal opportunities across Europe is marked by the historical context of the different European countries after World War II, their political evolution since 1945, and their trajectory since 1975, the first International Year of Women and the year of the adoption of CEDAW (the Convention to End all forms of Discrimination Against Women). Two crucial factors in each country were the establishment of a democratic government and its date of entrance into the European Union.

Formal equality has been achieved in all nine project partner countries through three ways of legislating on equal opportunities: "through the constitution, through an equality act, or as part of another set of laws and regulations" (Silius, 2002a: 505). Some countries included the principle of equality in their national constitutions, especially from the second half of the 1940s, but this did not automatically lead to the implementation of equal opportunities. In fact, the process of achieving this principle in the rest of the legislative bodies took some time. Although in many countries a few steps towards equality in legislation were taken during the 1950s and 1960s, the second wave of the feminist movement in the decade of the 1970s marked the beginning of a new period of action towards equality, in which policies affecting women began to be understood in terms of equality instead of protection (Suárez and Suárez 2003, p. 6).

In the background data reports to the project (Griffin 2002a) we distinguished between two types of relevant public policy in the field of equal opportunities:

- Policies aimed at protecting women as mothers in certain areas such as the workplace (protective laws).
- Policies that expressly address the question of gender equality in all areas of social and political life (egalitarian laws).

Overall, we found that protective measures specifically for women tend to reproduce gender inequalities at all levels since the burden to even out work and domestic commitments falls to women. One French interviewee, for instance, reported: 'My mother always believed that she couldn't work and assume her role as mother and role model, because she really wanted to become a real "home-maker". Of course, she expected me to work, but she wanted me to become a primary school teacher, because she said that I would be able to look after my own children at the same time, to have

the school holidays and all that kind of thing. I think that my mother envisaged a fairly classic kind of future for me, with a job that would enable the combination of employment and family-life, to be a good home-maker, to know how to run a home.’ (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 21) The same expectations underpin the practice in France to enable women to take Wednesday afternoons off from work because that is the day when schools are closed in the afternoon. If equality between the sexes is truly to be achieved men need to be incentivised to take up domestic and caring roles in order to change the expectation, generally observed in and by our sample, that women alone remain responsible for creating a work-life balance.

In all European countries European legislation and directives regarding equal opportunities have been of central importance for the implementation and systematization of equal opportunities policies at national level (see for example Barazzetti, Leccardi et al 2003, pp. 7-8; Suárez and Suárez 2003, p. 5; Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 16). Despite this, our study showed that in 2002 equal opportunities institutionalization across the nine European partner countries varied as follows (Table 23):

Table 23. Degree of institutionalisation of equal opportunities in nine European countries

High	Germany, Netherlands, UK
Medium	Finland, Italy, Spain
Low	France, Hungary, Slovenia
<i>Source:</i> Silius 2002a.	

3.7.2 Gender expertise requirements in equal opportunities employment

Countries with high and medium degrees of institutionalization of equal opportunities tend to have posts such as Commissioners of Women’s Affairs (Spain), equality officers, ‘Frauenbeauftragte’ (Germany), ‘Rector’s Delegates for Women’ (Italy) etc. However, such equal opportunities posts do not in any country require gender expertise which one might consider to be a key requirement in any such job. It is thus not surprising that only in Germany did we find several examples of Women’s Studies students who were working in equality offices. There ‘eight of twenty interviewees [current Women’s Studies students] were employed in fields that have something to do with equality or the promotion of women.’ (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 8) But this was the exception. Indeed, those who did work in this field saw themselves as ‘lucky exceptions’ since the numbers of women we interviewed with gender expertise who wanted to work in equal opportunities jobs were not matched by the number of those who actually did. One Finnish interviewee, for instance, said: ‘one reason for me getting this job was that I had Women’s Studies training. But it is an extreme case because it could be said that this is an organization which deals exclusively with women’s questions.’ (Suárez and Suárez 2003, p. 21)

In the UK and in the Netherlands the mainstreaming effect of equal opportunities was visible. Subsumed under ‘human resources’ within organizations where equal opportunities is just one of many briefs, equal opportunities was effectively invisibilized through the process of mainstreaming, not least because gender expertise is not part of a job requirement.

We also found that the infrastructure and maintenance of equal opportunities at the formal level is dependent on the political will of the parties which constitute the government in a given country. Typically, this means that left-wing governments are more likely to support equal opportunities policies and institutions than right-wing governments. Thus equal opportunities in Spain began to be institutionalized only after Franco's death in 1975. In countries where there are shifts from more left-wing to more right-wing regional or national governments (as has happened in Germany for example) equality offices can be closed or disbanded as part of the change in policy which attends changes in government.

3.7.3 Effectiveness of equal opportunities legislation

Our interviewees reported that, except in extreme cases, they found the equal opportunities legislation in their countries ineffective. One Italian interviewee, for instance, pointed to the fact that young women in Italy are still asked by employers to sign completely illegal agreements that they will not become pregnant for a certain amount of time if employed (Barrazetti, Leccardi et al 2003, pp. 19-20). Nothing is done to stop this highly discriminatory practice, and the young women in question themselves do not feel able to refuse to sign for fear of not being employed.

Indeed, nowhere in Europe is equality of opportunity fully achieved or practised to any significant degree. All our interviewees, for example, could produce narratives of unequal treatment in education, the work place and at home.³⁴ At school women were typically encouraged into 'feminine' professions such as nursing or secretarial jobs, while boys were channelled into university education if they got good marks (Griffin 2003, p. 13); and as the French partner reported, 'the career advice given to young women throughout the course of their secondary school education imposed even more limited horizons on their future than did their parents.' (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2003, p.8). Overall the interviewees identified the following five inter-related stages of gender discrimination:

- Early acculturation into gender role behaviour within the family
- Reinforcement of this acculturation through educational channelling
- Gender-discriminatory careers advice
- Gender discrimination in the workplace
- Gender discrimination in the home through the unequal division of domestic and care tasks

It is not surprising, then, that interviewees felt that equal opportunities policies are ineffective.

None of our interviewees reported ever having resorted to legal measures to fight the discrimination they experienced. Indeed, with the exception of the German and to some extent the Dutch interviewees, none of our interviewees had a very clear understanding of what their rights in terms of equal opportunities legislation were. Only one German interviewee could clearly state: 'I know, for example, what my

³⁴ These are detailed in Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002; Schmidbaur et al 2003; Griffin 2003; Griffin and Hanmer 2003; Barazzetti et al 2003; Tuori 2003; Bahovec et al 2003; Juhász 2003; van der Sanden 2003; Suárez and Suárez 2003.

rights are, how I can achieve my goals, what I don't have to put up with and what I have to accept.' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 12) The rest of the interviewees neither knew what their precise rights were and what measures had been taken in their country to ensure equality of opportunity, nor had they ever used formal measures to fight against the discriminatory practices they had all encountered. In their view, 'equal opportunities legislation ... is easily ignored or circumvented' (Griffin 2003, p. 7). This can be seen also in the delays in the implementation of equality legislation (Silius, 2002a). Thus, in all the interviews from all countries, equal opportunities measures were described as 'cosmetic', 'just a piece of paper', 'too weak', 'symbolic', 'insufficient', 'only political correctness' or, as a Spanish interviewee put it, 'the naming of things changes but things don't. There's a lack of content and an excess in form' (Suárez and Suárez 2003, p.7). The interviewees were also clear that the absence of virtually any enforcement measures served to perpetuate existent inequalities.

3.7.4 The impact of Women's Studies training on women's equal opportunities understanding

Our questionnaire respondents reported (Table 24) that, as one might expect, Women's Studies training significantly impacted both on women's reported knowledge of equal opportunities and on their reported involvement in equal opportunities:

Table 24. Reported impact of Women's Studies training on equal opportunities understanding/involvement (in percentages³⁵)

Country	Women's Studies training changed understanding of equal opportunities		Country	Greater involvement in equal opportunities following Women's Studies training	
	PS*	CS**		PS	CS
Finland	89%	97%	Italy	81%	85%
Germany	86%	81%	Netherlands	79%	84%
Netherlands	78%	92%	France	76%	59%
UK	78%	84%	Spain	72%	57%
Slovenia	74%	88%	Slovenia	70%	88%
Spain	74%	72%	Germany	66%	58%
France	71%	87%	UK	66%	45%
Italy	54%	62%	Hungary	64%	70%
Hungary	54%	48%	Finland	54%	71%

*Past students; **Current students
Source: Quantitative data reports EWSI Project 2003.

As regards the impact of Women's Studies training on the understanding of equal opportunities, some interviewees commented on a tension between theory and practice, viewing their training as providing a relatively abstract understanding of equal opportunities rather than a practice-based one. This raises the question of the potential role of Women's Studies courses in universities in transmitting equal

³⁵ For actual sample numbers (N) please see Table A, fn. 3 in this report.

opportunities knowledge. Women's Studies' students' relatively limited knowledge of equal opportunities measures that emerged in the interviews was matched by the fact that few equal opportunities workers are required to have gender expertise. Suárez and Suárez (2003) suggest therefore that both the development of careers advice which enables Women's Studies students to enter equal opportunities professions is necessary and that Women's Studies at the same time should become both more involved in equal opportunities training and in informing students about where equal opportunities knowledge and updates can be obtained outside the universities.

Regarding women's reported greater involvement in equal opportunities following their Women's Studies training, the interviews suggest several interpretations of the data since it is clear that the response does not relate to the numbers of equal opportunities-specific jobs that our interviewees held. However, as discussed above (see section 3.5 of this report), one of our findings was that women reported significant changes in how they carried out their work, refusing to put up with sexism, helping other women fight discrimination in the workplace etc., and it is mainly to this that we think the questionnaire responses refer. This would also explain the differences between the countries regarding the reported change in understanding of equal opportunities and the greater involvement in equal opportunities. For instance whilst German respondents reported a significantly raised understanding of equal opportunities (86% and 81% respectively for past and current students), they showed a significant but proportionately much smaller change in involvement in equal opportunities (66% and 58% respectively for past and current students). Since a significant proportion of German interviewees were in fact working in equal opportunities or equal opportunities-related jobs both prior and during as well as after their studies, one would expect a proportion of them not to 'need' to get more involved in equal opportunities. In the Italian case the scenario is different. Here the understanding of equal opportunities changed significantly (54% and 62% respectively), but the reported involvement in equal opportunities became much higher (81% and 85% respectively). Given the narratives of extensive discrimination provided by the Italian interviewees (Barazzetti et al 2003), it is not surprising that their changed understanding led to much greater resistance to discrimination in the workplace and beyond.

3.8 Women's Studies, women's educational migration and employment

The Bologna Declaration of 1999 recognized that student mobility for a 'Europe of Knowledge' is

an irreplaceable factor for social and human growth and as an indispensable component to consolidate and enrich the European citizenship, capable of giving its citizens the necessary competences to face the challenges of the new millennium, together with an awareness of shared values and belonging to a common social and cultural space. (Bologna Declaration, 1999)

However, historically, women have not participated to the fullest in migration for educational purposes (Juhász et al 2003, pp. 3-4). This section of the report deals with information about the educational mobility of Women's Studies students who participated in our project, their reasons for migrating or failing to do so, and the impact of their experiences abroad on their employment.

3.8.1 Educational Mobility of Women's Studies students in nine European countries

In every participating country Women's Studies students studied abroad or intended to do so (see Table 25). The number of women studying abroad differed across countries.³⁶ For present students, Germany and the Netherlands had the highest proportion of travelling students, and for past students the numbers for Germany and Italy were the highest. Looking at both current and past students, Germany had the highest percentage of students studying abroad (43%) and Slovenia the lowest (7%).

In all but two countries (Spain and Italy), current students studied abroad (or planned to do so) more often than past students. Because the figure for current students includes plans to study abroad, it may be higher than the actual level of educational mobility ultimately achieved. However, the fact that many present students plan to study abroad is interesting in itself, not least because there is an overall increase in the actual and planned mobility from past to present students. A possible explanation for this is that more exchange programmes/opportunities have been established. For instance in Finland, the possibilities for educational migration grew significantly in 1995 when Finland joined the EU and became part of the ERASMUS/Socrates agreements. The lower, and actually decreasing numbers for Spain may be explained by the fact that although the vast majority of students have not been abroad to do Women's Studies courses, a much higher percentage of these Women's Studies students have taken part in ERASMUS programmes in other disciplines (Suárez and Suárez 2003, p. 34).

Table 25. Proportion of questionnaire respondents who studied abroad

How many Women's Studies students studied abroad?	Present students that studied abroad or intend to do so, % (n)	Past students that studied abroad, % (n)	Total of students that studied abroad, % (n)
Germany	46% (31)	39% (22)	43% (53)
Italy	30% (15)	36% (18)	33% (33)
Netherlands	33% (17)	21% (17)	26% (34)
Finland	31% (11)	21% (12)	25% (23)
France	31% (22)	10% (5)	22% (27)
Hungary	18% (9)	14% (7)	16% (16)
Spain	7% (6)	21% (9)	12% (15)
UK	16% (16)	7% (8)	11% (24)
Slovenia	8% (4)	6% (3)	7% (7)

Source: EWSI questionnaires.

3.8.2 'Receiving' and 'Sending': divisions by country

Similar to the general typology of migration, we can distinguish between 'receiving'

³⁶ The sample is non-random as a function of the issues, previously discussed, regarding the tracking of students.

countries and 'sending' countries. France and the UK belong to the first category, receiving a higher percentage of educational migrants than sending out. Language skills play an important part in the considerations that precede a decision to go abroad. Consequently countries where language skills are fostered send out more students (the Netherlands, Finland). If Women's Studies is thoroughly institutionalised in a country, it successfully attracts Women's Studies students who purposefully seek out the courses they need. These 'core countries' are the USA, UK, Netherlands, and Finland where language and flexibility are key factors for educational migration. English language courses offered by Dutch and Finnish universities, often in combination with summer schools, intensive PhD-s or individual tutoring for any period of time offer foreign students ample options to choose from.

The countries where Women's Studies students went to take courses in their field were mainly located in Western Europe (as in the political West). All countries participating in this project received students and in the questionnaires, other European countries (Ireland, Denmark, Sweden, Portugal, Greece, Norway, Austria, and Belgium) were mentioned though destinations outside Europe (the USA and Canada) were most popular. Apart from these, educational trips were made to Peru, Brazil, Indonesia, Ecuador, Zimbabwe, Swaziland, India, and the Dominican Republic (each country mentioned once). Some students had also studied abroad in more than one country. Additional information from the interviews and quantitative summary reports show that some women took Women's Studies courses, did a work placement or research in countries such as the Czech Republic (Bahovec et al 2003, p. 45), Egypt, Cyprus, Wales (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 58), and Thailand and Suriname (van der Sanden 2003, p. 28). For all but a few students going abroad meant studying in other European countries. The exception was the UK where students were at least as likely to go to non-European countries, predominantly the USA.

When we look at the countries where past and present students travel most to take courses (see Table 26), one can distinguish between the countries in this project and other countries. Within the project the Netherlands and the UK, followed by Spain, Germany and France were the leading countries hosting foreign students. The East European countries (as in political East) Slovenia and Hungary received the least students. Countries outside the project that attracted many students were the USA and Canada, followed by Ireland. It may be possible to explain the popularity of a country as a goal for educational migration by the institutionalisation of Women's Studies programs. The countries with a high degree of institutionalisation of Women's Studies training include Finland, Germany, the Netherlands, and the UK (Silius 2002a), and are all countries that receive many Women's Studies students. However, other factors play a role as well.

Table 26. Patterns of educational migration of Women's Studies students

Countries of destiny for Women's Studies courses taken abroad by current and past students										
From	Finland	France	Germany	Hungary	Italy	Netherlands	Slovenia	Spain	UK	Total
To										
Finland	x				1			2	1	4
France		x	6		1	4			1	12
Germany	2		4		2	2	3			13
Hungary				x			(b)1			1
Italy			1		1	1	1	1	1	6
Netherlands	8	1		2	17	18		1	3	50
Slovenia				1	2		x			1
Spain		1	5	1	6	2	1	1	1	14
UK	4	3	(a)4	4	1	5		2	2	26
USA		1	7	2		2		3	8	24
Canada	4	3	2			1				10
Ireland		1	3			3				7
Denmark	3					1				4
Portugal	1		1		1					3
Greece	1					1	(c) 1			3
Sweden	2	1								3
Norway	2									2
Austria			1		1					2
Belgium			1							1
Yugoslavia							1			1
Brazil						1				1
India									1	1
Indonesia						1				1
Dominican Republic								1		1
Ecuador								1		1
Peru		1								1
Swaziland									1	1
Zimbabwe									1	1
Total	27	12	35	10	33	42	8	12	20	199
(a) UK = England, in one German case Scotland										
(b) Hungary = Hungary and Bosnia										
(c) Greece = Greece and Yugoslavia										
Source: EWSI questionnaires.										

In Table 26, detailing patterns of educational migration by country, students seem to be studying abroad in what seems to be their own country in Germany, Italy, Netherlands, Spain and the UK. These are students from another country so they are actually in a foreign country. This is the case for a Polish student in Germany and for students visiting the Netherlands from Poland, Switzerland, and Belgium. In the UK case, the higher number of current interviewees that had come to Britain to study (in comparison to past interviewees) was in part a function of the specific sample since many of the past interviewees were not only mature students (and therefore less likely

to migrate) but also came from a college of higher education with no history - at that stage - of student exchanges abroad. If one had interviewed more past students from other institutions, it might have been the case that among past students there would have been a higher proportion of students who had gone to study abroad (Griffin 2003, p. 51).

3.8.3 Educational mobility and languages

Language played an important role in the choice of a country. The UK students mainly studied abroad in Anglophone countries (i.e. the USA) rather than in a country that was not Anglophone. Countries with a widely spoken language like the UK and USA were obviously attractive. However, countries where courses are taught in English also attracted students. Women's Studies courses in the Netherlands and Finland are to a large extent available in English (van der Sanden and Waaldijk 2002, p. 144; Tuori and Silius 2002, p. 95). For the Dutch case this was reflected in the project data, but the Women's Studies students in our sample seemed not yet to have discovered Finland as a host country. Over the past few years, however, Finland has attracted an increasing number of students thanks to courses offered in English (Commission of the European Communities 2000). Looking at OECD-countries, countries whose language of instruction is French and German also dominate in hosting foreign students (OECD 2002a).

Although many women travel to English-speaking countries, another language may also function as an enticement. Language skills are in some cases essential to acquiring knowledge about Gender Studies. For instance, before 1990, very few feminist writings were translated into Hungarian, so in Hungary knowledge of other languages was essential for gaining access to feminist thought (Gaszi et al. 2002, p. 366). Many students go to countries where languages other than English are spoken, such as Denmark, Greece, Italy and Portugal and hope to learn the language. Language skills can be a requirement and an impediment for studying abroad, but learning a language or improving one's language skills can also be a motivation for going abroad. This tendency has been supported by grants for language students. In the Hungarian case, students went abroad because they received a grant to study English, Dutch or Swedish (Juhász 2002, p. 24).

3.8.4 Outward vs inward educational mobility

Data from the EU-sponsored ERASMUS Program in the partner countries overall show that in most of the nine project partner countries there is more outward mobility than inward mobility. The UK and the Netherlands and to a lesser extent France are the only countries that have more educational immigration than emigration through ERASMUS (in absolute numbers). For the UK this means that there are only a few mobile students. For the UK and the Netherlands these data resemble the project data that indicate that those countries do attract many Women's Studies students.

Table 27. General student mobility through the ERASMUS program in Europe

ERASMUS student mobility 1999/2000	Incoming students	Outgoing students
UK	20.705	10.056
France	17.890	16.824
Spain	15.197	16.297
Germany	14.691	15.751
Italy	8.029	12.421
Netherlands	5.896	4.418
Finland	3.020	3.486
Hungary	457	1.627
Slovenia	9	170
<i>Source:</i> http://www.europa.eu.int/comm/education/ERASMUS/stat.html		

The OECD data (2002a) on student mobility show that of the project partner countries, the UK, the Netherlands, and France are net importers of foreign students (see Table 27). Finland, Germany, Hungary, Italy, and Spain are net exporters (OECD 2002a). (There are no data for Slovenia.)

The UK has a long history of far fewer students migrating abroad than coming into the country. The high number of educational immigrants, especially from former Commonwealth countries rather than from Europe, must be viewed in the light of the financial situation of British universities as well as the country's history. The UK universities' under-funding, combined with the country's history as a colonial empire, mean that on the one hand so-called 'overseas' as opposed to European students are considered particularly desirable since they generate significantly more income than either home or EU students. On the other hand, as a legacy of its empire, Britain attracts overseas students because many of them are brought up in education systems not dissimilar to that of the UK and because they are likely to speak English. The three current students who had travelled to the UK to study Women's Studies were non-EU students; in the interview sample women from Taiwan, Indonesia and Madagascar were represented.

The attraction of the UK as a host country is also partly a function of the fact that English has increasingly become the lingua franca of the globalised world. The discrepancy in the numbers of students entering the UK compared to those going abroad is so large that some British universities will no longer allow ERASMUS student exchanges if tutors cannot guarantee an equal exchange of numbers coming in and going out. In late 2002, the Higher Education Council of England (HEFCE) put out a tender to investigate the implications of this lack of mobility among students from Britain. The low number of UK citizens migrating to study elsewhere is due both to the lack of knowledge of other languages and to financial considerations among students (Griffin 2003).

In France there is in general as much outgoing as incoming migration, and French Women's Studies students seem to be more mobile than other French students. Regarding inward mobility, the French project questionnaire responses (compared with the OECD data) seem to suggest that Women's Studies in France attracts fewer foreign students than other disciplines (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 68). This

may support the tentative conclusion that institutionalisation of Women's Studies programs plays a role in attracting incoming exchange students. In France, students from the North and West African countries, the countries that constituted most of the foreign students in France until the mid-1990s, are less likely to apply to Women's Studies courses than to other disciplines. Educational migration policy is one of the factors in this. Each year, at least two African students are admitted to the DESS postgraduate course in 'Gender and Social Policy' at Toulouse-Le Mirail University (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, pp. 70-1).

Women received information about possibilities of educational migration in different ways. Women's/Gender Studies networks (eg NOISE; WINGS) and exchange programmes between universities through ERASMUS stimulate student mobility.

Some institutions are much more active regarding student exchanges than others. Where institutions are well networked and project the expectation that students will study abroad, it is much more likely that students will do so than if the institution is not supportive, does not advertise schemes well, and has little expectation of student mobility. In several cases, personal recommendations from teachers played a role. In Germany, the Netherlands, Slovenia and the UK, individual professors clearly promoted study abroad.

3.8.5 Gender equality in student mobility

Information of the overall participation of students in ERASMUS programmes shows equality between the sexes. Of all ERASMUS participants, 59% are female. This corresponds to the fact that women are the majority of students in Higher Education (EC 2000).

Table 28. Outgoing ERASMUS students by gender

Outgoing ERASMUS students by gender (2000-2001)	% Female	% Male	Total (n)
United Kingdom	66	34	9021
Hungary	63	37	1624
Spain	60	40	17158
France (figures relate to 1999-2000)	59	41	17093
Slovenia	59	41	232

Source: SCRE, Pirrie et al. 2002.

However, when all foreign students are taken into account in any particular country (not only ERASMUS students), men represent a larger part of foreign students in the OECD-countries: 52,2 % of foreign students are male. As Table 28 shows, in the project partner countries, male overrepresentation is the case in Finland, Germany, the Netherlands and the UK. There are no data on France and Slovenia (OECD 2002a).

Table 29. Foreign enrolment by gender

Foreign enrolment by gender (2000)	% Female	% Male
Hungary	53,3	46,7
Italy	51,2	48,8
Spain	50,7	49,3
United Kingdom	47,2	52,8
Netherlands	47,1	52,9
Germany	46,9	53,1
Finland	42,5	57,5
Country mean of all OECD-countries	47,7	52,2
<i>Source: OECD.</i>		

Opportunities for student mobility are very important for women. After their studies, especially when women have families and care responsibilities, it is more difficult for them to travel abroad. Indications that more men than women participate in staff mobility also suggest a decrease in mobility of women after their studies. In a recent study, data indicated that in the UK over 73% of those who took part in teacher mobility in 2000-2001 were men, and in Hungary more men than women appear to participate in outgoing staff mobility (Pirrie et al. 2002).

3.8.6 Courses and Credits

3.8.6.1 Choice of courses

The experiences of past mobile students reported in our project cover the period from 1980 through 2002. Present students reported studying abroad from 1990 onwards. The length of their stays varied widely, ranging from one-day seminars to 6 years. Of the different kinds of Women's Studies courses abroad that Women's Studies students participated in (see Table 29), the option most frequently taken was staying a semester or an entire year abroad (N = 137). 47 students reported attending a Summer School,³⁷ and only few women (N = 17) reported having decided to take a whole course or program abroad. The average length of all (not only Women's Studies) ERASMUS student mobility is just under seven months (Commission of the European Communities 2000). Finally, 31 women told us they went abroad for purposes that were related to education, but not specifically to any course participation in the

³⁷ A summer school that was often mentioned was the NOISE-Women's Studies summer school, organised yearly with support from the ERASMUS program. For many students this was their first experience of studying abroad and was often followed by other forms of educational migration. The NOISE European Summer School, a two-week intensive course, is by now a well-established event, organised annually since 1994 and hosted by different NOISE partner universities with the participation of a broad range of students and teachers from all over Europe and beyond. Each year, the NOISE Summer School hosts around 50 participating students. The students range from advanced final-year undergraduate students to postgraduate and PhD students. The partner universities (2003) are Universitaire Instelling Antwerpen (Belgium), Syddansk Universitet (Denmark), Universidad Complutense de Madrid (Spain), Aristoteleio Panepistimio Thessaloniki (Greece), Università degli studi di Bologna, Università di Firenze, Università della Calabria, Università degli studi di Milano (Italy), Universiteit Utrecht (Netherlands), Åbo Akademi University (Finland), University of York, University of Lancaster (UK), University of Lund, Linköping University (Sweden), Lodz University (Poland), and University of Ljubljana (ISH) (Slovenia). (http://www.let.uu.nl/womens_studies/)

narrow sense. Other purposes included conducting research and performing fieldwork and/or internships.

Table 30. Type of course taken abroad

Type of course taken abroad	semester / year		Summer school		whole course		Other	
	present	Past	Present	past	present	Past	present	past
Finland	9	9	1	3			1	
France	14	3	4		3		1	2
Germany	24	17	2	2			5	3
Hungary	6	3	3	2				2
Italy	4	7	7	6	2	2	2	3
Netherlands	9	7	5	2	1	1	2	7
Slovenia	2	1	2	1		1		
Spain	4	2	1	4		3	1	
UK	12	4	1	1	2	2	1	1
Total	137		47		17		31	

Source: EWSI questionnaires.

3.8.6.2 Credits

The existence or lack of a similar degree in the home country is always a problem for accreditation. Since Women's Studies is a relatively new discipline, where its institutionalisation has not yet reached the level of a separate degree, students, unless they are willing to lose a year, have to take up a semester in a department which has its home equivalent, like sociology, literature etc. The European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) has contributed to solving this problem, but as the results of our research show there still remains a lot to be done.

Women studying abroad do gain certain qualifications. Data from the questionnaires show that some women, though not all, received credits, certificates, diplomas, or degrees for their study time abroad. Sometimes these women knew that the credits earned would also count at their home university (ECTS credits), though more often there was no information on this in the questionnaire responses, suggesting that the respondents themselves might be unsure, a possibility that is borne out by informal information from the project partners. Certificates in some cases were certificates of attendance. The degrees that women gained varied from BA to MA and Ph.D. The qualitative data reports of the partner countries suggest that only a few current and past students earned degrees. In most cases, it was not clear whether students' achievements were recognised by their own universities or not.

The narratives of the overseas students studying in the UK showed that degrees from the UK were held in high regard in their home countries and were indeed often essential to achieve high status positions (Griffin 2003, p. 46). Some overseas students needed the qualification to get promotion in their work either as academics or as a social worker in their home country, and they came to the UK with the intention to get a degree there. A PhD from Britain was viewed as a symbol of ability and authority, bestowing professional status on the degree holder: 'If you got a PhD people will trust you, what you have done and what you say.' (Griffin 2003, p. 46)

Although one would want recognition of credits earned abroad in the home country, a stay abroad could also be positive even if that was not the case. A German interviewee who was not sure whether any credits would actually be recognised at her home university said: ‘I’ve come to see that year abroad as a true watershed, in every way. Regarding my studies, ... it gave me a kind of freedom because it wasn’t at all clear if anything I did during that time would count.’ (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 58)

3.8.7 Educational migration and funding sources

The European schemes such as earlier TEMPUS, then ERASMUS and SOCRATES are important sources of funding for studying abroad. Some regional funding possibilities play important roles in the respective regions, such as NORDPLUS in Scandinavia and Soros networks (OSI, CEU, CEP) in East-Central Europe. The thematic Women’s Studies networks NOISE and ATHENA also promote educational migration as do national organisations such as the German DAAD, and other national scholarship schemes. Sporadically, especially mature students with a definite goal, find that private foundations offer grants to carry out research abroad. But overall, public funding of student mobility remains low and difficult for students to access.

As Table 31 shows, self-funding played a major role in study abroad among the project’s questionnaire respondents; in Spain, France, Germany, the UK and Italy fifty percent or more of past or present students were self-financing:

Table 31. Women’s Studies’ students’ funding sources for educational mobility in percentages

Source of funding (in percentages)		Self-Funding	Socrates/ERASMUS	Other (Including government)	Total
Spain	Past*	70	0	30	100
	Present*	40	0	60	100
France	Past	60	20	20	100
	Present	57	14	29	100
Germany	Past	57	0	43	100
	Present	78	6	16	100
UK	Past	50	50	0	100
	Present	40	27	33	100
Italy	Past	47	21	32	100
	Present	50	0	50	100
Netherlands	Past	38	46	15	100
	Present	42	42	16	100
Slovenia	Past	25	25	50	100
	Present	25	25	50	100
Finland	Past	9	58	33	100
	Present	25	50	25	100
Hungary	Past	0	11	89	100
	Present	0	67	33	100

Source: EWSI questionnaires. *refers to past/present students

Grants may cover a semester or year abroad (typical for ERASMUS exchange students), a few weeks or a month's research trip, or a summer school. Work placements and internships (especially in the case of Germany) and in-service-training (e.g. visits to NGO's with a similar profile) also offer opportunities for educational migration.

3.8.8 Reasons for studying abroad

Both present and past Women's Studies students decided to study abroad for a variety of reasons and a combination of factors (see Table 32). Information from the questionnaires shows that the most common reasons involved having greater access to academic resources (libraries and staff), the wish to learn a language, and a specific interest in a particular Women's Studies course, as well as the desire to improve career opportunities. To a lesser extent, the motive to study abroad was the desire to take a course not available in the student's home country or the need to gain a specific qualification. Some indicated that they wanted to go abroad for 'comparative study and contacts'. Other reasons that women mentioned for going abroad were more personal and less explicitly educational, indicating that they wanted to expand their horizons, find new contacts, and have the experience of going abroad.

Table 32. Reasons for studying abroad

Reasons for studying abroad (multiple response)	Access to libraries and other academic resources	Learn the language	Interest in a specific Women's Studies course	Improve career opportunities	Take a course not available in home country	Gain a specific qualification	Other reasons
Finland	8	9	6	10	8	2	7
France	13	10	7	3	9	0	10
Germany	18	39	12	25	3	8	15
Hungary	11	3	9	5	4	3	2
Italy	18	8	15	3	14	6	1
Netherlands	11	11	18	11	8	4	8
Slovenia	5	1	4	1	1	0	0
Spain	8	7	6	6	0	1	2
UK *	3	3	8	10	5	0	6
TOTAL	95	91	85	75	52	24	52

* In the UK slightly different categories were used, the answers have been reinterpreted for this table.

Source: EWSI questionnaires.

Access to libraries and other academic sources was a reason for going abroad mentioned in all countries. Especially in France, Slovenia and Spain, this seemed to be very important. In France, a very important motivation, particularly for students who studied in the UK, the USA or Canada, were the relatively comfortable conditions of students in foreign universities, which offered a stark contrast to the rather impoverished conditions they had experienced in their home universities. A past French student who was interviewed remarked:

Once I was in the [European University Institute], with only my PhD to prepare, I really benefited from excellent working conditions: computers everywhere, access to my own E-mail, an enormous library, where you could

order books from wherever you wanted, I really couldn't complain, it was like being in a dream. (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 70)

Women's Studies students from some countries went abroad because there is a lack of courses in Women's Studies in their own country. This was clearly the case in Hungary, Italy, and France. For Hungary, educational migration was crucial because there is a lack of institutionalised, independent Gender Studies. Many students studied abroad because they wanted to study gender while others had exhausted all existing possibilities in Hungary. Due to the lack of institutional gender training in Hungary, the most committed and single students (women rarely travel with family) must choose the option of educational migration. In Hungary all students went abroad because they won a grant, mostly as language students (English, Dutch, and Swedish); some secured research grants.

For many Italian students, studying abroad was an occasion to attend more institutionalised Women's Studies courses, or their choice resulted from their desire - or need - to study in more detail a given Women's Studies subject or specific theories not taught at Italian universities. Many Italian interviewees started attending Women's Studies in the late 1980s/early 1990s when there was no consolidated course offer available in Italy (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 14). In France, the interest in specific Women's Studies courses offered at foreign universities was related to the low levels of Women's Studies institutionalisation (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 69).

There were also several examples of Italian, Hungarian and French students who first discovered the existence of Women's Studies while on international mobility programmes. In Hungary, students who had no idea about gender but happened to spend a year abroad studying were introduced to the discipline and came back with an awareness and created the need for further gender courses (Juhász 2003). One past French student applied to do a Women's Studies course in France after having followed a course on Women and the Law as part of an MA in the Netherlands. She had never received any training on the legal aspects of equality during the three undergraduate years she had studied in France (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 70). An Italian student who discovered Women's Studies abroad came back with a whole set of information and materials that were still unknown in Italy (Barazzetti et al 2003, p. 36).

3.8.9 Reasons for not studying abroad

Women's Studies students revealed a considerable interest in studying abroad. However, there was a discrepancy between their mobility aspirations and their actual mobility. Three key reasons were mentioned by students for not going abroad:

- Lack of funding
- Lack of language skills
- Family and/or work commitments

A high number of Women's Studies students said that they did not go abroad because they would have had to rely on self-funding or the grant they were offered was too little and they could not accept it.

I went to England when I was in secondary school with a grant from the Ministry of Education, but it was for an English course. Later, during

University, I went back there but to work, during the summer. I would have liked to go on an ERASMUS exchange, but I didn't have the money. And what they give you is not enough. But I would like to go abroad, maybe as a (language) assistant. I'd like to go to a place where I can continue my research. (Suárez and Suárez 2003, p. 34)

In France the most important source of funding were personal resources. Because large numbers of students combine their studies with some form of employment, this is problematic for the realisation of mobility (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 69). In the Netherlands, students often work alongside their studies. Financial difficulties might also have played a role in other countries, but interviewees did not mention them. But for instance in most cases in Germany, a number of different financial sources had to be combined to make foreign study possible. Apart from a grant, parental support for instance was necessary (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 57).

A lack of knowledge of other languages prevented women especially from the UK and from France from going abroad. For the UK this is one of the explanations for the low number of UK citizens migrating to study elsewhere.

Having a family and/or children was mentioned as a reason not to study abroad by women in Finland, Germany, Hungary, Slovenia and the UK. Career commitments and other personal responsibilities such as union educational work also played a role. Student mobility was a greater issue for mature students who make up a significant proportion of Women's Studies students in the UK than for younger students since many of the mature students have family and career commitments that do not allow them to spend significant periods of time abroad (Griffin 2003, p. 49). In Hungary, the women who travelled were single students; women rarely travel with family. There were women, however, who despite having a partner and/or child, did go abroad. For instance a past Finnish student went on an exchange with her one-year-old child. She enjoyed the course very much, despite not being able to fully participate because of the presence of the small child:

It was a splendid course, yes. I took only one, it was twice a week and that, too, became a bit difficult to arrange [] However, the lectures went quite smoothly, but I had difficulties asking for more help with child care, so exercises and other such things tended to be badly taken care of. It meant a lot of effort, even though I didn't go through the course with flying colours. But the teaching itself was so very good so that just to be there was very rewarding. [] What was left out completely, of course, and which would have been nice to be part of were the student activities. But I just had to go straight to the lectures and straight back again afterwards; there were very interesting people so it would have been quite nice to be able to socialize with them. (Tuori and Silius 2003, p. 44)

3.8.10 The experience if studying abroad³⁸

Students who migrated for educational purposes commented mainly on three factors:

- The educational-methodological schism they perceived in European higher education articulated as a key difference between the Anglo-American and the Continental European tradition.
- Differences in resourcing.
- The liberation of experiencing less repressive environments for women (especially strongly articulated by women migrating from the eastern and southern countries of Europe to north-western ones).

The most important learning experience the students emphasized in the interviews was the discovery of the 'great educational-methodological schism' in European higher education, which is of course closely connected to the structure and financial background of universities. Students explained at great length the differences between the Anglo-American and the Continental ways of teaching. In the Anglo-American system (from this point of view the Netherlands and Finland belong to this category too) classes are smaller, tutoring and individual counselling makes these universities more personal and effective. In the smaller-size seminars there is space for more discussion, active participation and questions. Creative analytical thinking is encouraged instead of simply memorizing data. The professor-student relationship is more democratic and less hierarchical than at Spanish, French or German universities. Smaller class size means that professors seem to feel more responsible, and take grading papers seriously. All in all students claimed that learning was more fun in this system and encouraged more intellectual growth.

The differences in the way of teaching, which form a cultural heritage, cannot be separated from the fact that facilities and resources were described as far better than in the Continental system. Libraries are very good, and interlibrary loan works very efficiently (first and foremost the United States was praised in this sense). Easy access to computers, e-mail accounts provided to students, and photocopying facilities were the norm. A French student talked about her study experience in the UK:

There were only four of us in the feminist epistemology class and 8 or 9 in the Women's History class. That completely liberated me, it was a totally new experience for me and I thought it was great; people were actually interested in what you thought. You really had to take part in the discussions; you were really encouraged to speak up. I was really surprised, because the other women there didn't have any problem with speaking in class. [...] They used examples from their own experiences, which they used to illustrate the texts they had read. It was really interesting, because they didn't have a distant relationship to the academic knowledge, they really applied it to their own experiences and there was no idea of a hierarchy between what they already knew and what they were learning in class, both kinds of knowledge were recognised. (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 70)

³⁸ The cultural and educational background interviewees came from strongly influenced the way they experienced their stay abroad. Two contemporary EU reports support our findings on the issue. In 2000 the European Commission Directorate General for Education and Culture published a report on the socio-economic background of ERASMUS students (European Commission 2000). Its findings show that family economic background or the occupational status of parents is not a significant factor in the selection of ERASMUS students, but family educational background is. There is, however, a bias in the selection process towards students from the advantaged socio-cultural groups.

Many students commented on the physical resources such as libraries and internet access provided by universities in north-western European countries. A Hungarian student said of her experience in Germany:

[In Berlin] I saw that this feminism has such a great literature, and then I jumped at the feminist books in the library. It was so supporting to see that a whole bookcase is full of feminist books. . . This really reinforced me that we are not totally alone then over here, because it is such a commonplace thing in the West...It was interesting to me that S. [her husband and colleague] also read these books with me then, and accepted these thoughts. So you don't have to explain this *gender* aspect and things to him. From this point of view abroad is a fieldwork, it reinforces you that it is worth doing it. Maybe I say this because I just recently got back, but I think without it you wouldn't bear it in Hungary, you would be pulled back. (Juhász 2003, p. 27)

On the level of personal experience many students mentioned gains connected to self-growth. Women's Studies students referred to personal and cultural growth. A Slovene student formulated this clearly: 'It is very healthy for a person to disconnect from their domestic environment ... to begin to think in a different way, to function differently ...' (Bahovec et al 2003, p. 46)

3.8.11 The impact of studying abroad on educational migrants

Women's Studies students reported four key impacts of studying abroad:

- The development of greater tolerance towards others
- An enhanced understanding of other cultures and how things could be done differently
- The inauguration of change (for instance in education) in their home countries
- A positive impact on their employment (opportunities)

Educational migration increases openness and flexibility. Countries that are strong in Women's Studies can 'enlighten' the students. A relevant comparative survey, however, clearly showed the impact of national differences in implementing gender equality. The Scottish Council for Research in Education (SCRE) published a study on gender equality in SOCRATES in 2002, comparing data from Spain, France, Norway, Hungary, Slovenia and the UK, thus including almost all of the project partner countries (Pirrie et al. 2002). They investigated how principles and practices of gender equal opportunities and gender mainstreaming were integrated into SOCRATES projects. They found great differences. In the case of Hungary for instance, the National Agency that provided the research team with data on the projects administered by them could not identify any projects that had a strong gender equality component, and no monitoring or evaluating of gender-related aspects was practiced. In a context where gender mainstreaming and equal opportunities between men and women only exist on the level of international agreements but do not form part of everyday thinking or practice in education, students find other contexts where gender relations differ from those 'at home' liberating and revolutionary. Here revolutionary in its etymological sense implies that their intellectual outlook 'turns around' and 'revolts' in a new direction.

Along these lines we identified two different types of 'revolutions' in our sample. One such discovery came from students from Hungary, an East-Central European EU enlargement country where Women's Studies institutionalisation is of a low level

(Gaszi et al. 2002) and students from former colonies arriving in France and the UK. The gender roles and expectations in the societies they came from are so different from those of the host countries that the immigrating students have to make major adjustments in their perceptions. They thus become pioneering social agents in relation to women's situation in their home countries, reaching educational levels not commonly available to women in their countries and challenging the gender contracts of their home countries. Two students in the UK who came from Taiwan and Madagascar, for example, spoke about the difficulties they faced at home because they wanted a successful academic career:

A lot of pressure on me being superior to my husband because I'm four years older. I've got a more stable career and people think I'm better than him so it gives him pressure. It gives a lot of pressure on him from his family, so he's pressuring me because of that so all the time I have to deal with that. And it's like the workplace, em, I feel like there is not enough women given positions so we have to double work to prove that we can, or all these jokes about women really hurt me. . . (Griffin 2003, p. 55)

A Hungarian student who studied both in France and the USA returned with a changed view of gender roles:

It changed a lot [her opinion about gender roles]...Not really at the university. Rather in everyday life, on the level of the social distribution of work roles. There are breathtaking differences between Western Europe and Hungary, not to speak of America. In '97 when I came home from France, there were many surprising things, small things...Whatever, for instance it was completely normal that a boy started doing the washing-up during or after a party, or getting the place ready before. So, he just took the dish mop out of my hand, it was so natural. At home then, even in my circles, so among the people I meet, this is not like this. Or these terrible sexist jokes in Hungary, so, my own group mates, whom I thought to be enlightened and intelligent people, were abundant. So things like that in France, I emphasize now that from the mouths of people like me, I didn't hear. (Juhász, p. 26)

The impact of studying abroad on employment was perceived as positive by Women's Studies students. Sometimes it was viewed as something that enlarges employment possibilities; at other times the impact described was more general. It was reported to be beneficial for the interviewees in a professional or academic sense. In no country were negative effects reported. The self-growth reported above was obviously beneficial for the development of different skills that enhance one's value on the employment market. In short, 'it looks good on curriculum vitae.' (van der Sanden 2003, p. 30)

The perceived relation between education and employability differed from country to country. In countries where the connection between Women's Studies and employment was not strong, students did not see a relation between having studied abroad and employment. This was for instance the case in Spain (Suárez and Suárez, p. 35). However, most women were able to apply what they had learned abroad to their further studies and/or to their (academic) jobs. In addition, gaining knowledge of a foreign language and having stayed abroad were seen as a means of improving one's chances of getting a job after graduation in several countries. Sometimes women even planned to perfect their foreign language skills in the light of future employment. This happened for instance in Germany, where language skills and having stayed abroad

are viewed as a qualification that will increase job opportunities. In Germany especially, work experience abroad was seen as desirable (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 57). Several Dutch women also thought that employers value a stay abroad because it shows that they are daring, flexible, autonomous, possess excellent language skills and a broad experience. Hence studying abroad would benefit their employment opportunities. The Dutch women also talked about personal growth in terms of employability. They mentioned for instance knowing your own capabilities and being curious and open towards things that are different (van der Sanden 2003, p. 30).

An impact of educational migration on the choice of a job or the jobs women acquired was mostly, but not solely, reported by PhD students or women who (wish to) stay within the academy. They especially considered their educational migration experience as extremely important. It provided them for instance with theoretical and practical tools they did not have before. Four women from Germany for instance chose to pursue academic careers immediately after having completed their study abroad. Two other German graduates with foreign experiences were promoted to upper management. One of them thought that her work placement in Egypt was crucial because it revealed to her that she no longer wanted a career in the field of development (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 59).

For migrant students coming into the UK, the acquisition of a degree was the key to getting high status employment after returning to their home country. In contrast, the relationship between going abroad to study from Britain and employment was less clear. However, having a British degree was considered very useful for working abroad.

Viewed from an academic career point of view, studying abroad was often the first time Women's Studies students felt they were taken seriously and treated more like a colleague and an equal partner than a student. It was also an important time for students to establish contacts and become part of the international network of Women's Studies. Many exchange students reported that they felt that their study abroad experience was the first time they could really concentrate on academic work since other daily routines and activist work did not take up their time. For several students the chance to develop this 'professional identity' was a first step towards an academic career in Women's Studies.

An issue articulated by all the migrant students was the social expectation of gender inequality in heterosexual relationships as a hindrance to women reaching their full educational potential. Female overseas students from some countries experience significant problems in their personal relationships when they attain postgraduate qualifications rarely held by women in their home countries (Griffin 2003).

3.8.12 Working abroad

The experience of mobility makes students more mobile and influences subsequent employment mobility. For instance some German respondents worked abroad for a period. One woman from Spain is working in the USA as a primary school teacher. And in general in Spain, as a result of the self-confidence that students gained from their Women's Studies training, they were ready to move to different cities or countries to work as well as to change jobs, thus broadening their employment

opportunities (Suárez and Suárez 2003). In the Netherlands for some mobile students working abroad was an option. One woman taught summer courses abroad. Another woman was going to start working in Singapore; she said that she might not have done that if she had not studied abroad. Yet another woman had her first job in Moscow. Many mobile students said how much they enjoyed working together with people from different countries.

In Hungary, the lack of real job opportunities for gender experts means that some students see their future abroad and all of them hope for the best with the enlargement of the European Union. For the young women interviewed in Hungary, continuing their university studies with an MPhil or PhD abroad was an employment option, as the grant they get is higher than any salary they might possibly get in academia as a beginner. With high foreign grants, staying abroad was an option, especially for those who had already spent some time abroad during their studies:

Or, which is another chance, EU enlargement, and you know, I have spent so much time abroad, that it doesn't seem totally absurd to live maybe not in Hungary, but abroad... (Juhász 2003, p. 19)

Although foreign grants are attractive, Hungarian women who consider this option are often discouraged by their visions of remaining unmarried and childless, or their old parents remaining without help. If they have a partner, husband or children, it is most probable that they will never take foreign grants, because their spouses wouldn't give up their jobs and follow them. The same male generation is not impeded by such considerations and often stay abroad beyond their 30s. Another negative effect of working abroad was that when people commute between the West and Hungary they lose touch with Hungarian academia and miss opportunities for integration into the local system.

The overseas students in the UK did not expect to have any difficulties in finding a job in their home countries. A past student from the UK had been to the Netherlands and got a taste for travel and work abroad and, instead of pursuing postgraduate work as she had originally intended, she went to teach English in Japan. The British degree she had was important for getting a university job in Japan. After having married a Japanese man, she continued to work, which is not the norm in Japan. In her teaching this woman then introduced gender issues:

I find that in a lot of my advanced classes they often want to talk about gender. When they ask me what university degree did you study and I always say Gender Studies, and they get their dictionaries out and look it up, men and women (whispered) and they always ask me can you give us a presentation on it, so I have done this quite a lot of times. [...] They love it, they are so interested [...]. (Griffin 2003, p. 52)

In France there are increasing employment opportunities for graduates with equal opportunities training from a French University, because of the progressive integration of gender equality issues in the development programmes of international NGOs in North and West African countries. Indeed, almost all the men who apply for admission to do the 'Gender and Social Policy' course in Toulouse are from Africa. Most foreign students who apply to this course already have some work experience in 'Gender and Development' programmes in their home country. This would seem to suggest that there are already significant employment opportunities in this field in some African countries. Obtaining a degree from a French university is more

important for improving the career prospects of men and women who are already working on development programmes than it is for helping them gain access to jobs in this field in the first place (Le Feuvre and Andriocci 2002, p. 71).

The most important factor that emerged from the interviews was the experience of one's own power as an active agent in one's life. Most of the women considered their time abroad as a transformative period. One German graduate summarized her experience: 'I've come to see that year abroad as a true watershed, in every way.' (Schmidbaur et al 2003, p. 58)

To conclude, Women's Studies students report a positive impact of educational migration on their employment possibilities. They made international contacts, improved their language skills, and widened their horizon work wise. They acquired new theoretical and conceptual tools and skills which they could import into their home countries, became more mobile and open to different and new experiences. In short, educational mobility enhances employment opportunities.

4. Conclusions and policy implications

4.1 Introduction

This project is the first to present systematic cross-European data on the impact of Women's Studies training on the employment of those that undertake such training. Previous research had centred entirely on the anglophone world, in particular the USA, Australia and the UK.³⁹ This project offers a first insight into the employment of Women's Studies students across *Europe*, highlighting both the need for further research into certain areas as well as pointing to policy recommendations at European, national and disciplinary level.

As the project has demonstrated (see sections 3.3-3.5 in this report), Women's Studies training has a number of positive impacts on its students in terms of their employability, their adaptability and entrepreneurship, the promotion of equal opportunities, the promotion of educational and employment-related migration. Simultaneously, the project demonstrates that much remains to be done to

- embed the discipline more sustainably within the academy (see section 3.2 of this report),
- support Women's Studies students into marketing their transferable knowledges and skills more effectively (see subsections 3.3.1 and 3.3.2 in this report),
- map women's employment trajectories more effectively (see section 3.3.3 in this report),
- understand the medium- and long-term impacts of Women's Studies training on women's employment more precisely,
- make equal opportunities legislation more effective (see section 3.6.3 in this report),

³⁹ See, for example, Dever, Cuthbert and Dacre (1999), Griffin (1994), Luebke and Reilly (1995), Lyon (1996), Reuben and Strauss (1980), Bose and J. Priest-Jones (1980).

- enable more students to participate in educational mobility programs (see section 3.7.1 in this report).

4.2 The Institutionalization of Women's Studies

4.2.1 Conclusions

4.2.1.1 Women's Studies as a discipline is vital to changing the 'durable dispositions' (Bourdieu 1998) which govern gender roles in contemporary Europe and which serve to curtail women's ability to participate to the full in the employment market. As section 3.2 in this report demonstrates the institutionalization of Women's Studies in many European countries benefits from modular structures, state feminism, and autonomy in curriculum development.

4.2.1.2 At present Women's Studies as a discipline is predominantly taught in higher education, as part of traditional disciplines at undergraduate level, and also as a discipline in its own right at postgraduate level (see section 3.2 in this report). To maximize its potential impact it is important that all European countries are encouraged to establish Women's Studies as an autonomous discipline at undergraduate as well as at postgraduate level.

4.2.1.3 Women's Studies as a discipline lacks recognition and visibility in many European countries including Hungary, Slovenia, Italy, and France (Barazzetti and Leone 2003). Students therefore tend discover the subject by chance while at university (see section 3.2.2 of this report).

4.2.1.4 At present Women's Studies does not form part of teacher training education despite the fact that teachers are vital for facilitating learning and change, including around gender roles, in primary and secondary education.

4.2.1.5 At present gender issues are rarely included in any school curricula. Since, however, 50% and more of the total of the European population do not enter tertiary education, it is vital that the changes in gender roles needed in twenty-first century Europe be inculcated at education levels that the vast majority of European Union citizens have access to, that is primary and secondary education levels.

4.2.1.6 Women's Studies is a vital source for the dissemination of equal opportunities knowledge.

4.2.2 Policy implications

4.2.2.1 The EU should use the Bologna process to encourage the establishment of Women's Studies as a fully recognized independent discipline at under- and at postgraduate level in all European Union countries.

4.2.2.2 All national governments should facilitate the establishment of Women's Studies as a fully recognized discipline at under- and at postgraduate level by

including it as a discipline for all assessment and funding purposes, and supporting it with endowed chairs and studentships.

4.2.2.3 National governments and ministries of education should ensure that Women's Studies forms part of all teacher education curricula.

4.2.2.4 National governments and ministries of education should ensure that Women's Studies is part of the primary and secondary education curricula so that changes in gender roles can be addressed at the educational levels to which all European Union citizens have access.

4.2.2.5 Ministries of education and equal opportunities bodies in the European Union countries should explore the ways in which Women's Studies bases in tertiary education might be built upon and supported to disseminate equal opportunities knowledge more widely in society.

4.2.2.6 National governments and ministries of education should ensure that Women's Studies Centres are supported to act as dissemination centres for gender research and equal opportunities along the lines of the Swedish National Gender Secretariat.

4.2.2.7 The full institutionalisation of Women's Studies as a discipline, available both within traditional subjects and as a stand-alone degree, should be part of the implementation of the Bologna Agreement.

4.2.2.8 The project shows that students on modular degrees or on modules in traditional degrees that are interdisciplinary in character are difficult to track. We therefore recommend that the EU and national governments agree common processes for keeping such data so that student aggregation around interdisciplinary areas can be tracked and analysed more effectively.

4.2.2.9 During the project we found that with the exception of the UK, universities in no other country kept exit data for students which made it difficult to track students by discipline. The EU and national governments need to agree common processes for keeping data so that the transition from training to employment can be tracked and analysed more effectively.

4.2.3 Further research suggestions

4.2.3.1 As the establishment of Women's Studies gets under way in those European countries which do not yet have a well established Women's Studies structure (eg Hungary, Slovenia, France, as well as the accession countries), the EU should consider how that establishment might be most effectively facilitated in the light of this report's findings.

4.2.3.2 The EU should commission research into how the barriers to disciplinary innovation can be removed and the introduction of new, interdisciplinary curricula in universities can be facilitated.

4.3 Employability of Women's Studies Graduates

4.3.1 Conclusions

4.3.1.1 Women's Studies as a discipline attracts women who are keen to participate in the labour market (see section 3.3.4 in this report).

4.3.1.2 Women's Studies students acquire a significant number of important key knowledges and skills during their training including knowledge of gender and diversity issues, equal opportunities, critical thinking, self-confidence, and the ability to argue effectively (see section 3.3.2 in this report). However, students sometimes think that their subject, Women's Studies, is viewed with hostility in the employment market, and they therefore sometimes deny the fact that they took this subject.

4.3.1.3 Employers appear to have little understanding of the knowledges and skills Women's Studies students acquire (see section 3.3.2 of this report).

4.3.1.4 Our data suggest that careers advisors, in the countries where they exist, do not practise equal opportunities in relation to their clients, instead encouraging girls simply to move into traditionally feminized occupations, and have no or very limited understanding of the skills and knowledges Women's Studies students acquire (see section 3.6.3 and the Qualitative Data Reports of the project). They also have little knowledge of the kinds of careers that require gender expertise.

4.3.1.5 Few Women's Studies courses require in-course work placements but students who have had such placements report a more realistic view of the job market and also in some instances acquired opportunities to be employed in the place where they had undertaken their work placement (see section 3.3.7 of this report).

4.3.1.6 In most European countries participating in this project, Women's Studies training encourages the professionalization of its students, not least through its high retention rates into postgraduate level (see sections 3.3.6; 3.3.8; 3.4.5.3 in this report) which as EU data show is a key factor in labour market participation (see section 3.2.2 of this report).

4.3.1.7 Women's Studies students outperform their mothers in terms of reaching higher professional and/or managerial positions than their mothers had done (see section 3.3.9 of this report).

4.3.1.8 Women's Studies students, especially in Italy, Finland and Germany, reject the conventional male career model which emphasizes climbing a career ladder and making increasingly large sums of money (see section 3.4.3 of this report), instead defining their ideal job in terms of job satisfaction, making a difference, feeling valued, and working in a non-sexist environment (see section 3.4.1).

4.3.1.9 Women's employment is inadequately captured by current conventional employment categories as used by EUROSTAT, the OECD, and other such bodies. Their categorizations replicate a male employment structure, and lump women's employment by default together in the 'Service' sector. Such

undifferentiated structures fail to provide a true account of women's employment and also do not capture the cultural significance of any employment category. This includes ISCO-88 which offers more refined employment indicators.

4.3.1.10 Women's Studies (postgraduate) students are influenced by their training in the type of employment they seek (see section 3.4.1 of this report) and want to work in particular in three employment sectors: feminist research/academe, equal opportunities, and women's NGOs.

4.3.1.11 Women's Studies students produce four different discourses regarding how they enter the labour market (see section 3.4.4. in this report), highlighting varying degrees of sense of agency in the process which are sometimes significantly at odds with the actual amount of proactivity the students demonstrate. This highlights women's continuing acculturation into feminine gender roles that construct them as passive and objects rather than the subjects they are and act as.

4.3.1.12 The gender expertise generated through Women's Studies training is of critical importance in a great variety of jobs including human resources, health and social services, the police, middle management, etc. (see section 3.4.5.1; 3.4.6), and Women's Studies graduates enter a wide variety of professions in which they are able to make a difference due to their gender expertise.

4.3.1.13 The women's movement and Women's Studies have led to new employment sectors in the form of feminist research/academe, equal opportunities jobs, and women's NGOs. This demonstrates the professionalisation of gender expertise.

4.3.1.14 Women continue to carry the double burden of paid employment and domestic labour which impacts on their ability to participate fully in the labour market.

4.3.1.15 Women's Studies in a number of countries attracts older women who then either return to the labour market or enter it for the first time.

4.3.2 Policy implications

4.3.2.1 Women's Studies courses need to support students in marketing their knowledges and skills more effectively.

4.3.2.2 Education ministries and equal opportunities bodies should facilitate Women's Studies staff to help them market the knowledges and skills Women's Studies students acquire to prospective employers.

4.3.2.3 National governments should develop initiatives to enhance employers' knowledge of the kinds of knowledges and skills students acquire during their training, including Women's Studies training.

4.3.2.4 Women's Studies staff should seek to develop awareness raising programs for employers regarding the kinds of knowledges and skills Women's Studies students acquire during their training.

4.3.2.5 Careers advice services for students should be available in all European Union countries, and the Bologna process might be used as a tool by the European Union to support the establishment of such services where they do not exist.

4.3.2.6 Careers advisors should be trained both in equal opportunities and in knowledge of the kinds of careers that require gender expertise. Such training might be delivered via Women's Studies programs, and national ministries of education as well as departments of trade and industry which should set up initiatives to enable this.

4.3.2.7 Careers advice services should produce annual gender audits.

4.3.2.8 Women's Studies courses should consider the inclusion of work placements as part of their curriculum.

4.3.2.9 National governments and ministries of education should ensure the establishment of postgraduate courses and research centres in Women's Studies in all higher education institutions.

4.3.2.10 The EU and national statistics offices should develop gender sensitive employment statistical indicators for women's employment. This includes the development of gender sensitive statistical indicators for unpaid care work.

4.3.2.11 Several European certification norms already exist, notably in relation to health and safety (eg AFNOR, ISO-2000). A similar scheme should be adopted in relation to women's employment. National and local governments, public and private-sector companies, leisure and cultural institutions, third sector service providers, political parties, etc. should be required to meet a series of norms in relation to the promotion of women's rights in employment. So-called "family-friendly" personnel management practices could be one of the first areas to be recognised with a "best practice" gender equality certification scheme. In addition, this scheme could also provide a framework for training equal opportunity staff. Training programmes (in collaboration with Women's Studies experts in higher education institutions) could be harmonised across the EU, with the explicit aim of transferring "best practices" in relation to training women (or men) in equal opportunity-related jobs from countries where there has already been a degree of "equal opportunities institutionalisation", to those where there are few employment opportunities in this area, or where people can be recruited to equality officer jobs without any previous training in gender analysis.

4.3.2.12 Women's Studies staff and careers advisors need to support their students more, and more systematically, in recognizing their own agency in entering the employment market.

4.3.2.13 Measures need to be developed both nationally and at EU level to facilitate cultural change in men so that they become producers and not merely consumers of domestic labour. These should include compulsory teaching on gender issues at primary and secondary school level, the development of positive role models for men doing domestic labour in the media, and incentives via employers and tax breaks to encourage men to take on proper care responsibilities for dependents.

4.3.2.14 National governments and education ministries should support the setting up of Women's Studies courses for women aged 40+ to help the latter enter or re-enter education and the labour market.

4.3.2.15 At EU level and nationally, policies to reduce working hours for all employees should be given more weight than policies encouraging part-time employment for women.

4.3.3 Further research suggestions

4.3.3.1 The EU should commission research to establish employers' and careers advisors' views of the employability of Women's Studies graduates. This research should simultaneously function as an information dissemination strategy to enable both employers and careers advisors to become more informed about the skills and knowledges Women's Studies students acquire during their training.

4.3.3.2 The EU should commission research to establish the impact of Women's Studies training in the work place by triangulating former students' views with those of employers and colleagues.

4.3.3.3 The EU should commission research to establish how best to create gender- and employment-culture sensitive statistical indicators.

4.3.3.4 The EU should commission research to establish the long-term impacts of Women's Studies training on women's employment.

4.3.3.5 The EU should commission research to examine the job profile and employment histories of equal opportunities staff in order to ascertain what current skills and knowledges requirements for equal opportunities posts are, to develop a harmonized job profile/specification across Europe for such posts, and to create a job specification prototype for such posts.

4.3.3.6 The EU should commission research on what measures might most effectively be adopted to incentivise men to become producers of domestic labour.

4.4 Adaptability and Entrepreneurship of Women's Studies graduates –

4.4.1 Conclusions

4.4.1.1 Since Women's Studies still lacks full recognition both inside academe and outside, its students are characterized by their independent-

mindedness, their willingness to try new and unfamiliar terrain and thus take risks, and their focus on wanting to make a difference and achieve change (see section 3.4.5.5 of this report). This makes them ideal participants in the current labour market with its need for flexibility, adaptability, and the willingness to strike out on your own.

4.4.1.2 Women's Studies training provide women with key knowledge and skills for the labour market. These include:

- Gender awareness
- Knowledge of equal opportunities
- Self-confidence
- Critical thinking ability
- The ability to establish and sustain complex arguments
- Abilities to work in a communicative, open style
- Competence in dealing with diversity.

4.4.1.3 Women's Studies students are more willing to go into less established, innovatory work environments where work cultures are less entrenched (see section 3.4.6 of this report).

4.4.1.4 Women's Studies training impacts most significantly on *how* women carry out their work, making them potential change agents in the workplace (see section 3.5 of this report).

4.4.1.5 Women's Studies students reported a willingness to 'invent' their own jobs, that is to think creatively about making employment for themselves (see section 3.4.6 in this report).

4.4.1.6 Women's Studies facilitates upward professional mobility in its students (see sections 3.4.5.6; 3.4.6 in this report).

4.4.1.7 Women's Studies students benefit greatly from the female friendship and mentoring networks at local, national, and international levels that they acquire during their Women's Studies training. These networks act as facilitators in finding post-training employment (see section 3.5.9 of this report).

4.4.2 Policy implications

4.4.2.1 National/regional ministries of education and departments of trade and industry should develop strategies for promoting greater knowledge of the skills acquired through Women's Studies training.

4.4.2.2 The EU and national/regional governments should develop and support female mentoring systems for Women's Studies graduates to sustain the latter in unconventional employment arenas, and to spread knowledge about the opportunities around divergent career paths.

4.4.3 Further research suggestions

4.4.3.1 The EU should commission longitudinal research into women who go into innovative employment areas to understand better what motivates them to enter such arenas and what sustains them within these.

4.4.3.2 The EU should commission research on the career paths of women working in women's NGOs, an increasingly important sector as the welfare state declines.

4.4.3.3 The EU should commission research to explore in greater depth how women with Women's Studies training act as change agents in the work place.

4.4.3.4 The EU should commission research into the lifecycles of female mentoring systems and their impacts on those mentored in terms of career sustenance and progression.

4.5 Equal Opportunities and Women's Studies Training

4.5.1 Conclusions

4.5.1.1 Equal opportunities legislation is at different levels of institutionalization across the diverse European countries (see section 3.6.1 of this report).

4.5.1.2 Equal opportunities infrastructure in many European countries is dependent on the party-political context, with offices etc being closed if governments move from left-wing to right-wing dominance (see section 3.6.2 of this report).

4.5.1.3 Equal opportunities legislation is rarely supported by the political will to implement it effectively and offers little sanction in case of violation (see section 3.6.3 of this report).

4.5.1.4 Equal opportunities legislation in most European countries is not well understood, nor widely known by many people including those who have an awareness of gender issues (Suárez and Suárez 2003).

4.5.1.5 Although all project interviewees reported experiences of discrimination in the work place, none of them had resorted to legal measures to try and redress those issues (see section 3.6.3 of this report).

4.5.1.6 In many European countries including France and Finland, for example, gender expertise is not a job requirement for people working in equal opportunities jobs (see section 3.6.2 of this report).

4.5.1.7 Women's Studies training changes women's understanding of equal opportunities issues and increases women's perception of their involvement in equal opportunities issues (see section 3.6.4 of this report).

4.5.1.8 Some Women's Studies students would like to see more equal opportunities training on their courses (Suárez and Suárez 2003; see also section 3.6.4 of this report).

4.5.1.9 Women's Studies students are interested in working in equal opportunities employment contexts (see section 3.4.5.4).

4.5.1.10 Women's Studies students' sense of being able to work in the equal opportunities sector is related to the degree of institutionalization of equal opportunities in their countries.

4.5.1.11 Women's Studies training enables women to enact equal opportunities policies in their work place including:

- Refusal to put up with sexist behaviour at work
- Introduction of gender issues into the work place
- Working in a non-sexist manner
- Fighting discrimination at work
- Feeling more confident in making applications for promotion
- Being more sensitive to issues of diversity
- Being more supportive of female colleagues

4.5.1.12 Women's Studies training facilitate students' understanding of the gendered power asymmetries they routinely encounter in their working lives, enabling them to make sense of those experiences.

4.5.2 Policy recommendations

4.5.2.1 The EU should promote measures to speed up the implementation of equal opportunities legislation in all its member countries.

4.5.2.2 The EU and national governments should ensure that equal opportunities infrastructures are set up and maintained independently of changes in local/national government, and independent of the political will of political parties.

4.5.2.3 The EU and national governments ought to develop effective and implementable sanctions in case of equal opportunities legislation.

4.5.2.4 Both the EU and national governments should develop campaigns to facilitate a greater degree of dissemination and understanding of equal opportunities legislation.

4.5.2.5 As part of schools' training for citizenship, curricula ought to be developed to incorporate knowledge of rights under equal opportunities legislation and an understanding of how one might use that legislation to seek redress in case of violation.

4.5.2.6 The EU and national governments should ensure that gender expertise is a standard requirement of all equal opportunities posts.

4.5.2.7 Women's Studies courses should be encouraged to give more curriculum space to equal opportunities.

4.5.2.8 Equal opportunities bodies should be encouraged by national governments to collaborate with Women's Studies programs to facilitate training in equal opportunities.

4.5.2.9 National governments and departments of trade and industry should ensure that careers advisors are trained to promote jobs in equal opportunities to Women's Studies students.

4.5.2.10 Domestic and care labour training should become part of the primary and secondary schools training for all boys and girls in all European countries.

4.5.2.11 Employers in all European countries should be required to carry out gender audits and to include action plans for improving gender imbalances in their work place.

4.5.2.12 Careers advisors should receive gender awareness training. Their activities should be regularly monitored and audited, including a gender audit, and incentives created to facilitate the promotion of men into traditionally female jobs and women's opportunities to work outside the service sector.

4.5.2.13 International mentoring schemes for women with Gender Studies expertise need to be developed and promoted throughout the European Union through bodies such as the 'Women and Science' Unit.

4.5.2.14 The EU and national governments ought to agree on incentives to be offered to employers (tax breaks; benefits) designed to transform gender segregation in the labour market through making gender awareness part of their job specifications, and to promote greater gender balance in employment.

4.5.2.15 All European countries should introduce targeted programmes to increase women's participation and advancement in academe.

4.5.2.16 European policy should support targeted positive action at national level to enhance women's participation and advancement in academe.

4.5.2.17 National mentoring schemes for Gender Studies experts need to be put in place through ministries of education and departments of trade and industry.

4.5.2.18 National governments should consider using tax incentives and other fiscal measures to encourage employers to improve gender imbalances in areas such as promotion, the pay gap, and parental leave taken by men rather than women.

4.5.2.19 Gender audits and relevant action plans should be established as a central aspect of all public funding policies.

4.5.2.20 Countries such as Germany and France should introduce standardised job descriptions for commissioners of women's affairs/equal opportunities officers.

4.5.2.21 All teacher-training courses should include a compulsory equal opportunities element.

4.5.2.22 National campaigns are required to promote equal opportunities legislation and women's rights within the work place.

4.5.2.23 National campaigns are required to promote awareness of issues such as violence against women, and the need for men's participation in domestic and care labour.

4.5.3 Further research suggestions

4.5.3.1 The EU should commission research to find the most effective ways and incentives that change attitudes to enable both women and men to pursue their chosen professional lives as well as cope with domestic labour and care-work.

4.5.3.2 The EU should commission research to establish best practices in equal opportunities dissemination.

4.5.3.3 The EU should commission research into the career paths of equal opportunities officers.

4.5.3.4 The EU should commission research into the relationships between EU legislation on equal opportunities and its impact on national legislations with a view to harmonizing these.

4.6 Women's Studies graduates and education- and employment-related migration

4.6.1 Conclusions

4.6.1.1 There was an increasing tendency among students from all partner countries except Spain and Italy to study abroad (see section 3.7.1 of this report) as both exchange programs have grown and knowledge of Women's Studies has become more widespread.

4.6.1.2 Countries which have well established Women's Studies programs such as the UK, the Netherlands, Finland and Germany are more likely to receive foreign students than countries where the subject is less well established (see section 3.7.2 of this report).

4.6.1.3 Students also tend to be attracted to countries in which English is spoken (see section 3.7.2 and 3.7.3 of this report).

4.6.1.4 In all the project partner countries except the UK and the Netherlands there was more inward than outward mobility of students (see section 3.7.4 of this report).

4.6.1.5 Overall, women still tend to be under-represented in terms of educational mobility (see section 3.7.5).

4.6.1.6 Those who study abroad tend to do so predominantly for a semester or a year (see section 3.7.6.1 of this report).

4.6.1.7 Few students take entire degrees abroad (see section 3.7.6.1 of this report).

4.6.1.8 Problems persist with having courses taken abroad accredited in the home university, especially where these are in subjects that have no equivalent in the home country. Students often do not know if the courses they take will be accredited on their return (see section 3.7.6.2 in this report).

4.6.1.9 Although increasing numbers of students study abroad as part of an EU mobility scheme, a significant proportion are self-funded (see section 3.7.7 of this report).

4.6.1.10 The most important barriers to studying abroad are lack of or insufficient funding, lack of language skills (which is particularly acute in the UK), and family and/or care commitments (see section 3.7.9 of this report).

4.6.1.11 Women are less likely to study abroad once they have family (see section 3.7.9 of this report).

4.6.1.12 Women who undertook training abroad were particularly impressed by the pedagogic and methodological schism between Anglo-American and Continental European systems of teaching (smaller class sizes and more focus on interactive teaching in the Anglo-American system), the differences in resourcing (better resources regarding IT etc in north-west European countries), and the experience of less restrictive and less traditionally gendered environments in the north-west European countries (see section 3.7.10 of this report).

4.6.1.13 Students reported the development of greater tolerance towards others, a greater readiness to be mobile educationally and employment-wise, an enhanced understanding of other cultures, better language skills, and a positive impact on their employment as benefits derived from studying abroad (see section 3.7.11 of this report).

4.6.1.14 Students from eastern and southern countries reported bringing back different ideas about gender roles to their home countries (see section 3.7.11 of this report).

4.6.1.15 Students reported that study abroad was valued by employers (see section 3.7.11 of this report).

4.6.1.16 Students who want to stay in academe found the experience of studying abroad especially useful in subsequent employment terms (see section 3.7.11 of this report).

4.6.2 Policy implications

4.6.2.1 The EU should revise student and staff mobility programmes to include opportunities for short-term exchanges (one week to one month) to enable women and men with care/domestic responsibilities to participate in such schemes.

4.6.2.2 The EU should review the financial incentives aimed at achieving harmonization and a more competent workforce through greater mobility for educational purposes, as finances are often too limited to enable students to take educational mobility schemes up.

4.6.2.3 The EU should use the Bologna process to enforce language teaching in countries such as the UK where lack of knowledge of languages impedes educational mobility.

4.6.2.4 The EU should revise mobility schemes to enable participation even where there is no exchange of equal numbers of students.

4.6.2.5 The EU should use educational mobility schemes to further international networking and mentoring for women by encouraging support schemes which transcend the duration of the actual mobility scheme.

4.6.2.6 The EU needs to establish measures and sanctions that ensure the accreditation of courses taken abroad in the student's home country, including courses in subjects not taught in the home country.

4.6.2.7 The EU, national governments and education institutions should use educational mobility users to act as advocates of such schemes and to promote them.

4.6.2.8 The EU ought to encourage the establishment of a greater diversity of mobility schemes including summer schools.

4.6.3 Further research suggestions

4.6.3.1 The EU should commission qualitative research into the educational mobility experiences of students with dependents.

4.6.3.2 The EU should commission research into the long-term benefits of educational mobility.

4.6.3.3 The EU should commission research into the long-term impact of educational mobility on women's employment.

4.6.3.4 The EU should commission research into the differential impact of different types of mobility scheme on women's ability to participate in such schemes.

5. Dissemination and/or exploitation of results

5.1 Dissemination strategy adopted during the lifetime of the project

The dissemination strategy of the project during its lifetime has consisted of seven different strands:

- Establishment of the project website (www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi) for virtual dissemination of the project findings which have been posted on that website.
- Wide distribution at local, regional, national and international levels of the project leaflet to publicize the project.
- Invitation of national/regional experts who are also policy makers to several project workshops during the lifetime of the project (list attached under point 6 ‘Acknowledgments and References’ of this report).
- Publication of background data reports in book form and wide inter/national dissemination of these reports (for a list see the 18-month progress report, available on the project website).
- Significant numbers of conference papers given at relevant international and national conferences, most by invitation as the project became better known (a list is provided under point 7 ‘Annexes’ of this report).
- Article publications by various project partners (a list is provided under point 7 ‘Annexes’ of this report).
- Utilization of project findings in further research (PhDs) by junior project researchers.

5.2 Follow-up of results foreseen by each partner after the completion of the project (see table below):

Country/name	Title of result	Exploitation intention
Finland: Prof. Harriet Silius Salla Tuori	Qualitative Data Project findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Further analysis of this material has been initiated and shall result in publications. • Project findings have been incorporated in the Women's Studies curriculum at Abo Akademi University. • The project findings will be used in one of the activities of the ATHENA II Network in which Prof. Silius is a partner. • Paper on equal opportunities at the Ministry of Equal Opportunities, Hungary, 17 Oct 2003. • Paper on the project to be given on 20 Oct 2003 at Miskolc University, Hungary. • Paper on 'Women's Employment and Equal Opportunities in Comparative Perspective' to be presented at Turku Polytechnic, Oct. 2003.
France: Dr Nicky Le Feuvre Muriel Andriocci	Project findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project findings will be used in one of the activities of the ATHENA II Network in which Dr. Le Feuvre is a partner. • Project researcher will use data as part of her PhD.
Germany: Dr Marianne Schmidbaur	Project findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Paper to be presented at conference on the impact of the Bologna Process on female students at Siegen, Germany, autumn 2003. • Article in progress for <i>Feministische Studien</i>. • Application for follow-on grant from the Hessian Research Programme on 'Gender Differences' to do a follow-up study on the long-term employment impacts of doing Women's Studies. • Building up of a research and training network on Women's Studies in Germany, inaugurated at the Humboldt University, Berlin, summer 2003.
Hungary: Dr Andrea Peto Dr Borbála Juhász	Project findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr Juhász who was the researcher for this project has been appointed as Head of the recently established Dept. for Gender Equality within the newly set-up Equal opportunities Ministry in Hungary. The Hungarian publication from the project (see point 7 of this report) has become part of that dept.'s strategic planning. • Based on the project findings, training in gender mainstreaming for civil servants is being devised. • The Central Statistical Office (KSH, Budapest) has a contract with Dr Juhász' dept. on gendering statistics and the results of the project will be incorporated into this. • Dr Juhász has agreed to organize a dissemination event on the project for policy makers in Brussels in Feb 2004. • The Hungarian publication will be made accessible via the web. • Dr Peto is a partner in ATHENA II on Equal Opportunities. • Dr Peto is teaching a course on equal opportunities in Hungary at Miskolc University.
Italy: Prof. Donatella Barazzetti	Project findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project presentation, National Conference of the Coordination of the Equal Opportunities Commission in the Universities, Sassari, 23-25 Oct 2003. • Project presentation at the Regional Conference in Calabria on 'Women's Position in Calabrian Universities', 30 Oct 2003. • Articles planned for on-line journals 'DWF' (Donna Women Femmes), 'Il Paese delle Donne', and 'Delta News'. • Book project on Women's Studies' students' expectations and motivations (publisher: either Rubbettino or Guerini). • Article on 'The Institutionalization of Women's Studies' planned for the <i>National Journal of Sociology</i>. • Article planned on 'Employment and Expectations of Women's Studies Students' for <i>Dedalus</i>. • Article planned on issues of feminist pedagogy for education journal.

<p>Netherlands: J. van der Sanden</p> <p>Prof. Berteke Waaldijk</p>	<p>Project findings</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project findings will be used in one of the activities of the ATHENA II Network in which J. van der Sanden is a partner. • A public lecture on ‘The Institutionalization of Women’s Studies’ will be given as part of Utrecht University’s Public Lecture Series (5 Nov 2003). • Book version of background data reports is required reading on two modules at Utrecht University, ‘Historiography’ and ‘Dutch Culture and Society’. • Paper on ‘The Institutionalization of Women’s Studies’ as part of a Workshop on Gender Mainstreaming organised by the Women and Science Unit.
<p>Slovenia: Dr Eva Bahovec</p>	<p>Project findings</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project results will be integrated into graduate Women’s Studies programmes at Ljubljana University, using publications as teaching material. • Project findings will be presented in the lifelong teacher-education programme. • Project findings will be disseminated in Serbian Women’s Studies centres. • Project presentations on regional and national radio programmes.
<p>Spain: Dr Isabel Carrera Suárez</p>	<p>Project findings</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Integration of findings into PhD programme. • Presentation at various conferences. • Further contributions to publications.
<p>UK: Prof. Gabriele Griffin</p>	<p>Qualitative Data Reports</p> <p>Comparative Data Reports</p> <p>Project findings.</p> <p>Replication of project in other countries</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Negotiations are under way to publish these reports in book form with the highly respected Ulrike Helmer Verlag, Frankfurt/M. • A volume of selected essays will be published with ZED Books, London, 2004, edited by G. Griffin. • The project findings will be used in one of the activities of the ATHENA II Network. The activity is coordinated by G. Griffin. • Paper on Development of Women’s Studies in Europe’, 7th Austrian Women Scholars’ Conference, Vienna, Nov 2003. • Poland: G. Griffin is applying (November 2003 submission) to host a Marie Curie Fellowship to replicate the project in Poland. • Switzerland: G. Griffin is advising a Swiss consortium of universities (Basel, Bern, Zurich, Lausanne) who have received national funding to replicate the project in Switzerland.

6. Acknowledgements and References

6.1 Acknowledgements

The project partners would like to thank first and foremost the EU DGXII (Research) for funding this project. This enabled them to carry out original empirical research which allowed the development of a better understanding of women's experiences in and of the employment market. This research is also vital for the well-being of the discipline of Women's Studies, and helped to create a greater understanding of the issues surrounding the implementation of equal opportunities. Importantly, the project made it possible for two groups of female researchers, a junior and a senior one, to network and develop each other's research knowledge as well as our shared understanding of both regional cultures and a sense of European identity.

The project partners would also like to thank their scientific officer at the Commission, Dr Angelos Agalianos, for his support and advice during the course of the project from which we all benefited.

Thirdly, the project partners would like to thank the following people who, at varying points in the project, provided expert input and support through participation in the workshops we organised:

Chris Zwaenepol, Director, RosaDocumentation Centre, Brussels

Nicole Dewandre, Director, 'Women and Science Unit', European Commission, DG XII, Research

Liz Chennels, Deputy Director, Women's Unit, Cabinet Office, UK

Helen Wallace, Director, European Institute, Florence

Dawn Lyon, Gender Studies Co-ordinator, Robert Schumann Centre for Advanced Studies, European Institute, Florence, Italy

Chiara Saraceno, Professor of Sociology, University of Turin, Italy

Ursula Apitzsch, Professor of Sociology, Johann Wolfgang Goethe University, Frankfurt/Main, Germany

Eva Magnusson, Associate Professor, Centre for Women's Studies, Umea University, Sweden

Elena Hoo, Cosenza Council Member, Work Policy, Cosenza, Italy.

Palma Covelli, Rende Council Member, Welfare Policy, Cosenza, Italy

Maria Rita Acciardi, Regional Equal Opportunity Commission President, Cosenza, Italy

Ana Ivanec, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

Morusa Gortnar, Office for Equal Opportunities, Slovenia

Marta Verginella, Professor of Modern History, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

Biljana Kasic, Director of the Zagreb Women Studies Centre, Zagreb, Croatia

Fourthly, the project partners would like to thank several institutions, universities and organisations which hosted the workshops and meetings we conducted:

RosaDocumentation Centre, Brussels

University of Oviedo, Spain

European Institute, Florence

Johann Wolfgang Goethe University, Frankfurt/Main, Germany
University of Calabria, Italy
University of Ljubljana, Slovenia
University of Hull, UK

Fifthly, the project partners would like to acknowledge the work of the researchers who contributed to the project and had significant responsibilities in carrying out the fieldwork and drafting the various reports based on the empirical data:

Borbála Juhász (Etvos Lorand University, Hungary)
Debbie Wigglesworth (University of Sunderland UK)
Jeannette van der Sanden (Utrecht University, the Netherlands)
Laura Viñuela Suárez (University of Oviedo, Spain)
Mariagrazia Leone (University of Calabria, Italy)
Marianne Schmidbaur (Johann Wolfgang Goethe University, Germany)
Muriel Andriocci (University of Toulouse-Le Mirail, France)
Salla Tuori (Abo Akademi University, Finland)
Simone Mazari (Johann Wolfgang Goethe University, Germany)
Sveva Magaraggia (University of Milan-Bicocca, Italy)
Zalka Drglin (Ljubljana University, Slovenia)

6.2 References

Bahovec, Eva, Drglin, Zalka, Strajn, Jelka Kernev, and Nina Vodopivec (2003) 'Qualitative Data Report: Slovenia', unpubl. ms.

Barazzetti, Donatella and Mariagrazia Leone (2003) *Comparative Data Report 2: The Institutionalisation of Women's Studies Training in Europe*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Barazzetti, Donatella, Leccardi, Carmen, Leone, Mariagrazia, and Sveva Mgaraggia (2003) 'Qualitative Data Report: Italy', unpubl. ms.

Bianchi, Camilla, Gerhard, Ute, Leccardi, Carmen, Magaraggia, Sveva and Marianne Schmidbaur (2003) *Comparative Data Report 4: The Relationship between Women's Studies Training and Women's Employment Expectations*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Bologna Declaration (1999):
<http://europa.eu.int/comm/education/socrates/ERASMUS/bologna.pdf>

Bose, C. and J. Priest-Jones (1980) *The Relationship between Women's Studies, Career Development and Vocational Choice*. Washington: National Institute of Education.

Bourdieu, Pierre (1979; 1984b) *Distinction. A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Trans. Richard Nice. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu, Pierre (1984a) *Homo Academicus*. Paris: Editions de Minuit.

Bourdieu, Pierre (1989) *La Noblesse d'État. Grandes écoles et esprit de corps*. Paris: Editions de Minuit.

Bourdieu, Pierre (1998) *La domination masculine*. Paris: Editions du Seuil.

Bourdieu, Pierre (2001) *Masculine Domination*. (1998) Trans. Richard Nice. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu, Pierre and Jean Claude Passeron (1977) *Reproduction in Education. Society and Culture*. London: Sage.

Bowles, Gloria and Renate Duelli Klein, eds. (1983) *Theories of Women's Studies*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Braidotti, Rosi, Delhez, Evelien, and Christine Rammrath (1998) *The Institutionalisation of Gender Studies / Women's Studies in Europe*. Berne: Swiss Science Council.

Britton, Dana (2000) 'The Epistemology of the Gendered Organization.' *Gender and Society* 14: 418-34.

Cameron, Deborah (2000) *Good to Talk? Living and Working in a Communication Culture*. London: Sage.

Suárez, Isabel Carrera and Laura Viñuela Suárez (2003) 'Qualitative Data Report: Spain', unpubl. ms.

Commission of the European Communities (2000). Final commission report on the implementation of the Socrates programme 1995-1999. Commission report, Brussels.

Crompton, Rosemary (1987) 'Gender, Status and Professionalism.' *Sociology* 21/3: 413-28.

Crompton, Rosemary (2000) 'The Gendered Restructuring of the Middle Classes: Employment and Caring.' In R. Crompton et al. (ed.) *Renewing Class Analysis*. Oxford: Blackwell, 165-83.

Davies, Celia (1996) 'The Sociology of Professions and the Sociology of Gender.' *Sociology* 30/4: 661-8.

Dever, Maryanne and Elizabeth Day (2001) 'Beyond the Campus: Some Initial Findings on Women's Studies, Careers, and Employers', *Journal of International Women's Studies* (May) 2/2: 53-66.

Dever, Maryanne, Cuthbert, Denise and Anna Dacre (1999) 'Women's Studies Graduates and the Labour Market: New Thoughts and New Questions', *Atlantis: A Women's Studies Journal* 23/2: 102-10.

Drglin, Zalka, Bahovec, Eva D., and Renata Šcribar (2003) *Comparative Data Report 5: Employment Outcomes Following Women's Studies Training*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

ERASMUS: <http://www.europa.eu.int/comm/education/ERASMUS/stat.html>

ETAN Expert Working Group on Women and Science (2002) *Science Policies in the European Union. Promoting Excellence through Mainstreaming Gender Equality*. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities.

European Commission (2000). Survey into the socio-economic background of ERASMUS students. Report published by the European Commission, Directorate General for Education and Culture.

EUROSTAT (2001) *Emploi et marché du travail dans les pays d'Europe centrale, Detailed tables*, N° 01/2002, Populations et conditions sociales, Luxembourg.

EUROSTAT (2002) *La vie des femmes et des hommes en Europe. Un portrait statistique, Données 1980–2000, Population et conditions sociales, Thème 3*. Luxembourg.

EUROSTAT (2003a) *Les femmes dans l'UE, 8 mars 2003: Journée internationale de la femme, Communiqué de presse du 27 mars 2003 - N° 27/2003*.

EUROSTAT (2003b) *Origines sociales, niveau d'instruction et conséquences sur le marché du travail, le passage de l'école à la vie professionnelle chez les jeunes Européens – Partie III », Statistiques en bref, Population et conditions sociales, Thème 3 – 6/2003*.

Griffin, Gabriele, ed. (2002a) *Women's Employment, Women's Studies and Equal Opportunities 1945-2001*. Hull: U of Hull.

Griffin, Gabriele (2002b) 'Was haben wir erreicht? Eine kritische Auseinandersetzung mit dem "Schicksal" von Women's Studies im Vereinigten Königreich', *Feministische Studien* 20/1: 70-86.

Griffin, Gabriele (2002c) 'Gender Studies in Europe: Current Directions', in Luisa Passerini, Dawn Lyon, and Liana Borghi, eds. *Gender Studies in Europe*. Florence: European University Institute, University of Florence, and ATHENA.

Griffin, Gabriele (2002d) 'Co-option or Transformation? Women's and Gender Studies Worldwide', in Heike Flessner and Lydia Potts, eds. *Societies in Transition – Challenges to Women's and Gender Studies*. Opladen: Leske and Budrich

Griffin, Gabriele (2003) 'Qualitative Data Report: The UK'. Unpubl. ms.

Griffin, Gabriele and Jalna Hanmer (2003) *Comparative Data Report 8: The Impact of Women's Studies Training on Women's Lifestyles and Everyday Life Practices*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Griffin, Gabriele, ed. (1994) *Changing Our Lives: Doing Women's Studies*. London: Pluto Press.

Hanmer, Jalna and Debbie Wigglesworth (2002) *Report on the Quantitative Data on Past and Present Women's Studies Students in Nine Countries*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Humm, Maggie (1989) *The Dictionary of Feminist Theory*. London: Harvester Wheatsheaf.

Jackson, Sue (2001) "'A hybrid in all sorts of ways": Teaching Women's Studies in the Academy', *Journal of International Women's Studies* (May) 2/2: 22-32.

Juhász, Borbála (2003) 'Qualitative Data Report: Hungary', unpubl. ms.

Juhász, Borbála, Peto, Andrea, van der Sanden, Jeannette, and Berteke Waaldijk (2003) *Comparative Data Report 7: The Relationship between Educational Migration and Women's Studies' Students Employment*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Le Feuvre, Nicky and Muriel Andriocci (2002a) 'France', in Griffin, ed. (2002a).

Le Feuvre, Nicky and Muriel Andriocci (2002b) 'Qualitative Data Report: France', unpubl. ms.

Le Feuvre, Nicky and Muriel Andriocci (2003) *Comparative Data Report 3: Employment Opportunities for Women in Europe Comparative Data Report*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Luebke, B.F. and M.E. Reilly (1995) *Women's Studies Graduates: The First Generation*. New York: Teacher College Press.

NOISE summer school: http://www.let.uu.nl/womens_studies/

OECD (2002a) *Education at a Glance*. OECD indicators 2002.

OECD (2002b) *Financing Education – Investments and Returns*. Paris: UNESCO Institute for Statistics.

Pirrie, Anne, and Valerie Wilson, Janet Powney, Sheila Hamilton (2002). *Gender Equality in SOCRATES: Final Report*. The Scottish Council for Research in Education, March 2002.

Reuben, E. and M. J. Boehm Strauss (1980) *Women's Studies Graduates*. Washington: National Institute of Education.

Schmidbaur, Marianne, Mazari, Simone, Gerhard, Ute and Ulla Wischermann (2003) 'Qualitative Data Report: Germany', unpubl. ms.

Schniedewind, Nancy (1993) 'Teaching Feminist Process Skills in the 1990s.' *Women's Studies Quarterly* 21 (3 and 4): 17-30.

Silius, Harriet (2002) *Summary Report: Background Data – Women's Employment, Equal Opportunities and Women's Studies in Nine European Countries*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Silius, Harriet and Salla Tuori (2003) *Comparative Data Report 6: The Professionalization of Women's Studies Graduates (including the Academic Profession) in Europe*. www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi.

Tuori, Salla (2003) 'Qualitative Data Report: Finland', unpubl. ms.

Tuori, Salla and Harriet Silius (2002) 'Finland', in Griffin, ed. (2002a).

van der Sanden, Jeannette (2003) 'Qualitative Data Report: The Netherlands', unpubl. ms.

van der Sanden, Jeannette and Berteke Waaldijk (2002) 'The Netherlands', in Griffin, ed. (2002a).

WINGS programme: <http://www.kun.nl/cvv/>

7. Annexes

7.1 Publications

Bahovec, Eva, Vodopivec, Nina and Tanja Salecl (2002) 'Slovenia' in G. Griffin, ed.

Barazzetti, Donatella, Leccardi, Carmen, Leone, Mariagrazia, and Sveva Mgaraggia (2002) 'Italy', in G. Griffin, ed.

Carrera Suarez, Isabel and Laura Vlnela Suarez (2002) 'Spain', in G. Griffin, ed.

Gazsi, Judit, Hars, Agnes, Juhasz, Borbala and Andrea Peto (2002) 'Hungary', in G. Griffin, ed.

Griffin, Gabriele, ed. (2002a) *Women's Employment, Women's Studies, and Equal Opportunities 1945-2001*. Hull: The University of Hull.

Griffin, Gabriele (2002b) 'Women's Employment, Equal Opportunities and Women's Studies in Europe', *The Making of European Women's Studies* vol. 4, ed. Rosi Braidotti et al, University of Utrecht, pp. 187-198.

Griffin, Gabriele (2003) 'Humboldt, Mickey Mouse, and Framework 6, or Where are the Women in all this?', *Kvinder, Knog Forskning*.

Griffin, Gabriele and Jalna Hamner (2002) 'The UK' in G. Griffin, ed.

Le Feuvre, Nicky (2002) Article on the project published in the *Bulletin de L'Association Nationale des Etudes Feministes*, Number 36, Automne-Hiver 2001-2002, pp. 58-9.

Le Feuvre, Nicky and Muriel Andriocci (2002a) 'France', in G. Griffin, ed.

Mazari, Simone, Gerhard, Ute, and Ulla Wischermann (2002) 'Germany', in G. Griffin, ed.

Silius, Harriet (2002a) 'Comparative Summary', in G. Griffin, ed.

Silius, Harriet (2002b) 'Autonomi ode integration i europeiste Kvinneovetenskap.' *Naistutkinnus-Kvinnoforskning*, Vol. 15, no. 2, pp. 48-57.

Tuori, Salla and Harriet Silius (2002) 'Finland', in G. Griffin, ed.

van der Sanden, Jeannette (March 2003) "EU Project Employment and Women's Studies", *Nieuwsbrief NGV*, pp. 6-7.

van der Sanden, Jeannette, with Berteke Waaldijk (2002) 'The Netherlands', in G. Griffin, ed.

7.2 Conference presentations

Bahovec, Eva (2002) Project presentation at the *2002 World Forum on Early Care and Education*, Auckland, New Zealand.

Gerhard, Ute (August 2003) 'Autonomy vs Integration', 5th Feminist Research Conference, Lund, Sweden.

Griffin, Gabriele (Feb 2002) Project presentation at the 'Chaire Etudes Femmes – Etudes de Genre' inaugural conference at the Ministère de l'Emploi et du Travail et de la Politique d'Égalité des Chances in Brussels, Belgium.

Griffin, Gabriele (Oct 2002) Project Presentation, AOIFE (Association of Institutions of Feminist Research and Education in Europe) meeting, Antwerp, Belgium.

Griffin, Gabriele (Nov 2002) 'Leaving the Doll's House: Gender Studies and Women's Employment', *Gender Studies and Employment*, International Conference, Bern, Switzerland.

Griffin, Gabriele (Nov 2002) 'Thinking Differently: Gender Studies in Europe', *Gender Makes a Difference – Gender Studies at the Cutting Edge of Europe*, International Conference, University of Copenhagen, Denmark.

Griffin, Gabriele (March 2003) 'Not just a pretty face – Women's Studies and Women's Employment in Cross-European Perspective', Public Forum on Women and Employment, Cosenza, Calabria, Italy.

Griffin, Gabriele (May 2003) 'Diasporic Subjects: Gender Research in the New Europe', Inaugural lecture, University of Hull, Hull, UK.

Griffin, Gabriele (July 2003) 'Crossing Boundaries: From Women's Studies Education to Employment – A Cross-European Perspective', Annual Women's Studies Network (UK) Association Conference, London, UK.

Griffin, Gabriele (July 2003) '(Other) Feminisms – Women's Studies in Europe/European Women's Studies', Australian Women's Studies Association Bi-annual Conference, Brisbane, Australia.

Griffin, Gabriele (August 2003) 'Women and Work: Policy for a New Century', Monash University, Melbourne, Australia.

Griffin, Gabriele (August 2003) 'Employment and Women's Studies: An Introduction', 5th Feminist Research Conference, Lund, Sweden.

Griffin, Gabriele (Sept 2003) 'When Sally met Sally or Chloe met Olivia: Living with Women's Studies', Swiss National Women's Studies PhD Summer School, Basel, Switzerland.

Magaraggia, Sveva (August 2003) 'Employment and Women's Studies – The Italian Case', 5th European Feminist Research Conference, Lund, Sweden.

Peto, Andrea (Feb 2003) European Council, Parliamentary Assembly, Committee on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men. Hearing on the Situation of women in the post communist countries of post communist transition.

Peto, Andrea (June 2002) Project presentation and leaflet distribution at 'Europas Töchter: Traditionen, Erwartungen, Strategien von Frauenbewegungen in Europa' 14-16 June 2002, Berlin, organised by the Evangelische Akademie zu Berlin.

Peto, Andrea (July 2002) "Gender Curricula for a Higher Education System in Central Asia" Workshop, 12-14 July, in Baku, Azerbaijan, organized by OSI. Talk on women's Studies institutionalisation in Europe, giving out leaflets.

Peto, Andrea (Oct 2002) Poster Session on research on women in Eastern Europe. AWID 9th International Forum on Women's Rights and Development: Reinventing Globalisation, Guadalajara, Mexico.

Peto, Andrea (Oct 2002) Report on the EWSI Project, AWID 9th International Forum on Women's Rights and Development: Reinventing Globalisation, Guadalajara, Mexico, giving out leaflets.

Schmidbaur, Marianne (Feb 2003) 'The Institutionalization of Women's Studies in the United Kingdom and in Germany – A Comparative Talk', University of Frankfurt.

Schmidbaur, Marianne (Feb 2003) 'Women's Studies and Employment in Europe: What Do Students of Women's Studies expect from their Course and How does Their Course Influence Their Employment?' Bettinagymnasium, Frankfurt.

Silius, Harriet (July 2002) 'Discourses on equal opportunities in different European countries: Looking for differences and similarities.' ISA Working Group for the Comparative Study of Legal Professions. La Baume-Lès-Aix, France.

Silius, Harriet (Sept 2002) 'Emploi, égalité, et études féministes dans neuf pays européens.' 3e Colloque international des Recherches féministes Francophones. Université de Toulouse-LeMirail.

Silius, Harriet (August 2003) 'The Institutionalization of Women's Studies in Europe', 5th European Feminist Research Conference, Lund, Sweden.

Tuori, Salla (Oct 2002) 'Women's Employment and Women's Studies Training', Abo Akademi University, Finland.

Tuori, Salla (Nov 2002) 'Seeking the feminist? Women's Studies and Employment – Students' Perspectives', Annual Conference of Women's Studies, Turku, Finland.

van der Sanden, Jeannette and Berteke Waaldijk (2002) Presentation of project to members of the Gender Studies Centre of the University of Tirana, Albania, and the SOROS Foundation visiting Women's Studies at Utrecht University.

van der Sanden, Jeannette (August 2003) 'Employment and Women's Studies – The Dutch Case', 5th European Feminist Research Conference, Lund, Sweden.

7.3 Other forms of output

Project website: www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi

Replication of project: A consortium of Swiss universities (Basle, Zurich, Bern) have decided to replicate the project at national level. The co-ordinator has already given a first conference presentation on the topic at the University of Bern, and a two-day meeting was held in November 2002 where further presentations about the EU-funded project were given by two project partners, and the operationalization of the project at Swiss level was discussed. The Swiss project had funding approved by the Swiss Science Foundation.

In March 2002 project partners conducted a roundtable at the European Institute in Florence on the project in relation to education and migration.

The background data reports from the project were published in book form and, as the 18-month progress report indicates (see project website www.hull.ac.uk/ewsi) were widely disseminated in all partner countries and beyond to ministries, policy makers, interested academics, etc.

7.4 Agreed Deliverables (DL)

DL No	Deliverable title	Delivery date	Nature	Dissemination level	Status
1	Workplan	2	R	PU	Completed
2	Workshop: Women's employment in Europe	4	W	PU	Completed
3	Empirical data (qualitative; quantitative) on impact of Women's Studies training on women's employment	12	R	PU	Completed
4	Progress report including reflective analysis of research process	12	R	PU	Completed
5	Workshop: Developing paradigms for European scientific research on women.	17	W	PU	Completed
6	Report of comparative analyses of background and empirical data	18	R	PU	Completed
7	Workshop: Impact of Women's Studies training on women's employment	19	W	PU	Completed
8	Final report	24	R	PU	Completed